

# Dune Messiah



## INTRODUCTION

### BRIEF BIOGRAPHY OF FRANK HERBERT

Frank Herbert was born in rural Washington and spent his youth exploring the Olympic peninsula. Apart from being an avid reader, Herbert showed an early interest in photography, and he invested in modern cameras throughout his teenage years. Herbert's parents experienced poverty after the Great Depression and sent Herbert to live with an aunt and uncle in Salem, Oregon when he was 18. After graduating from Salem High School, Herbert worked for various newspapers, lying about his age to get hired. He served the Navy briefly as a photographer until a head injury caused him to be discharged. During this time, Herbert married and had a daughter, Penelope. After he and his first wife divorced, Herbert attended the University of Washington where he took creative writing classes and met Beverly Ann Stuart. Herbert and Stuart married in 1946 and moved to Santa Rosa, California where they had two sons, Brian Patrick and Bruce Calvin. In 1952, Herbert's first science fiction story, "Looking for Something," was published in the magazine *Startling Stories*. He published several subsequent stories after this and began working on the *Dune* series in 1959. After being published in two parts by a magazine and then being rejected by over 20 book publishers, *Dune* was finally published in 1965, and *Dune Messiah* in 1969. The *Dune* series was slow to bring Herbert success, and it was not until 1972 that he was able to retire from writing for newspapers and finish the *Dune* series, as well as several other works of science fiction. In 1974, Beverly was diagnosed with cancer; she died in 1984. 1984 also saw the release of the highly anticipated *Dune* movie, directed by David Lynch, was released, though the film yielded disappointingly poor reviews. In 1985, Herbert married again, but he soon underwent surgery for pancreatic cancer in 1986. While in recovery, he died suddenly of a pulmonary embolism, leaving the seventh and final installment of his *Dune* series unfinished.

### HISTORICAL CONTEXT

Frank Herbert's *Dune* series was heavily influenced by his experience of the World Wars and the Great Depression. While *Dune* explores the nature of intergalactic warfare, *Dune Messiah* deals with the aftermath of war when poverty and failing leadership, among other things, afflict society. *Dune Messiah* also deals heavily with the relationship between religion and politics and was influenced by the contributions that thinkers like Sigmund Freud and Carl Jung made to the field of psychology. Herbert was also influenced by the technological advancements and drug culture of the 1960s,

exploring themes of mind-altering substances and superhuman inventions. Finally, *Dune Messiah* also shows a sensitivity to climate change and pollution, in particular the theme of increasing water shortage and the exploitation of natural resources; though concern for humanity's impact on the environment had existed for centuries, public awareness of climate change became increasingly widespread with the foundation of "green" political movements and organizations in the 1960s.

### RELATED LITERARY WORKS

Apart from the *Dune* series, Frank Herbert wrote several other works of science fiction, such as *The Godmakers*, *The Dosadi Experiment* and *The White Plague*. Before beginning to write the *Dune* series, Herbert read extensively of author science fiction authors whose work majorly influenced his own. These authors include H.G. Wells, who is best known for his sci-fi novels *The Time Machine* and *The War of the Worlds*, and Robert A. Heinlein, whose notable works include *Stranger in a Strange Land* and *Starship Troopers*. Together with Heinlein, Isaac Asimov and Arthur C. Clarke are often considered "The Big Three" in science fiction. Asimov is famous for the *Foundation* series, the *Galactic Empire* series, and the *Robot* series, while Clarke is known for his groundbreaking novel *Against the Fall of Night*. All these authors, along with Frank Herbert, addressed political and social themes in their works and had an eye toward the future of warfare and technology. Some contemporary works with similar themes include *Jaran* by Kate Elliot and *The Fifth Season* by N.K. Jemisin.

### KEY FACTS

- **Full Title:** Dune Messiah
- **When Written:** 1960s
- **Where Written:** Hawaii and Washington's Olympic Peninsula
- **When Published:** October 1969
- **Literary Period:** Contemporary
- **Genre:** Science Fiction
- **Setting:** Arrakis, or Dune—a fictional planet in a fictional universe
- **Climax:** Hayt nearly kills Paul but turns into Duncan Idaho.
- **Antagonist:** The Guild
- **Point of View:** Third Person

### EXTRA CREDIT

**Unfinished Education.** Although Frank Herbert attended the

University of Washington, he never graduated or received a degree. His motivation for his education was centered around studying what interested him rather than in completing the requirements for a degree.

**Unwanted Fans.** At the height of the *Dune* series's success, the heavy metal band Iron Maiden propositioned Frank Herbert to name one of their songs after *Dune*. Showing surprising disinterest in additional fame, Herbert expressed his distaste for heavy metal and requested that Iron Maiden name their song something else.



## PLOT SUMMARY

*Dune Messiah* opens on planet Wallach IX where the Guild—comprised of Edric, Scytale, Princess Irulan and the Reverend Mother Gaius Helen Mohiam—discusses their plans to dethrone Paul and put the Bene Gesserit in power. As the Bene Gesserit's former kwisatz haderach, Paul deeply offended the Bene Gesserit by refusing to bear an heir with Princess Irulan, his political wife, and instead attempting to have children with his Fremen lover, Chani. The Guild establishes that Princess Irulan slips Chani birth control. They make a plan to send a Tleilaxu ghola of Paul's former sword master, Duncan Idaho—to poison Paul's psyche and make Paul's sister Alia attracted to him. The Guild conceals these plans from Paul's prescience through Edric's prescience.

The story moves to Paul and Chani's room on the planet Dune. Paul struggles with a feeling of regret for subjecting Chani to a fate that only he can see coming with his prescience.

Meanwhile, Scytale goes to the desert on Dune, kills a man named Farok, assumes his appearance, and kidnaps Otheim's daughter, a girl who'd been in Farok's care.

Back in Paul's city, Paul leads a meeting in which Princess Irulan begs to be allowed to mother the Muad'Dib's heir. Chani sides with Irulan, pointing out the civil strife that would result from Paul leaving behind no heir. Paul refuses on the grounds that Irulan is too connected to his Bene Gesserit enemies. He wishes that he and Chani could escape to Sietch Tabr, but he knows his name would be left behind to rule in his place.

A few days later, Alia watches through a keyhole as the Guild arrives on Dune, bringing Hayt, the ghola of Duncan Idaho, as a gift. When Paul asks Hayt what his purpose is, Hayt responds that he was sent to destroy Paul. Despite this information, Paul welcomes the Guild to Dune and accepts the ghola, unable to resist its resemblance to Duncan Idaho. Alia feels attracted to Hayt. Meanwhile, the Reverend Mother Gaius Helen Mohiam is imprisoned (Reverend Mothers are banned from Dune). Princess Irulan visits her jail cell, and the Reverend Mother urges Princess Irulan to kill Chani.

A few days later, Alia takes a bath and then practices sword-

fighting naked. She is interrupted by Paul and Stilgar, who are upset at what she's doing. They all have the uncomfortable thought that the Guild may be trying to occasion Paul and Alia to mate. Later, Paul and Edric have a conversation in which Edric accuses the Qizarate of insincerity. After Edric leaves, Paul disagrees with Stilgar and says that his jihad has not brought believers into the light, but rather has resulted in the deaths of 61 billion people.

Alia and Hayt go to the desert to examine a dead body. Alia questions Hayt about his identity. They flirt, and when they get back to the city, Hayt kisses Alia. Alia suspects there is no missing woman and that the body has something to do with a Face Dancer. Later, Paul takes an extra dose of melange and watches the image of the moon falling inside his mind. Despite his power, Paul feels powerless and sees a future without Chani. Hayt appears, and Paul wonders if he is Hayt or Duncan Idaho.

Later, the Reverend Mother Gaius Helen Mohiam sits for trial. Paul, suspecting that the Guild has designs against Chani, offers the Bene Gesserit his sperm if they will spare Chani's life. Appalled at the idea of artificial breeding, the Reverend Mother refuses. Meanwhile, Scytale tells Edric (whom he despises) to make Hayt destroy Paul faster. Chani is furious when she finds out that Princess Irulan was slipping her birth control, but Paul urges her to forgive Irulan. Chani is upset that Paul duels with Hayt, whom Chani doesn't trust. When Paul questions Hayt about his identity, Chani realizes that Hayt is more man than ghola. Chani soon becomes pregnant, and the fetus grows alarmingly fast.

Otheim's daughter Lichna (Scytale in disguise) visits Paul to tell him that Otheim demands Paul visit him on Sietch. Paul can't find an excuse to not to go. He puts on his stillsuit and goes to Alia's temple. There, he watches Alia preside over a throng of reverent pilgrims and gets swept up in the mystery and ardor himself. He meets up secretly with his guide, and they depart for sietch. In Otheim's house, Otheim says that his neighbors are plotting against Paul. He gives Paul Bijaz, a Tleilaxu dwarf who knows the names of Paul's enemies. As Paul is leaving with Bijaz, a stone burner explodes, burning Otheim's house and blinding Paul's **eyes**.

Despite having lost his eyes, Paul can still see with his prescience. However, many Fremen think that Paul should abandon himself in the desert, as per their rule for blind people. Back in the city, Paul extracts the names of his enemies from Bijaz and puts Korba on trial. Paul charges Korba with aiding enemies in smuggling melange to another planet and in detonating the stone burner. During the trial, Alia makes note of the people in the crowd who were clearly Korba's accomplices. Meanwhile, Hayt visits Bijaz. Speaking in riddles, Bijaz says that when Chani dies, Hayt will become Duncan Idaho. Bijaz implants Hayt with the order to kill Paul when Paul comes to Hayt in grief. Afterward, Hayt goes to Alia and tells

her of the Guild's plot to mate her and Paul. Hayt then calls medics because Alia has overdosed on melange.

Chani and Paul go to Sietch Tabr. While she is looking out at the desert, Chani goes into labor and is escorted inside. Meanwhile, Paul stands looking out at the desert thinking about how no man can ever rule the universe. Hayt comes up to Paul, and soon after, Paul hears someone scream his name. Paul announces that Chani is dead. Hayt turns to Paul, gripping his knife, but Paul addresses him as Duncan Idaho, and Hayt's Tleilaxu nature fades away. Suddenly physically and presciently blind, Paul goes to Chani's body and learns that she gave birth to twins—a boy and a girl—something which Paul had not foreseen. Scytale enters, disguised as Lichna, and offers to revive Chani as a gholia in exchange for control of Paul's empire. Suddenly able to see through his son Leto's eyes, Paul kills Scytale. Hayt leads Paul back to his room, where Bijaz again propositions Paul with Chani's revival. Knowing that the Tleilaxu will condition Chani's gholia to kill the twins, Paul refuses the tempting offer and orders Hayt to kill Bijaz.

Hayt looks out into the desert and grieves Paul, who has just run into the desert to die. Alia joins Hayt, having just executed all of Paul's traitors, except Princess Irulan. Hayt comforts Alia over Paul's suicide, saying that Paul's act allowed him to escape rule while also obtaining the eternal trust and reverence of the Fremen. Alia and Hat confess their love for each other and go back inside.

sword master—arrives on Dune, Paul knows that he was sent by the Tleilaxu to destroy Paul, but he allows Hayt to stay because Hayt reminds Paul of a past he longs for. Ultimately, Paul is cornered by the Guild's conspiracy against him. However, the unforeseen birth of Paul and Chani's son Leto and Paul's resistance against Scytale's tempting offer to revive Chani as a gholia protect Paul's legacy. At the end of *Dune Messiah*, Paul walks into the desert, fulfilling a Fremen rule that the blind (Paul was blinded by a stone burner laid by his enemies) must submit themselves to death in the desert. In this way, he solidifies the Fremen's eternal reverence for him.

**Hayt (Duncan Idaho)** – Hayt is the revived flesh—or gholia—of Paul Atreides's former sword master, Duncan Idaho. Hayt is sent to Paul by the Tleilaxu who, in conspiracy with the Guild, revived the gholia in order to destroy Paul. In every respect, Hayt looks just like Duncan Idaho, except for his mechanical **eyes**. His resemblance to Idaho tempts Paul with memories of his past, and so he accepts the gholia even though he suspects the gholia is a pawn conditioned by his enemies. As Paul struggles to decide whether the gholia is Hayt or Duncan Idaho, Hayt himself struggles with his identity, at times being flooded with memories of the past, and at times acting under Tleilaxu orders programmed into his brain. For instance, Bijaz imbeds Hayt with the order to kill Paul as soon as Chani dies. However, when this moment comes, Paul jolts Hayt's memories of his former self, and Hayt transforms fully into Duncan Idaho, protecting Paul and obeying his every command. After Paul runs into the desert to die, Duncan Idaho and Alia begin a relationship with the implication that they will continue the empire.

**Chani** – Chani is Paul Atreides's long-term Fremen lover. She experiences many failed attempts to become pregnant due to the contraceptives that Princess Irulan is feeding her on the Guild's orders. Desperate for Paul to have an heir, Chani even tries to persuade him to father a child with Irulan. When Chani discovers and stops the cause of her infertility, she becomes pregnant. However, lasting damage from the contraceptives complicate her pregnancy and cause the fetus to grow alarmingly fast. Eventually, Chani dies giving birth to Paul's twins. Throughout *Dune Messiah*, Paul feels guilt in Chani's presence because he foresees her death but can't do anything to prevent it.

**Alia Atreides** – Alia Atreides is Paul's Atreides's teenage sister. She is feisty, precocious, and highly sexually awakened for her age. Lady Jessica had been pregnant with Alia when she became a Reverend Mother. As a result, Alia was born with the power to understand her mother's psychological state and wisdom. However, she is not equipped with the power to see the future, as Paul is. Throughout *Dune Messiah*, Dune's pilgrims worship Alia, considering her to be a goddess. She resents their reverence for her, though, and often longs for a normal life. While the Guild conspiracy considers arranging for



## CHARACTERS

### MAJOR CHARACTERS

**Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib)** – Paul Atreides is the Emperor, or Muad'Dib, of Arrakis and most of the Dune universe. In *Dune Messiah's* prequel, *Dune*, Paul spearheaded a jihad against an oppressive army. After defeating this army, Paul's followers—mostly comprised of Fremen—continued the Jihad, viewing Paul as a godhead and threatening other groups in the universe to follow his lead. As a result, in *Dune Messiah*, Paul is riddled with guilt and regret. He feels that working so many into a religious frenzy and causing the deaths of his many dissenters has caused his power and influence over the universe to turn sour. Furthermore, he struggles against a feeling of acute powerlessness. He sees the future with his prescience, a power which seems to carry with it absolute command over the universe but instead only shows Paul how time subjects Paul himself to fate—Paul struggles to live in the present when he knows what his future holds. He tries to be excited about Chani's pregnancy and the prospect of their retirement to Sietch Tabr, but all he can see is the incontrovertible truth that Chani will die in the near future. All in all, Paul wishes that he could relinquish his position of power and be a normal person. When Hayt—the gholia of Paul's former

Paul and Alia to mate so that they can create the Bene Gesserit heir that they want, Alia finds herself attracted to the conspiracy's ghola, Hayt. At the end of *Dune Messiah*, after Hayt becomes Duncan Idaho and Paul has run into the desert to die, the novel implies that Alia and Duncan Idaho begin a relationship.

**Scytale** – Scytale is a Tleilaxu Face Dancer and a member of the Guild conspiracy. To trick Paul Atreides into going to Sietch Tabr to retrieve Bijaz, Scytale disguises himself as Lichna. After Chani dies leaving Paul a daughter and son, Scytale tries to bargain with Paul, offering to revive Chani as a ghola in exchange for control of Paul's empire. During this negotiation, Paul kills Scytale after acquiring sudden access to his newborn son's vision.

**Princess Irulan** – Princess Irulan is the daughter of a Bene Gesserit emperor whom Paul Atreides killed in the Jihad. Paul marries Irulan to graft political peace but refuses to father an heir with her. In conspiracy with the Guild, Irulan feeds Chani contraceptives and tries to beguile Paul into having a baby with her. When the members of the conspiracy are executed, Alia Atreides spares Irulan.

**Edric** – Edric is the leader of the Guild conspiracy. His prescient powers make him essential to the conspiracy because they prevent Paul Atreides's prescient powers from accessing their activities. He is often described as repulsive, having the body of a reptile and living in a tank of orange fluid that keeps him constantly drugged with melange.

**Bijaz** – Bijaz is a Tleilaxu dwarf who speaks in cryptic riddles. Otheim gives Bijaz to Paul Atreides so that Paul can extract from Bijaz the names of his enemies. However, Bijaz ends up implanting Hayt with the order to kill Paul when Paul is in the throes of grief. Ultimately, Hayt kills Bijaz on Paul's orders.

**Gaius Helen Mohiam** – Gaius Helen Mohiam is a Bene Gesserit Reverend Mother and one of the leaders of the Guild conspiracy. Having once approved Paul Atreides as the kwisatz haderach, Gaius Helen Mohiam disapproves of the Fremen Jihad unleashed in Paul's name. She strives to prevent Paul from fathering an heir with Chani and seeks to force him to impregnate Princess Irulan instead, thereby putting a Bene Gesserit on the throne. In *Dune Messiah*, Gaius Helen Mohiam is executed along with the other Guild conspirators.

## MINOR CHARACTERS

**Korba** – Korba is the leader of Dune's group of religious civil servants, the Qizarate. Halfway through *Dune Messiah*, Korba is caught engaging in the conspiracy against the Paul Atreides and is eventually executed.

**Stilgar** – Stilgar is a Fremen from Sietch Tabr and a close friend and advisor to Paul Atreides.

**Leto** – Leto is Paul Atreides and Chani's son, named after Paul's

father.

**Farok** – Farok is a veteran of the Jihad. In *Dune Messiah*, Scytale kills Farok just before he assumes Lichna's identity.

**Otheim** – Otheim is a former Fremen warrior and the father of Lichna. In *Dune Messiah*, he warns Paul Atreides of the conspiracy against the Muad'Dib and gives him Bijaz.

**Lichna** – Lichna is Otheim's daughter. Scytale kills her, dumps her body in the desert, and then assumes her appearance to trick Paul Atreides.

**Bannerjee** – Bannerjee is Paul Atreides's head security guard.

**Lady Jessica** – Lady Jessica is a Bene Gesserit Reverend Mother and the mother of Alia and Paul Atreides.

**Harah** – Harah is Stilgar's wife.

**Dhuri** – Dhuri is Otheim's wife.

## TERMS

**The Bene Gesserit** – The Bene Gesserit are a major political organization in the Dune universe. In *Dune Messiah*, **The Reverend Mother Helen Gaius Mohiam** of the Bene Gesserit conspires with the Tleilaxu to make a Bene Gesserit ruler of the universe.

**CHOAM** – CHOAM is an organization responsible for all commerce and economic affairs in the Dune universe.

**Face Dancer** – A Face Dancer is a Tleilaxu who can change their appearance and disguise themselves as other people.

**Fremen** – The Fremen are the native people of Arrakis, or Dune. In *Dune Messiah* under the rule of **Paul Atreides**, the Fremen mostly inhabit Sietch Tabr.

**Ghola** – a *ghola* is the revived flesh of a deceased human being.

**The Guild** – The Guild is the conspiratorial alliance between the Bene Gesserit and the Tleilaxu against **Paul Atreides**.

**Jihad** – The Jihad was a war that took place prior to *Dune Messiah*, fought between the Fremen (led by **Paul Atreides**) and their oppressors. After the Fremen won the war, they continued a religious Jihad, using violence to subdue the universe under the Muad'Dib's rule.

**Kwisatz Haderach** – A *kwisatz haderach* is a "chosen one" bred by the Bene Gesserit. They have the power to see the future.

**Melange** – Melange, or spice, is an addictive drug that gives the user longer life and, occasionally, the power to see the future.

**Mentat** – A *mentat* is someone trained to think logically and computationally.

**The Qizarate** – The Qizarate are a group of religious civil servants of the Muad'Dib, **Paul Atreides**.

**Reverend Mother** – Reverend Mothers are female members of the Bene Gesserit who have completed advanced Bene

Gesserit training.

**Semuta** – Semuta is an addictive drug. Its effects can also be induced by semuta music.

**Sietch Tabr** – Sietch Tabr, often just called Sietch, is the name of the open desert on Arrakis natively inhabited by the Fremen.

**Stillsuit** – A stillsuit is worn in the open desert to retain the body's moisture.

**Tleilaxu** – The Tleilaxu are a major society in the Dune universe. In *Dune Messiah*, they are responsible for reviving Duncan Idaho as the ghola **Hayt** and conspiring with the Bene Gesserit against **Paul Atreides**.



## THEMES

In LitCharts literature guides, each theme gets its own color-coded icon. These icons make it easy to track where the themes occur most prominently throughout the work. If you don't have a color printer, you can still use the icons to track themes in black and white.



### POWER

While *Dune* tells the story of one man's rise to power, *Dune Messiah* portrays the nature of his power once he has attained it. Author Frank

Herbert intended *Dune Messiah* to be an inversion of the science fiction novel's typical subject matter: the hero's rise to power. Instead, *Dune Messiah* deals with a hero's downfall and the failures of power. *Dune*'s hero, Paul Atreides, enters the scene as *Dune Messiah*'s protagonist—the ruler, or Muad'Dib, of most of the universe and the godhead of a powerful religious jihad. Despite his supreme position of power, Paul struggles with a deep feeling of powerlessness. He feels that no matter how much power he gains, the universe still exceeds and contains him. Paul is also endowed with the power of prescience (the ability to see the future), a power which also comes with its own powerlessness. Although he can see what the future holds and therefore prepare for it, he is still “caught in time's web.” In other words, although Paul has the power to see the future, he cannot control it, nor can he alter the course of fate. It is the paradoxical nature of Paul's power of prescience that reveals the paradox of absolute power: although Paul has powerful forces under his control, he is still subject to the universe and the future. *Dune Messiah* explores Paul's powerlessness in relation to his position as the most powerful man in the universe to suggest that it is impossible for a person to hold total power.



### RELIGION

Frank Herbert's *Dune Messiah* explores the dangers of religion, especially when mixed with forces of

government. In *Dune Messiah*'s prequel, *Dune*, the Fremen people of Arrakis choose Emperor Paul Atreides as their messiah, and Paul starts a religious jihad. When *Dune Messiah* picks up 12 years later, the powerful jihad continues to reign supreme. Paul struggles to steer humanity toward safety while also maintaining his role as messiah for the Fremen people. Not only does this dual responsibility weigh on Paul, but the religious Jihad has become corrupt: it has conquered most of the universe, killing billions of people and leading thousands of religious pilgrims to flock to the streets of Dune. These pilgrims are fanatical to an extreme degree, supplicating themselves before Paul and his sister Alia as gods, much to the siblings' irritation. Paul often wishes that he could escape the jihad through retreating to the desert or even death, but he knows that his name will outlive him and continue to fuel the corrupt jihad. Eventually, Paul discovers that the head of Arrakis' religious group, the Qizarate, has been conspiring to overthrow him. This discovery reveals the disingenuousness and corruption of the group's fanatical religiosity and brings Paul's mounting frustration with the jihad to a climax. Ultimately, Paul ends his life and his rule by walking into the desert, fulfilling a Fremen requirement of all blind citizens. Consequently, Paul act allows him to evade deification by the jihadists while also ensuring their lasting respect and induction of his children as heirs to his empire. Thus, the novel ends with the message that religion, when practiced to a fanatic degree, is a threat to government. As such, *Dune Messiah* makes the claim that governments operate most smoothly when humans trust humanity above religious authority.



### GUILT AND LONGING

Guilt and longing are prevalent emotions throughout Frank Herbert's *Dune Messiah*. The novel's protagonist, Paul Atreides, has held a position of power in the universe for 12 years, and he's begun to feel power's effect on his personal life. He and his lover, Chani, often talk about leaving the city of Arrakis for the desert where Chani grew up and spending the rest of their lives in peace and simplicity. However, not only does Paul feel that he can't escape the position of messiah into which the Fremen have placed him, but he can see with his oracular vision that his and Chani's life together will not end happily, for Chani is fated to die in childbirth. Because he can see the future, Paul does not prevent Princess Irulan, his wife, from feeding Chani contraceptives on the orders of the Bene Gesserit (a group that conspires against Paul to thwart his and Chani's legacy). Paul feels guilty about enabling Chani's infertility, and later, when she does become pregnant, he feels guilty about subjecting her to a death that he can see coming. Connected to his longing for a different fate, Paul also feels a longing for the past. He can't resist accepting the Bene Gesserit's gift of Hayt—the revived ghola of his former master and friend, Duncan Idaho. Although

Paul knows that his enemies created Hayt to destroy him, he is drawn to Hayt as a reminder of his past. The preponderance of guilt and longing in Paul's existence suggests that these sentiments are essential to the human experience, even to the experience of those who are highly successful and influential. Ultimately, however, the novel also shows that guilt and longing are destructive to human life, as they can lead a person to feel anguish over events that they cannot control. In this way, *Dune Messiah* illustrates the human tendency to plague oneself with futile sentiments.



## FATE AND CHOICE

*Dune Messiah* explores the nature of fate and the power to see the future. Not only is the world of *Dune Messiah* subject to fate, but its

protagonist—the Emperor of the fictional planet Dune, Paul Atreides—is gifted with the power of prescience, or the power to see the future. From the outset, this power is not a positive thing. In fact, as an omniscient narrator claims at the outset of the novel, “completely accurate and total prediction is lethal.” This foreshadows that, while prescience allows Paul to see and prepare for his future, this power will ultimately lead to his downfall. Indeed, power to see the fated future causes Paul anguish because it prevents his free choice. Paul confronts the prospect of a future that he is powerless to prevent, having glimpsed early on that his lover Chani is going to die in childbirth and that he will fall from power. He runs from his visions and often wishes that he could live without knowledge of the future. When an exploding stone burner physically blinds Paul's **eyes**, his prescience is the only thing that allows him to see. He is able to live and act with a different kind of sight, fulfilling each moment as it appears to him in his oracular visions. From then on, Paul feels like a prisoner of fate, living out his doomed future with no capacity for choice. However, this new blindness also causes Paul to accept the fact that he has no choice other than to willingly submit to his fate. When he relinquishes control over his future, Paul actually experiences unforeseen events; he had not foreseen that Chani was pregnant with twins—only that she would give birth to a daughter—so the birth of his son and heir to his throne comes as a pleasant surprise. *Dune Messiah*, in illustrating Paul's relationship to fate, shows how a person can experience a kind of choice and peace only once they choose to embrace their fate.



## SYMBOLS

Symbols appear in **teal text** throughout the Summary and Analysis sections of this LitChart.



## MELANGE

Throughout *Dune Messiah*, melange symbolizes power and its negative consequences. As an addictive drug from which withdrawing is fatal, melange is Paul's primary tool for power. Melange subjugates the universe to Paul because everyone depends on him to provide them with the life-giving drug. However, Paul's dependence on melange for power also makes his power incomplete. Throughout the novel, he is often struck by a feeling that the more power he gains, the more the universe eludes him; he decides that it is impossible for one man to hold power over the entire universe. Melange and the unnatural state of power it creates represents this idea.

Melange also symbolizes the negative consequences of having power. Paul and Alia both suffer from melange addiction themselves. While melange heightens their powers of prescience, both of them resent their ability to see the future, and they spend much of their time wishing they did not possess such a power. Moreover, Paul's prescience forces him to witness the negative effects of melange on his loved ones. His lover Chani even takes melange while pregnant with her and Paul's child, an action which causes her fetus to grow alarmingly quickly and further endangers Chani's life. In this way, melange symbolizes the guilt and the futile longing for a normal life that accompany a state of power.



## EYES

Throughout *Dune Messiah*, eyes symbolize a person's trustworthiness and humanity. When Hayt comes to Dune, his mechanical eyes trouble Paul. In every other way, Hayt is the reincarnation of Paul's trusted master, Duncan Idaho, but Hayt's mechanical eyes—fashioned by the Tleilaxu who revived Duncan Idaho's flesh—suggest the painful possibility that the gholia is nothing but his enemy's pawn, conditioned to destroy Paul. In this way, Hayt's lack of human eyes indicate the threat he poses.

Paul's own eyes at first seem like an irrelevant vestige of his human nature. While Paul can see the world around him through his human eyes, the “eyes” of his prescience show him everything that will occur before it physically occurs. However, despite the seeming irrelevance of his eyes, Paul often wishes he could turn off his prescience and see the world only through his human eyes. In other words, he wishes he could trade his vision of fate for the comparatively blind vision of human sight. Therefore, while eyes symbolize power when endowed with the ability to see the future, they also—in their normal seeing condition—indicate the limits of human nature.

In this way, then, eyes also represent how human “blindness”—that is, blindness to fate—is preferable to a gift of superhuman sight. When a stone burner later blinds Paul, Paul

resorts to seeing only through his prescience—a state which makes him feel like a mere instrument of the future. This state of blindness leads Paul to end his own life in the desert. Therefore eyes as a symbol point to the flawed nature of power: while Paul can live without their eyes in a state of superhuman power, his attachment to his human limits as represented by his eyes prevents him from ever embracing a complete state of power.



## QUOTES

Note: all page numbers for the quotes below refer to the Ace edition of *Dune Messiah* published in 2019.

### Chapter 1 Quotes

☞ This moment of supreme power contained failure. There can be only one answer, that completely accurate and total prediction can be lethal.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib)

**Related Themes:**

**Related Symbols:**

**Page Number:** 9

#### Explanation and Analysis

This quote appears in the introductory chapter to *Dune Messiah* that gives an overview of Paul Atreides's rule. The quote begins by portraying power as paradoxical. It positions "power" and "failure" as opposites and suggests not only that they emerge together, but also that they occasion each other. Paul's failure arose in his "moment of supreme power"—the point at which his power was greatest. This suggests that the greater, or more "supreme" a person's power is, the more susceptible they are to failure. The quote also states that Paul's power "contained" failure, which suggests that power cannot exist without the possibility of failure. In this way, this quote illustrates how there is no such thing as perfect power, because perfect power invokes failure.

The second part of this quote illustrates the power of prescience as paradoxical. While the power of prescience (the ability to predict the future) is considered an asset in *Dune*, this quote highlights that it is the accuracy or the totality of such a power that ironically makes it a threat. In other words, the powerfulness of prediction itself diminishes prediction's power. Furthermore, this quote points out that prediction is lethal when it is — "total" and

"accurate"—in other words, the more accurately a person is able to predict the future, the more threatened their life becomes. In this way, the power of prescience backfires on the person who possesses it. In drawing a comparison between power and prescience as two paradoxical things, this quote illustrates how total power is impossible.

### Chapter 3 Quotes

☞ Dune was a world of paradox now—a world under siege, yet the center of power. To come under siege, he decided, was the inevitable fate of power.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib)

**Related Themes:**

**Page Number:** 32

#### Explanation and Analysis

This quote occurs in the Emperor's chambers when Paul is meditating on his city and his power. Paul decides that Dune is a "a paradox"—a center point of opposite or contradicting truths. At the same time, Dune is both "the center of power" and "a world under siege"—a place that is both invincible (because it is the most powerful) but also the most vulnerable. Paul goes on to assert that being attacked is the "inevitable fate" of power, suggesting that power always comes with its own undermining force.

In general, this quote paints a picture of Dune as a universe that operates in counterweights: power always exists with vulnerability. In this way, no state in the *Dune* universe is capable of being absolute or eternal. If power prevails, demise will always be its "fate"—meaning that power cannot last forever. Likewise, if a place is in the center of power, it is simultaneously under siege, meaning that power can never be total, perfect, or exclusive of all other forces. Ultimately, this quote suggests that neither places nor power can have complete sway over the universe because the universe operates by laws of paradox and counterweighted fate preclude totality.

☞ I'll yield up myself, he thought. I'll rush out while I yet have the strength, fly through space like a bird might not find. It was a useless thought, and he knew it. The Jihad would follow his ghost.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib) (speaker)

**Related Themes:**   

**Page Number:** 46

### Explanation and Analysis

This quote appears during one of Paul’s meditations about abandoning his position of power. Paul says that he wants to “yield himself up,” suggesting that he wants to walk away from his position as ruler and let someone else—perhaps his enemies—take his place. However, when Paul later decides that this is a useless thought because the Jihad will “follow his ghost,” it seems in retrospect that by “yield myself up,” he meant that he wanted to willingly die so as to be free of the burden of ruling. Shockingly, however, even dying will not free Paul of his problems. The Jihad—the religious movement that follows Paul’s rule—would even honor Paul’s ghost because the Jihad views him as a kind of god rather than a human being. In this way, this quote points out how death is not a possible escape for a ruler who is also a religious icon.

This quote expresses the extent of Paul’s desperation. He would happily consent to becoming a “ghost”—to dying—if he knew it would free him from his followers. Additionally, this quote shows how Paul must resort to fantasy in order to imagine a situation in which he’d be happy. He wants to “fly through space like a bird might not find,” conjuring an image of freedom—of empty space—that is so rare that even birds cannot access it. In other words, escape for Paul means escape from reality and the laws that bind it—because Paul’s present reality offers him no means to escape.

nature of prescience to the council. In his explanation, Paul illustrates prescience as something with which a person engages in a power struggle. First, a person “accepts” prescience, suggesting that a person first welcomes prescience into their mind as a power that they expect to be useful to them. Then, the person finds that the “concepts” (information about the future) that prescience shows them are “repugnant” to their “intellect.” This suggests first that there is a fundamental opposition between prescience and intellect—that, in contrast to intellect’s preponderance for logic and sensibility, prescience brings only chaos and disorder.


After laying out this opposition between the intellect and prescience, the quote then details a vital moment in which the intellect either accepts or rejects the concepts of prescience. The quote explains that the action of “rejecting” prescience, while seeming like an act of assertion of one’s power over prescience—is what actually makes the person with prescience beholden to their prescience. Therefore, in the very act of trying to control and stay above prescience, the prescient person instead becomes overpowered by prescience. In this way, the paradoxical nature of prescience prevents any person from ever attaining total power, because it persists in being a power more powerful than the person who possesses it.


- His prescient power had tampered with the image of the universe held by all mankind. He had shaken the safe cosmos and replaced security with his Jihad. He had out-fought and out-thought and out-predicted the universe of men, but a certainty filled him that the universe still eluded him.

## Chapter 5 Quotes

●● “Accepting prescience, you fill your being with concepts repugnant to the intellect. Your intellectual consciousness, therefore, rejects them. In rejecting, intellect becomes a part of the processes and is subjugated.”

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib) (speaker)

**Related Themes:** 

**Related Symbols:** 


**Page Number:** 75

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs when Paul is attempting to explain the

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib)

**Related Themes:**   

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 83

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs during one of Paul’s meditations on the consequences of power and prescience. In the first part of this quote, Paul draws a connection between limited human sight and safety, or “security.” In saying “the image of the universe held by all mankind,” Paul alludes to the knowledge and perception of human beings as defined by their human powers of vision—powers which are limited relative to the powers of prescience. In the second sentence, Paul suggests




that this limited knowledge accounted for the safety of the cosmos. Following this analogy, then, prescience—as a superhuman knowledge—led to the implementation of the Jihad as a replacement for human safety: prescience revealed to Paul his track toward power and endowed him with powers that elevated him to the level of a God. Therefore, prescience, in enabling the creation of the Jihad, disrupted a natural order of things in which people relied on ignorance rather than religion to make them feel secure.


The second half of this quote illustrates the ultimate futility of the struggle for more power. Although Paul has gotten around the human limitations—has “out-thought” beyond the limits of thought, has “out-predicted” beyond the limits of human foresight, has “out-fought” beyond all human enemies—he still feels powerless compared to the entire universe. This illustrates power as something that can only be fought for and gained in the human realm but can never contend with the ultimate power of the universe. In this way, human power is inevitably limited.

## Chapter 6 Quotes

☪️ Where was Idaho in this shaped-to-measure flesh? It wasn't flesh...it was a shroud in fleshly shape! [Idaho's] ghost stared out of metal eyes. Two beings stood side by side in this revenant flesh. One was a threat with its force and nature hidden behind unique veils.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib), Hayt (Duncan Idaho)

**Related Themes:** 

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 98

### Explanation and Analysis

This quote appears when Paul is first meeting Hayt, the ghola of Duncan Idaho. In this description, Paul expresses how the ghola is on the one hand familiar and on the other hand threatening. The quote begins by wondering where the real person—Duncan Idaho—is within the ghola's flesh. The flesh is “shaped-to-measure,” which conjures the image of an artist sculpting flesh to make it match a certain form. This suggests that the flesh of Duncan Idaho became amorphous after he died and needed to be re-shaped artificially by the Tleilaxu to reconstitute his appearance. Paul goes on to say that the flesh of the ghola is not flesh at all but rather a “shroud”—a deceitful veil of sorts that


conceals the true force and nature of the ghola.


This quote describes the ghola as containing another being in addition to the ghost of Duncan Idaho: “two beings stood side by side in the revenant flesh.” “Revenant”—meaning returned from the dead—suggests that the ghola is a split personality between both the ghost of Idaho, but also something newly created. Significantly, Idaho's ghost stares out of “metal eyes,” hinting that eyes are part of the human physical form that cannot return from the dead. The lack of real eyes, which are an indicator in *Dune* of a person's humanity as defined by their limited vision, suggests that the ghola is more—or less—than a human. In other words, Hayt is a ghost, a piece of technology, and a deceitful “veil,” all in one. In this way, this quote captures Paul's complicated feelings toward the ghola as both a former friend—and something hideously modern, artificial, and untrustworthy.

## Chapter 7 Quotes

☪️ She should have understood long ago this similarity between the spice and the ghola. Melange was valuable, but it exacted a price—addiction. It added years to a life—decades for some—but it was still just another way to die.

**Related Characters:** Hayt (Duncan Idaho), Princess Irulan, Gaius Helen Mohiam

**Related Themes:**  

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 107

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs when Irulan is visiting The Reverend Mother in her jail cell on Arrakis. Irulan's quote uses the language of value and cost to show that no power or valuable thing is ever free. All things valuable—in this case melange—cost something to use. The price of melange is “addiction,” which proves that the dangerous aspect of anything valuable or powerful is that the person who makes use of it—spends it, in this analogy—becomes life-threateningly dependent on it. The fact that melange exacts this price diminishes its power; though melange “adds years to a life,” it does not make one immortal. Since it slowly saps a person's life-force through addiction, it merely becomes “another way to die.”



Irulan's quote also draws a comparison between melange and the ghola. Like melange, the ghola is a tool for power—in this case, a tool for the Guild. Irulan's quote does not make


clear what the specific price or value of the ghola is, but in comparing the ghola to melange, Irulan suggests that the ghola offers the semblance of value but will really only delay the evil that the Guild tried to prevent through him.

## Chapter 8 Quotes

☞ He was near, she knew—that shadow-figure of a man she could sense in her future, but could not see. It angered her that no power of prescience could put flesh on that figure.

**Related Characters:** Alia Atreides

**Related Themes:**  

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 113

### Explanation and Analysis

This quote occurs when Alia is experiencing a moment of prescience. Her description of the way the “shadow-figure” appears in her mind illustrates the nature and limitations of prescience. First, Alia makes a distinction between what she can “sense” and what she can “see.” She feels that the shadow-figure is “near” and can “sense” him in her future, but she cannot “see” who it is or what it looks like. In this way, prescience sometimes lacks the ability to provide vivid and specific details that reveal the identity and appearance of figures.


The second part of this quote elaborates on the limitations of prescience. Alia bemoans that prescience cannot “put flesh on that figure.” This suggests that the visions that prescience provides lack a certain human quality. While they bestow the seer with an outline of what is to come, they leave out human qualities, such as the identity and appearance of future people. In this way, the visions of prescience have a certain doom: the shadow-figure that Alia sees has an ominous, inhuman quality, therefore foreshadowing a sinister future. However, the absence of human qualities from prescience also suggests that humanness has a certain power over prescience and fate: what is human about the future is always unknown—and therefore can still come as a surprise.

## Chapter 9 Quotes

☞ “People cling to the Imperial leadership because space is infinite. They feel lonely without a unifying symbol. For a lonely people, the Emperor is a definite place [...] Perhaps religion serves the same purpose.”

**Related Characters:** Stilgar (speaker), Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib), Edric

**Related Themes:** 

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 134

### Explanation and Analysis



This quote comes from Stilgar’s contribution to Paul and Edric’s conversation about the nature of government and religion. Stilgar suggests that both religion and government are artificial constructs. In the case of government, people “cling” to the Imperium because it establishes a “definite place” within an “infinite” universe. This illustration places government against the universe as something that creates a space contrary to the universe’s laws. In other words, Stilgar claims that government is not a natural aspect of the universe, but rather a human creation—a mere “symbol”—that attempts to thwart the natural ways of the universe. In calling government a “unifying symbol,” Stilgar suggests that it is not a real construction but rather a representation—a placeholder—for unity and order that does not actually exist in the world. In the same vein, he claims that religion serves the same purpose: religion is an artificial creation that attempts to get around the fundamental laws of the universe.


In illustrating government and religion this way, Stilgar’s quote points out how government and religion were created out of fear, or “loneliness.” The people of the universe did not establish government because it was natural for them to do so, but rather because their human feeling—loneliness—pushed them to do so. The same is true of religion; people don’t worship because there is truly a god before them—they worship because they need guidance.

☞ “[Genghis Khan] didn’t kill them himself. [...] He killed the way I kill, by sending out his legions. There’s another emperor I want you to note in passing—a Hitler. He killed more than six million. Pretty good for those days.”

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib) (speaker),

Edric, Stilgar

**Related Themes:**  

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 138

### Explanation and Analysis

After concluding his conversation with Edric, Paul instructs Stilgar to study history. Paul lists two of history's barbaric leaders. Genghis Khan famously gathered various nomadic tribes in Mongolia to infiltrate other communities, pillaging and vanquishing them. Hitler is infamous for exterminating Jewish people in concentration camps during the Holocaust, attempting to create a world of people of solely his beliefs and race. In comparing himself to these two historical leaders, Paul paints an extremely negative image of himself. He notes how many people these leaders killed and then says that those numbers were "pretty good for those days." This suggests that the number of people Paul has killed far exceeds the six million people that Hitler killed. In other words, Paul is more barbaric a leader even than Hitler—one of the most infamously evil men in history.


Paul also highlights how many leaders distance themselves from the carnage that they instigate. He makes a distinction between "legions" and the leader to whom the legions belong. Under this description, the phrase "I kill" takes on a new meaning. A leader "kills" by dispatching his legions rather than by actually raising his own hand to kill. In this way, a leader can kill millions of people swiftly and easily and doesn't have to face any of the consequences of the murders he has committed. Ultimately, this quote shows how leaders become more powerful and more dangerous through distancing themselves from the violence they order.

## Chapter 10 Quotes

●● Alia studied the steel balls which were his eyes: no human expression there. His words had carried a reassuring intensity [...] a thing Duncan Idaho might have said. Had the Tleilaxu fashioned their ghola better than they knew—or was this mere sham, part of his conditioning?

**Related Characters:** Hayt (Duncan Idaho), Alia Atreides

**Related Themes:** 

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 151

### Explanation and Analysis

This quote appears when Alia and Hayt are examining the body of the dead woman in the desert. In this quote, Alia describes her uneasy feelings about Hayt and the two identities that he seems to contain. First, Alia notes that Hayt's eyes are "steel balls." These steel balls replace Hayt's eyes and contain "no human expression." Presumably, in the process of revival that Duncan Idaho's flesh underwent, it was not possible to restore his original eyes. This suggests that human eyes are inimitable—and therefore the most distinctly human feature that a person has. In contrast to Hayt's fake eyes, however, his words—carrying a "reassuring intensity"—strike Alia as extremely genuine and reminiscent of Duncan Idaho. That Hayt has one—but not both—of these distinctly human qualities (voice and eyes) calls his humanity into question.

In the second part of this quote, Alia wonders whether Hayt is what his creators intended him to be, or whether, in his creation, Hayt exceeded his creators' expectations. This question hangs on the question of whether the Tleilaxu's act of revival is complete, or whether it remains in the realm of artifice and technology. Hayt is either a being of the past restored to the present, or he is a being of the modern future of technology. That Alia finds Hayt "reassuring" when he says things that remind her of things Duncan Idaho would say reveals her general distrust of the future and a trust of the past.

## Chapter 11 Quotes

●● Once...long ago, he'd thought of himself as an inventor of government. But the invention had fallen into old patterns. It was like some hideous contrivance with plastic memory. Shape it any way you wanted, but relax for a moment, and it snapped into the ancient forms. Forces at work beyond his reach in human breasts eluded and defied him.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib)

**Related Themes:** 

**Page Number:** 164

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs during one of Paul's ruminations about the limitations of his human power. In this quote, Paul discusses whether government is a human invention—or something controlled by laws of nature. The fact that Paul


once thought of himself as an “inventor” implies that he once believed that humans could create new things. The quote goes on to illustrate, however, that no matter what Paul did to establish government, the “invention” always reverted to old ways—“ancient forms” and “old patterns.” For this reason, Paul now believes that government is “a hideous contrivance”—something unnatural and extravagant—that is nothing but a pretense. Furthermore, this contrivance has “plastic memory,” or the tendency to revert to its old form. In this way, this quote shows how old and eternal forms are more powerful than new and modern inventions.

In the last sentence of this quote, Paul explains how human power is limited. He mentions forces that lie outside of “human breasts.” This conjures the image of the human being as finite—a limited border beyond which many other things are happening—and therefore unable to control everything. Not only do these forces elude Paul, but they “defy” him, as if the very act of trying to create a power structure and an organized government in the universe is contrary to the overarching laws of the universe.

## Chapter 12 Quotes

☛☛ Such powers predisposed one to vanity and pride. Power deluded those who used it. One tended to believe power could overcome any barrier...including one’s own ignorance.

**Related Characters:** Alia Atreides

**Related Themes:** 

**Page Number:** 182

### Explanation and Analysis

This quote appears during one of Alia’s ruminations about the limits and negative consequences of power. In the first part of this quote, Alia explains how power has negative consequences when it comes to human virtues. Power causes one to acquire “vanity” and “pride,” both of which are often considered negative traits. She goes on to explain that people who possess power have the vanity to believe that their power can overcome their “own ignorance.” Alia thus suggests that one’s ignorance is fundamental to their human condition—that power can never make a person overcome ignorance. Instead, power only makes a person vain and proud—it makes them think that they can overcome their permanent ignorance.

Alia also suggests that power is a paradox. While people often think of power as enabling, Alia sees power as limiting: power “deludes” those who use it. In this way, a person

becomes more powerless—more blind and ignorant—the more power they possess. Thus, power has a paradoxical nature: in being attained, it disempowers rather than empowers.

## Chapter 14 Quotes

☛☛ [There would be] time enough then to accept the fact that what he had concealed from her had prolonged her life. Was it evil, he wondered, to prefer Chani to an heir? By what right did he make her choice for her?

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib) (speaker), Chani, Princess Irulan

**Related Themes:** 

**Page Number:** 196

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs halfway through Chani’s pregnancy when she finds out that Irulan had been slipping her contraceptives. Paul, who had known this, grapples with the knowledge of his own actions. In the first part of this quote, Paul says that what he “concealed” from Chani—that Irulan was secretly giving her birth control—has prolonged Chani’s life. This foreshadows that Chani’s pregnancy will ultimately cause her death. Therefore, in keeping this information private, Paul has protected Chani. However, he has only “prolonged” her life, not saved her life. In this way, Paul feels that he has kept information from Chani out of selfish reasons, and that his secrecy—no matter how well-meaning—was ultimately futile. Therefore, he talks of needing time to “accept” the facts of his actions; Paul’s secrecy has burdened him with a guilt that only time can heal.

In the second part of this quote, Paul probes deeper into his action of keeping a secret from Chani. He notes that his secrecy was motivated by his preference for Chani over an heir. With this, Paul shows that he cares more about the present and the lives of those he loves than about securing his future power. In other words, Paul’s withholding proves that his human concerns still overcome his concerns for power. However, he wonders if this choice is “evil.” In using this strong word, Paul questions whether it is fundamentally wrong to choose one’s lover over one’s legacy, and whether it is wrong to take away Chani’s agency.

## Chapter 15 Quotes

☞ “[Paul] was a creature who had developed firmly into one pattern. He’d destroy himself before changing into the opposite of that pattern. That had been the way with the Tleilaxu kwisatz haderach. It’d be the way with this one. And then...the ghola.”

**Related Characters:** Scytale (speaker), Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib), Hayt (Duncan Idaho), Edric

**Related Themes:** 

**Page Number:** 209

**Explanation and Analysis**

This passage occurs during a conversation between Scytale and Edric about the Guild’s plot. In this quote, Scytale describes Paul as though he is an artificial intelligence or a controlled organism. Instead of calling Paul a human being, Scytale calls him a “creature,” which conjures the image of an organic specimen that someone would examine scientifically. Scytale goes on to say that Paul has developed into a “pattern,” which likens him to a robot or piece of technology programmed to operate in a certain way. This pattern has become so firm, that Paul actually has no free will outside of this pattern: he would “destroy himself” before straying from this pattern. In this way, Paul’s robotic nature has become so strong that his human nature must sacrifice itself in favor of his robotic nature.

In the second part of this quote, Scytale draws a comparison between Hayt, Paul, and the Tleilaxu kwisatz haderach. This comparison shows the degree to which Paul’s “pattern” nature limits Paul. Not only does Paul himself fall into firm patterns, but he falls into firm patterns like the kwisatz haderach before him, and the ghola after him. This suggests that kwisatz haderachs and gholas have become such well-studied “creatures”—so well-studied that they can even be created, as with the ghola—that many can predict their actions and define their natures. As a piece of technology and a creature of study, Paul has very little human freedom.

## Chapter 16 Quotes

☞ The immensity of the universe outside the temple flooded his awareness. How could one man, one ritual, hope to knit such immensity into a garment fitted to all men?

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib), Alia Atreides

**Related Themes:**  

**Page Number:** 219

**Explanation and Analysis**


This passage occurs when Paul is observing Alia’s religious ritual among the gathered pilgrims. In this quote, Paul becomes aware of the immensity of the universe by comparing it to the small temple that he is standing within. Although the temple is a place that houses a religion that claims to understand the ways of the universe and all things, it is tiny in scale compared to the vast expanse of the universe that lies beyond it. When Paul is within the temple, his awareness is “flooded” with the immensity that lies outside of it. This shows how religious doctrine is not enough to commensurate the huge disparity in size between the temple and the universe. In other words, religion falls short irreconcilably.

After outlining the size disparity between the universe and the temple, Paul outlines the disparity between singularity and multiplicity. In doing so, he shows how government is just as powerless as religion. Paul compares the efforts of the leader to the attempt to knit a garment out of the material of the universe. In asking how the leader could hope to do such a thing, Paul suggests that the material of the universe is fundamentally un-knitable. In other words, the universe defies order. Particularly, the universe defies the attempt to knit it into something “fitted to all men”—something generic and universal; it contains disparity and multiplicity fundamentally. In this way, the universe defies all attempts to synthesize it through either religion or government.

☞ He had become a non-being, a stillness which moved itself. At the core of the non-being, there he existed, allowing himself to be led through the streets of his city, following a track so familiar to his visions that it froze his heart with grief.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib)

**Related Themes:**  

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 225

**Explanation and Analysis**

This passage occurs when Paul is leaving for sietch and feels that he is living more and more in his prescience. In the first part of this quote, Paul says that he has become a “non-being,” suggesting that prescience has alienated him from

his humanity. He elaborates on this point, describing himself as a “stillness which moves itself.” This suggests that the animated, agent part of Paul’s nature has become dormant, and that his body moves itself without any need for his agent faculties. Because prescience has outlined Paul’s exact future for him, the need for his decision-making faculties falls away entirely.


In the second part of this quote, Paul describes himself as existing at the core of this “non-being.” However, this existence of his self is entirely passive; it merely “allows” himself to be led through life. In this way, Paul’s prescience forces him to make a distinction between his body and his self. While his body moves like a machine—“moves itself”—his real self sits passively, letting his future unfold.


Finally, Paul draws a causal connection between familiarity and grief. Because the track he follows through life is so familiar to his prescient visions, he feels that all the joy has been removed from his existence. Significantly, his heart is the organ that “freezes with grief.” Since prescience is a mental faculty of vision, the heart and all its human capacity for feeling is left out in its processes. As prescience takes increasing hold of his life, Paul’s heart stops functioning, not being activated by the normal uncertainty and surprise of life. All in all, Paul’s prescience slowly robs him of his humanity.

## Chapter 17 Quotes

☛ Otheym’s house, Fate’s house, a place different from the ones around it only it the role Time had chosen for it. It was a strange place to be marked down in history.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib) , Otheym

**Related Themes:** 

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 228

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs when Paul has arrived on sietch and is starting to feel his fate close in around him. In this quote, Paul first recognizes Otheym’s house—and then quickly redefines it as “Fate’s house.” This redefinition shows how Paul’s prescience has reshaped his perception of reality. Because of his powers of prescience, Paul can no longer see objects as what they are. Rather, he sees them as objects of Fate. Under normal conditions of human perception, all the houses in the row before Paul are the same; no one stands

out from the others. However, because Paul can see that “Time has chosen” Otheym’s house for a specific role, it stands out in a historical way. The house is a “strange place” to be significant like this because it is otherwise so nondescript. In this way, Paul sees the things around him as more or less distinct based on Fate and Time, rather than on the sensory details normally available to human.

## Chapter 19 Quotes

☛ “What’s law? Control? Law filters chaos and what drips through? Serenity? Law—our highest ideal and our basest nature. Don’t look too closely at the law. Do, and you’ll find the rationalized interpretations, the legal casuistry, the precedents of convenience. You’ll find the serenity, which is just another word for death.”

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib) (speaker), Chani

**Related Themes:** 

**Page Number:** 253

### Explanation and Analysis



This passage occurs after Paul has lost his eyes and is reflecting to Chani about the nature of government and law. In the first part of this quote, Paul acknowledges that laws have an effect: they “filter” the universe’s chaos to make it more manageable. This image of laws as a sieve that weeds out the undesirable or unconscionable parts of the universe suggests that laws are a temporary barrier against the world. Paul claims that “serenity” remains after laws have filtered out the chaos, thereby suggesting that, while laws provide a blissful peace, it is a mere illusion. Paul goes on to claim that “serenity” is a synonym for “death.” In making this dramatic comparison, Paul reveals how peace actually has a deadening effect; not only is serenity unnatural, but it is also stagnant.

Paul cautions generally against looking too closely at the law. In saying this, he means that, if one looks too closely at the law, they will see that it is a contrivance. When looking closely at the law, one first sees law’s “rationalized interpretations.” In other words, one sees that laws are loose generalizations that have been justified by one’s mind. Secondly, one will see that laws are “casuistry,” or clever formulations of unsound reasoning. Lastly, one will see that laws are merely the “precedents for convenience,” meaning that they are in place only to make lives easier—not because they are true. For all these reasons, laws are merely

instruments for “control.”

☛ Government cannot be religious and self-assertive at the same time. Religious experience needs a spontaneity which laws inevitably suppress. And you cannot govern without laws. Your laws must inevitably replace morality, replace conscience, even replace the religion by which you think to govern.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib) , Alia Atreides , Korba , Lady Jessica (speaker)

**Related Themes:**  

**Page Number:** 257

### Explanation and Analysis



The quote is an excerpt from the letter that Lady Jessica sends to Alia explaining why she will not attend Paul's trial of Korba on Arrakis. In this quote, Lady Jessica asserts that religion and law are not compatible. In fact, they are mutually exclusive. Lady Jessica characterizes laws as “self-assertive” and religion as “spontaneous.” In other words, she characterizes laws as strong, commanding, and disciplinary, while she characterizes religion as more heartfelt, unpredictable, and subtle. When a government attempts to employ both laws and religion, the laws “suppress” the religion. In other words, laws attempt to discipline a religious instinct which is inherently impulsive.

Of the two, Lady Jessica asserts that laws always gain the upper hand over religion. Laws are indispensable to a government, whereas religion—and “morality”—are easily replaced because they are more “assertive.” Lady Jessica illustrates how laws swiftly become a stand-in for every distinct part of a society of people; laws replace morality, religion, and even “conscience.” In this way, laws replace even a person's thoughtfulness and impulse to do good. When laws replace “morality,” “conscience,” and “religion,” laws, all these things become contrived expressions of their former selves.

## Chapter 23 Quotes

☛ He wanted to turn to the aides massed in the sietch entrance, shout at them: if you need something to worship, then worship life—all life, every last crawling bit of it! We're all in this beauty together!

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib) , Chani (speaker)

**Related Themes:**  

**Page Number:** 305

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs when Paul is standing on sietch, moments before Chani's death. Paul wants to urge everyone to worship life. He implies that he does not believe he is what the people should worship. Implicitly comparing himself to life, Paul points out that he too is a part of life, and therefore that life is much grander and commanding than he is. Paul claims that everyone is “in this beauty together.” In saying this, Paul first claims that life is beautiful—even though it is also “crawling”—and that he himself is subject to the higher power of unified humanity. In this way, it is not a person who can unify all of humanity; rather, it is the thing that contains all of humanity—in this case, life, or “beauty”—that can unify them.

Paul feels compelled to shout this sentiment to the people around him. This suggests that this sentiment is an intuition and a feeling rather than a rational idea. This intuitive quality suggests that a true religious feeling lies at the heart of Paul's claim. In contrast to a rational tone that might accompany the worship of a leader, Paul's passion suggests the true venerability of life and beauty. In this way, Paul claims that while leaders are not worthy of worship, life and beauty—things which can move a person to an outburst—are.

☛ Awareness turned over at the thought of all those stars above him—an infinite volume. A man must be half mad to imagine he could rule even a teardrop of that volume. He couldn't begin to imagine the number of subjects his Imperium claimed.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib) , Chani

**Related Themes:** 

**Page Number:** 306

### Explanation and Analysis


This passage occurs when Paul is staring out into the desert moments before Chani's death. In this quote, Paul draws a comparison between the infinite stars in the sky and the number of subjects in his Imperium. His awareness “turns

over” when he thinks of all the stars in the sky. In other words, the universe confuses his awareness, making him unable to conceive of the infinite volume of stars. Similarly, Paul “cannot begin to imagine” the number of people who live in his Imperium. Just as with the infinite volume of stars, Paul’s awareness stops short of conceiving of such numbers of people.

In explaining how his awareness is unable to grasp large quantities of stars and people, Paul reveals the absurdity of rulers. A man who cannot even conceive of the infinite volume of stars or the immense quantity of people in the universe is therefore unfit to rule such vast landscapes. Therefore, the man who claims he can must be “half mad.” Even a “teardrop” of the volume of stars or people is too much for a man to rule. This image of the ungovernable teardrop of the universe once again illustrates the universe’s vastness.

☛ Hayt / Idaho / Hayt / Idaho...He became a motionless chain of relative existence, singular, alone. Old memories flooded his mind. He marked them, adjusted them to new understandings, made a beginning at the integration of a new awareness.

**Related Characters:** Hayt (Duncan Idaho) (speaker)

**Related Themes:** 

**Page Number:** 312

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs just before Hayt transforms into Duncan Idaho. In this quote, Hayt’s experience of transformation into Duncan Idaho shows how his becoming is really the start of an entirely independent identity. First, this quote illustrates a flashing back and forth between Hayt’s two identities—“Hayt / Duncan Idaho / Hayt / Duncan Idaho.” This reads like a glitch in a computer program—like two images flashing in and out on a screen. This suggests that Hayt’s programming is going haywire. He becomes “a chain of relative existence” and feels “singular, alone.” This suggests that Hayt’s true self sits waiting while these two identities alternate in defining him. At the same time as his programming starts to break down, “old memories” flood his mind, suggesting that an ancient, natural, and human awareness—memory—is taking over his programmed nature.

In the second part of this quote, Hayt seems to choose the

beginning of a new existence and identity for himself. He seems to become his own engineer, “marking,” “adjusting,” and “integrating” his old memories to make a “new awareness.” In this way, Hayt himself replaces the Tleilaxu as his own creator. In doing so, he become Duncan Idaho again—becomes an independent being and his own agent. Therefore, resuming existence as Duncan Idaho is synonymous with breaking the coding and programming that outsiders have given him.

☛ Ahhh, that’s why they gave me Idaho as a ghola, to let me discover how much the recreation is like the original. But now—full restoration...at their price. I’d be a Tleilaxu forevermore. And Chani...chained to the same fate by a threat to our children, exposed once more to the Qizarate’s plotting.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad’Dib) (speaker), Hayt (Duncan Idaho) , Chani , Scytale

**Related Themes:**  

**Page Number:** 320

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs after Chani’s death when Scytale is bargaining with Paul. It is not until this point in the story that Paul has a “lightbulb moment” about what the Guild had been planning all along. He had thought that the Guild had planned for the ghola to destroy him, but here, he realizes that the ghola becoming trustworthy (“fully restoring” into Duncan Idaho) was the Guild’s plan. In becoming Duncan Idaho, the ghola tempts Paul with its ability to fully become someone who died. With this knowledge of the ghola’s success, Paul faces the possibility of Chani’s revival with an extra amount of temptation. The successful ghola offers Paul the opportunity to reverse death and change the fate he had always known was coming: Chani’s death. In this way, the ghola is the ultimate escape from the doom in which Paul’s prescience has consistently immersed him. In this way, this quote sums up the Guild’s plot all along.

The second part of this quote explains how a person is always beholden to whoever creates them. Paul knows that if he lets the Tleilaxu revive Chani as a ghola, then the Tleilaxu will control them; the Tleilaxu will be able to make Paul and Chani do whatever they ask, threatening their children and involving them again with the corrupt Qizarate. In this way, this quote ultimately explains how Paul has to resist the temptation to escape his fate and instead accept what his prescience showed him all along. In short, Paul






learns to accept death and fate instead of letting the renewal of life and possibility tempt him,

## Chapter 24 Quotes

●● The Fremen [...] had said Muad'Dib would never die, that he had entered the world where all possible futures existed, [...], wandering there endlessly even after his flesh had ceased to be.

**Related Characters:** Paul Atreides (Muad'Dib)

**Related Themes:**  

**Related Symbols:** 

**Page Number:** 329

### Explanation and Analysis

This passage occurs after Paul has surrendered himself to the desert per Fremen custom for the blind. In this quote,

the Fremen describe Paul as immortalized by his death in the desert. Even though Paul has died, the Fremen say that Paul “would never die,” suggesting that, in death, he becomes deathless. To accomplish his death, Paul walked into the desert, fulfilling the Fremen tradition that the blind abandon themselves in the desert to die. Because Paul does what the Fremen religion requires of him, he becomes an eternal figure of their spirituality. In this way, only in dying does Paul achieve the kind of religious and political influence that he could only posture in life. He wanders “endlessly” even though his “flesh has ceased to be.” In other words, Paul has become a spiritual figure—bodiless and eternal.

Because the desert is a special place for the Fremen—a place that operates in their customs—this place comes to be “the world where all possible futures existed.” For the Fremen, Paul has entered this space of future possibility. In this way, Paul’s death also restores to him a future of possibility—something his prescience had excluded him from in life. Thus, death allows Paul to achieve all that was humanly impossible to achieve in life.



## SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS

The color-coded icons under each analysis entry make it easy to track where the themes occur most prominently throughout the work. Each icon corresponds to one of the themes explained in the Themes section of this LitChart.

## CHAPTER 1

The epigraph to Chapter 1 is a dedication to Paul Muad'Dib, born Paul Atreides—an Imperial emperor—and his sister Alia. The dedication explains that although Paul Muad'Dib and Alia could see the future, they were still human. Therefore, their story is the story of mankind—of all of “us” as their heirs.

Muad'Dib's reign has fascinated historians from all walks of life. Muad'Dib contains the ideal “ingredients of history:” he was trained by his mother, Lady Jessica of the Bene Gesserit—a powerful sisterhood—to have super-human physical control; he was a mentat, having intellect beyond that of the ancient computers, and he was a kwisatz haderach—a man bred by the Bene Gesserit to control human destiny. Muad'Dib angered the Bene Gesserit when he defeated an emperor—Shaddam—but put his sister Alia on the throne instead of the Bene Gesserit. He married Shaddam's daughter, Princess Irulan, but only to make peace.

Muad'Dib then brought the whole universe under unified religious control. He captured the planet Arrakis, or Dune, and with it “the ultimate coin” **melange**—a life-giving poison. The Imperial citizens are now vitally addicted to melange, which gives the power of prophecy, human control, and space travel. In capturing melange, Muad'Dib gained total power, but also failure; some historians say that evil conspirators and plots defeated Muad'Dib, but none of these facts explain history; only the “lethal nature of prophecy” reveals the failure of its total power.

## CHAPTER 2

On the planet Wallach IX, the members of the conspiracy Guild meet to plot to overthrow Muad'Dib. Though Scytale (from the Tleilaxu sect of the Imperium) plots to destroy Muad'Dib, he privately feels that he will regret causing Muad'Dib misery and death. Scytale listens to the others talk about psychic poison. Wallach IX's ruler—the Reverend Mother of the Bene Gesserit, Gaius Helen Mohiam—makes a cautionary statement. The Guild Steersman Edric—a human with the hands and feet of a fish who floats in a container of orange **melange** gas—gives a sneering reply. Princess Irulan—the enemy and wife (but not “mate”) of Muad'Dib—exclaims that they are getting nowhere.

*Although Dune Messiah is a work of science fiction, it is addressed to “us”—readers who will be able to relate to its main characters. Paul and Alia are not the kind of all-powerful characters who experience no hardship or limitation; rather, they will experience human problems despite their power.*



*Paul Atreides was born with the conditions to control the world. His physical strength, intellect, and command of destiny exceed those of a normal person. Paul instigated his enemies not through any weakness or lack of claim to destiny, but rather through a breach of loyalty. This suggests that it's a human weakness—the preference for family over political allegiance—that complicates Paul's command of absolute power.*



*Paul unifies the world, but not by gaining his followers' willful support. Instead, he gets his citizens addicted to melange, which he uses as a weapon for religious and political control. Paul will eventually be defeated, but it will be because of the very power that he has gained. Paul's “lethal nature of prophecy,” while helping Paul overtake the world, will also bring about its downfall, suggesting that too much power is itself a threat to power.*



*The conspiracy Guild is comprised of members from various homelands in the Imperium, revealing that there is general dissatisfaction with the Muad'Dib across the board. However, despite their various causes for revolt against Muad'Dib, their conspiracy relies on melange, just as the Muad'Dib does. The fact that the Guild Steersman is extremely addicted to melange foreshadows that the Guild possesses the same weaknesses of power that the Muad'Dib does.*

Scytale reflects that the Bene Gesserit chose the setting—a spacious dome on a snowy planet—so as not to inhibit Edric’s space-loving psyche. He wonders if the Bene Gesserit are appealing to any of Edric’s weaknesses, too. The Reverend Mother demands Scytale’s opinion, and Scytale says that it would be foolish to attack a potential messiah. Scytale—as a Face Dancer who can mimic appearances and psyches—chose a jolly appearance for the meeting. While the Reverend Mother tries to assess him, Scytale insinuates that poison is a bad idea. Edric shifts uneasily and reminds Scytale that they are discussing psychic poison. Scytale laughs.

Scytale insinuates that, despite their training, the Bene Gesserit do not know about deception. The Reverend Mother looks away in contemplation, and Edric confronts Scytale about his allegiance. Ignoring this, Scytale asks Princess Irulan if she is wondering why she came all this way. Stepping away from Edric’s putrid container of orange gas, Princess Irulan says it was a mistake to come. Edric takes a **melange** pill. Scytale knows that Edric disgusts Princess Irulan, and he reminds her that it is only thanks to Edric’s presence that Muad’Dib powers of sight cannot see their meeting.

Princess Irulan asks how far Edric’s influence extends. Edric explains that he can see Muad’Dib’s effects but not Muad’Dib himself. The conspiracy against Muad’Dib can only take place in Edric’s presence. Scytale says that the Guild can shape the future. He and the Reverend Mother agree that the Princess sees the trap the Guild set for her. Edric says that Irulan wants to mother a dynasty, but that Muad’Dib married her for political reasons, and they don’t have sex. Annoyed at Edric’s voyeurism, Irulan says that she secretly gives Muad’Dib’s concubine birth control so she won’t bear the dynasty either.

Pleased at her confession, Edric says Muad’Dib must not find out. He reminds Princess Irulan that Muad’Dib has never shown her warmth. Scytale indicates to the Princess that Edric holds sway in their conspiracy; he knows that the only way Muad’Dib won’t find out about their plot is if Edric can persuade the Princess to commit to the Guild.

*Scytale’s subtly derogatory thoughts about Edric reveal that the Guild Steersman is not an impressive or powerful figure. In Scytale’s assessment, Edric is a character with many weaknesses. Furthermore, although Scytale belongs to the conspiracy, he mocks its members and challenges their plans. In this way being a disjointed and incompatible group of members with different ideas and beliefs further weakens the conspiracy.*



*Edric is a vital part of the conspiracy, but he is also the figure most disruptive to the conspiracy’s unity as a group. The power that Edric brings to the group—the melange-induced foresight that blocks Muad’Dib’s foresight—is also the conspiracy’s downfall because it makes Edric repulse the other members of the group. In this way, Edric holds a power similar to the Muad’Dib’s: a power that will also be his downfall.*



*The Guild is more concerned with controlling the future of Muad’Dib’s dynasty than they are with Muad’Dib’s current rule. Although Muad’Dib married Princess Irulan to graft political peace, this action did not assuage Irulan or the Bene Gesserit’s desire for the ensured future in the shape of a child. In this way, Muad’Dib separated political and personal matters, but this separation weakened his sway over many people, namely the Bene Gesserit.*



*Because Irulan lives with Muad’Dib, she is a weak link in the conspiracy in that, away from Edric’s concealing presence, she could reveal the Guild to Muad’Dib. Therefore, the Guild relies on obtaining Irulan’s trust by tempting her with the possibility of mothering a dynasty.*



After thinking about the tempting prize of mothering a dynasty, Princess Irulan asks Scytale if he always gives his victims a possible escape, and Scytale assents. Edric says that the Princess is already on their side: she spies on Muad'Dib for the Bene Gesserit. Irulan says she is not convinced that they can defeat Muad'Dib. Edric lists the ways Muad'Dib is all-powerful, but the Reverend Mother says that Muad'Dib is still human and has weaknesses. Scytale mentions Muad'Dib's mother, Lady Jessica, and the Reverend Mother calls her a "traitorous bitch." The Reverend Mother asserts that they are more than conspirators, and Scytale mocks her certainty that they are humanity's salvation.

Edric says that every religious and political question boils down to who will exercise power. Scytale and the Reverend Mother silently agree that Edric is their weakness. Edric tells Princess Irulan to choose whether she wants to be an instrument of destiny. At Princess Irulan's request, Edric explains that they plan to revive the ghost of Duncan Idaho—Muad'Dib's beloved sword-master whom Princess Irulan's father's army killed. Scytale changes into a slender man to show what this revived ghost would look like.

With maddening long-windedness, Edric explains that Princess Irulan's father's army had preserved Duncan Idaho's body and then sent it to the Tleilaxu—Scytale's people. The Tleilaxu sold the revived corpse—now named Hayt—to Edric because they already had their own kwisatz haderach. Scytale explains that the Tleilaxu's kwisatz haderach was bred to die before becoming the antithesis of his original representation, and so he killed himself. Scytale makes sure that the Reverend Mother—as one of the kwisatz haderach breeders—is offended by this.

Scytale says that emotions cloud the mutual fear that prompted this meeting; they cannot pass beyond Edric's understanding, or they will lose their shield. Ignoring his warning, the Reverend Mother questions Scytale about the Tleilaxu's failed kwisatz haderach. Edric loses his temper. He says he wants to discuss how sending Hayt (who reflects Muad'Dib's education) to Muad'Dib will enlarge Muad'Dib's "moral nature." Irulan clarifies that Hayt is intended to poison Muad'Dib's psyche. She asks about the Qizarate (the religious civil servants of Muad'Dib) and CHOAM (the organization of economic affairs), but Scytale assures her that they will force these less powerful groups to join their cause.

*In the same way that Dune presents power as something that inevitably brings along its own weakness, Scytale asserts that every trap laid for a person contains an escape. While Muad'Dib's power contains a downfall, his trap also contains an escape, and therefore his future is still undetermined. In this view of an open-ended future, the Reverend Mother's certainty that she is in the right and that Paul's family's traitorousness dooms them to failure appears as a flawed outlook.*



*While the Reverend Mother's case is religious—believing that the universe must be saved from Paul—and Irulan desires political control over the universe in the shape of a child with Paul, Scytale insists that both these cases are a question of power. In this way, although religion may seem virtuous and politics may seem practical, both are ultimately about the exercise of power.*



*Although the kwisatz haderachs are bred to be all-powerful, their breeding contains a glitch that can lead them to destroy themselves. As a former kwisatz haderach, the Muad'Dib likely contains this same peculiar downfall. Also as a potential kwisatz haderach, Hayt contains a similar glitch as well: as a revived former man, Hayt will die before he truly sheds his whole nature. This suggests that it is unlikely that Hayt is more than Duncan Idaho.*



*The Guild talks vaguely about their plans to overthrow Muad'Dib. Edric says that Hayt will make Muad'Dib a more moral person, possibly suggesting that Hayt will make Muad'Dib feel guilty and recognize his moral duty to Irulan to give her a child, or to the Bene Gesserit to give them and heir. Irulan is similarly vague when she says that Hayt will poison Muad'Dib's psyche, possibly insinuating the same changes but in negative terms. Either way, Hayt is intended to affect an internal rather than external change in the Muad'Dib.*



Scytale says that Hayt will also make Alia attracted to him. Scytale says that if Muad'Dib asks Hayt his purpose, Hayt will tell him the truth, leaving Muad'Dib an escape route. Edric submits to the judgment of his colleagues and then says the Bene Gesserit's **melange** stock is low. Scytale hints that he plans to steal the recipe for melange from the Muad'Dib's army, the Fremen, whose genetic tendency to believe can be manipulated. Princess Irulan asks if she will be left with someone with whom to father a royal dynasty, and the others recognize commitment in her voice. Scytale thinks that Irulan is beautiful and smart and decides he might make a copy of her since he can't have her.

*It is unclear why the Guild might want Hayt to make Alia attracted to him, except that it will solidify Paul's trust of Hayt. It also suggests that Alia, as an Atrides herself, might be an object of the Guild's desire for an Atrides' heir. Beyond the internal control over Paul that the Guild hopes to obtain with Hayt, they also hope to gain full possession of melange—the tool that is most directly giving Paul power in the universe. In this way, the Guild hopes to dethrone Paul both psychologically and materially.*



## CHAPTER 3

Paul Atrides (Muad'Dib) sits on his bed and takes off his desert boots. He has just come from a long, tiring walk through the streets of Dune. He listens to pedestrians outside and envies their normal lives. As he takes off his stillsuit, he reflects that Dune is a paradox now: the fate of power is to be under siege. The smell of the sand from his stillsuit reminds him of old desert dangers. His current walks are mostly to remind himself of his old wild nature. It is possible that an old enemy could recognize him through his stillsuit, but it is unlikely.

*This scene introduces Paul as a character who is both unsatisfied and unstable in his position of power. Although he is the Emperor of the universe, he wishes he were a normal person. He is forced to walk around Dune in a stillsuit, feeling like a stranger. What's more, as soon as he gained power, he had to face the threat of losing it. In these ways, power estranges and endangers whoever holds it.*



Chani—Paul's lover—comes in with a coffee tray, moving with a “fragile power” that reminds Paul of when they met. Chani checks the coffee—brewing in a pot that Paul won when he killed the owner—and lays out cups. Paul looks in the mirror and notes his appearance—a mixture of Fremen, Atrides, and **melange** addiction. He remembers something his grandfather said about rulers needing to selflessly love their subjects, and he worries that he hasn't lived up to his family name. Chani orders Paul into bed.

*The detail of how Paul obtained the coffee pot reveals that all that Paul has (and the power he possesses) are spoils: they came from vanquishing others. Moreover, apart from his ancestry, Paul struggles with melange addiction as though this were part of his genetics. In this way, Paul's power is not innate: it rests on the deaths of others and on his addiction to a drug.*



From bed, Paul looks around the room, which is surprisingly simple for an Emperor's lodging. Chani pours the coffee and asks if Paul is hungry. Noticing his anger, she sits down and massages his legs. Bluntly, she asks to discuss Princess Irulan's wish for a baby. Paul looks at Chani—who usually asks practical rather than personal questions—and wonders why she's asking a personal question now.

*The matter of Paul's future heir to his throne is central to Dune Messiah's conflict. Paul forged an alliance with the Bene Gesserit by marrying Irulan, but he is romantically connected to Chani—a Fremen woman whose child would take Paul's destiny completely out of Bene Gesserit hands.*



Sitting back wearily, Paul asks Chani if he should send Irulan away. Chani dissents, saying that Irulan is Paul's only contact with his enemies and that the enemies would no longer seek Irulan's confidence if she got pregnant. Paul assures Chani that he swore an oath not to sleep with Irulan, but Chani insists that Paul must have an heir. Paul closes his eyes and falls into a happy memory of Chani, but the vision tries to escape his mind. His prophetic vision recognizes a destroyed future, and he urges his mind to disengage.

Paul opens his eyes and meets Chani's decided expression. When he maintains that Chani will give him the only heir he wants, she asks if he has foreseen this. When Paul silently reflects how the effort to see the complex future will only show him grief, Chani deduces that he has not seen it. Chani says that an Atreides should not be left to chance, and Paul thinks of Lady Jessica's similar concern for lineage.

Paul deduces that Chani overheard his meeting with Irulan earlier that day. He flashes back to his conversation with Irulan: Irulan's room stank of **melange**. Paul asks Irulan mockingly about her visit to the Bene Gesserit. He senses her anger and fear and wonders why he hadn't been able to predict her mood. Irulan talks about the weather, but when Paul demands her real purpose, she bursts out that she wants a baby. Paul refuses.

Irulan argues that she is Paul's wife, and that her father was a great man. Paul disagrees that Irulan's father was great and says that Irulan plays a political role; Paul won the right to control the dynasty's destiny, and Fate did not choose Irulan to bear his heir. Paul says that Irulan may take a lover, but he will kill her if she has a baby. Irulan storms out.

Chani asks what Paul has decided, bringing him out of his memory. Paul says he will not give Irulan a child. Getting angry, he says that Irulan is full of wicked plots. Chani lies down beside Paul and says that Irulan's persistence indicates that Paul's enemies have decided how to fight him. Filled with sudden prophetic fear, Paul says he would give anything to end the Jihad—his religious sway over the entire universe. He knows that even if he died, his godhead name would still rule; he had been chosen. Chani says that Paul can un-choose, and Paul says he will in time.

*Chani points out that Paul's decision not to have a baby with Irulan is the sole cause of his enemies' attack on him. Paul's love and loyalty to Chani overrides a practical decision—having a baby with his political wife—that would ensure his invincibility and power. In this, Paul's human qualities of love and loyalty weaken his power.*



*Paul's decision to be loyal to Chani is all the more human because it requires him to ignore the future that he has the power to see. Although Paul hints that the future brings him nothing but grief, he still believes that Chani will bear his heir—a stubbornly irrational belief that reveals his human nature.*



*The fact that Paul had not been able to predict Irulan's mood shows how Edric's prescience does indeed conceal the Guild's activity from Paul's prescience. Paul observes rather than questions this failure of prescience, an action which suggests that he actually prefers moments when he can't see the future.*



*Paul attempted to handle the alliance with Irulan's ancestry politically to ensure his own power. However, he underestimated the emotional needs that she would have. This shows how political decisions often oppress a society's emotional needs.*



*Although enemies are plotting against Paul, they are not the true enemy of his happiness; in fact, Paul would willingly give up his power if he could. Instead, Paul's enemy is the Jihad that he began that he now cannot end. Paul's foresight is also his enemy because it shows him a future that he wishes he could alter. In this way, Paul's biggest enemy is internal turmoil rather than anything external.*



Chani says they could return to Sietch Tabr (the Fremen homeland), where the Fremen are waiting for their Muad'Dib. Paul longs for the sandy vistas of Sietch, but says he belongs to a vision. He wonders if he should pay the price for ending the Jihad and reflects that he never wanted to be a god. Paul assures Chani that they will return to Sietch but wonders privately if the agony of millions is worth the life of one. He wants to escape his trap, renounce his religion, and be free, but he knows these are empty words. Chani jokes that the huge worm she saw by the city wall the other day was calling the Muad'Dib home. Paul remembers when he had his first prophetic vision. After that, his life was no longer his.

Paul worries that, instead of telling the future, the oracle made the future, and that he'd fallen into a trap by succumbing to it; he wonders if having power makes a person vulnerable to other powers. Worried that Paul is angry, Chani says that she only started this conversation because she desperately wants a child. Paul caresses her, then he goes to the balcony overlooking his moonlit planet. He thinks of the people who hate him for changing the old ways and reflects how the universe's resistance increases the more power he gets. He returns to bed and lies down in Chani's arms, assuring her that she hasn't upset him.

## CHAPTER 4

On Dune, an old man with blue eyes stands in his doorway staring suspiciously at Scytale. Semuta music—a music that could infiltrate a person's brain and fill it with memories—issues from behind the old man. Scytale—who has taken on Duncan Idaho's appearance—gives the greeting signal of the conspiracy. The old man asks Scytale if he knew his son. Scytale feels uneasy in this cul-de-sac of bleak houses built for veterans of the Jihad. The old man continues to question Scytale, and Scytale fears that there is some reason for the man's caution.

The old man asks Scytale's name. Scytale responds "Zaal"—his given name for this mission—and the old man introduces himself as Farok, a veteran of the Jihad. Farok lets Scytale inside to a covered courtyard. Farok describes the life he lived in Sietch, and Scytale realizes that Farok joined the conspiracy because he lost his old life in the war. The background music changes, and Scytale notices a seated boy with empty eye sockets striking up a song about wind that swept the world and sky away.

*All the citizens of the Imperium now rely on Paul not only for political reasons, but also as a god—a being who gives their lives purpose and meaning. This means that Paul's life is no longer his own. Instead, his decisions affect the entire universe. If Paul decided to do what he wanted, it would be a selfish action that would destabilize millions of people. This predicament reveals that religion—which falsely attached Paul's citizens to him as a god—creates more potential harm than good.*



*Paul feels that power is a paradox—the more power he gains, the more dangers he faces—and this feeling contributes to his growing dislike of his powers of prescience. Paul originally began the Jihad because he had seen it with his prescience. Now, he regrets this decision, and feels that the oracle he followed was deceiving him. This distrust carries forward to the present, when Paul increasingly attempts to repress his visions of his future.*



*This scene shows what Dune is like beyond Muad'Dib's Keep. The cul-de-sac is a place stuck in a past time either before or during the war that started the Jihad. Semuta music issues from the houses, suggesting that these veterans have not been able to move on from their memories or from their old ways of life. Moreover, the houses are bleak, suggesting that while Muad'Dib gains power and prestige, the rest of the planet falls into poverty.*



*Farok is a part of the conspiracy for another reason beyond those of its main members. Farok hates how Muad'Dib has changed the world since he gained power, revealing that the spread of Muad'Dib's influence has not been for the good of all; it required a war that robbed many people of their comfort caused them to sustain long-lasting injuries, such as Farok's son's missing eyes.*



Scytale senses wisdom and loyalty in Farok and follows Farok to some cushions. They sit. Farok describes how his son (the seated boy) lost his eyes. He then ascertains that Scytale is a Face Dancer and says that Scytale's appearance reminds him of Duncan Idaho. In response to Farok's query, Scytale says Face Dancers can choose their sex. Scytale politely declines Farok's offer of refreshments and blesses Abu d' Dhur—a mythological idol—an action which clues Farok into Scytale's allegiance with Edric.

In riddled language, Scytale insinuates that he wants to talk about Muad'Dib's Keep. Farok evades his inquiry and explains that he tried to get his son Tleilaxu replacement **eyes**, but his son didn't want metal eyes. Scytale subtly steers the conversation back to Muad'Dib's Keep. Farok says that he entered Muad'Dib's Imperial Keep for the celebration of the Jihad victory. Farok complains about the celebratory feast, at which the soldiers spoke of war and had orgies with enslaved women. He tells Scytale that Muad'Dib and Chani's private chamber is hidden somewhere deep in the Keep.

Farok says that Muad'Dib has a few trusted Fremen officials and disregards everyone else. Muad'Dib has a private landing strip on the inner wall and singlehandedly controls its activity. Disapprovingly, Farok says that Muad'Dib implants wave translators inside men so they can carry messages indecipherable by political cryptology. Scytale asks if the Fremen people objected to making the Muad'Dib their god. Farok says that the Fremen think of the Jihad as a source of wealth and strange adventure.

While his son sings louder, Farok reminisces about Sietch. There, he owned simple possessions that held memories. He had no money, but he felt rich. He had two wives and had knowledge without having to think. When Paul Atreides came, hailed as the Muad'Dib, and called for the Jihad, Farok didn't join. His friends joined, and returned with stories of wizardry, believing Paul was their savior. Farok says that he enlisted in the Jihad at last because he wanted to see something he'd never seen before: the sea.

Farok's son ends his song and starts another. Scytale asks Farok if he found the sea. After a long pause, Farok tells of the time he and his fellow soldiers witnessed a glorious sunset over the sea. The water made him sick when he drank it, and there were dead bodies and debris floating in the water, but Farok felt he understood the purpose of everything. Farok tells Scytale that the universe is unfinished, and that "The Mother of Chaos" lives in the sea. When he stepped out of the sea, he was cured of the Jihad.

*The versatility of Face Dancers hints at Scytale's individual power as a member of the conspiracy. Scytale gains Farok's trust by reminding him of his former compatriot in the Jihad, Duncan Idaho. In this way, Scytale uses his Face Dancer skills to get in with Farok even more than his fellow allegiance to the conspiracy does.*



*Farok's perspective on Paul's behavior after winning the Jihad casts him in an unflattering light. In Farok's opinion, Paul behaved like a barbaric conqueror drunk on his victory—not like a just man ruling the universe for a just cause. In this way, Paul's rise to power required him to resort to immoral behavior and compromised his reputation with many people.*



*Farok's description of Muad'Dib reveals that, although Muad'Dib exercises unified rule over much of the universe, he is actually very selective and private. He sends messages that he does not want everyone to read, he lives where he is inaccessible to the public, and he ignores most of his subjects. In this way, Muad'Dib's unified rule requires that he keep most people in the dark.*



*Farok illustrates the culture the Jihad occasioned as one of consumerism and falsehoods. The current culture is characterized by divides between rich and poor whereas before, everyone felt rich even if they had nothing. Moreover, there was no absence of spiritual happiness before, but in the current state of things, people are bewitched by the idea that Muad'Dib is a God.*



*Farok makes the claim that experiencing the "Mother of Chaos" cured him of the Jihad. The Jihad is fueled by peoples' belief that Muad'Dib is a god, and therefore by the belief that the universe revolves around him. However, the chaos that Farok witnessed in the sea must have convinced him that the universe is incapable of order—and therefore that absolute power is impossible.*





Scytale feels uneasy when he realizes that he can't remember when Farok's son stopped singing. Farok tells Scytale that every gate into the Emperor's Keep is guarded. Scytale asserts that this conviction is the Keep's weakness. Scytale feels that Farok's son's music transmitted all the vital information of the conspiracy into his brain.

Farok says that they have the woman, and Scytale asks to see her. Farok's son starts playing the violin, and a Fremen woman appears, heavily drugged with **melange**. Farok introduces her as Otheim's daughter Lichna and says that his son overpowered her with semuta music to make her love him. As Otheim's daughter leans over Farok's son, Farok asks Scytale what he plans to do with her.

Scytale raises his arm, and a needle darts from his sleeve and embeds in Farok's neck. As Farok dies, Scytale goes over to the blind son and impales him with the needle. Changing his appearance to look like Farok, Scytale leads Otheim's daughter away.

*Muad'Dib's Keep illustrates the paradox of power: too much power is a weakness. Similarly, the strength of Muad'Dib's Keep makes it vulnerable to invaders. This suggests that power, by attracting attention, creates its own downfall.*



*Lichna is drugged with melange—which gives the power to see the future—and semuta—which overpowers the user with memories of the past. These two drugs, representing two opposite powers, show how the perception of time can oppress and sway people in this universe.*



*Even though Farok is a member of the conspiracy, Scytale deceives him and robs him of Lichna. This suggests that Scytale—while playing along with the conspiracy—possibly has his own motives and plans.*



## CHAPTER 5

On Dune, the Imperial Council gathers for a meeting. Alia (Paul's 15-year-old sister) observes tension among the members of the council. As she sits down, Korba (the leader of the Qizarate) tells Paul that there are fewer gods than there used to be, and Alia laughs loudly. Alia accuses the Qizarate of being religious spies rather than divines. Paul wonders why Alia is provoking Korba. Paul orders Korba to go out to the balcony and lead the pilgrims' prayers. As Korba goes, Irulan wonders anxiously if Edric is hiding her actions from Alia too.

Chani looks at her uncle Stilgar and wonders if he misses his life on in the Sietch. Stilgar looks at Korba standing on the balcony with raised arms and thinks he looks like he's being crucified. When Korba returns, his eyes are ablaze with religious power. Alia makes another jibe at Korba, and Paul again wonders about Alia's motives; Alia was in Lady Jessica's womb when Lady Jessica became a Reverend Mother, and this endowed Alia with elderly wisdom.

*While Paul has aroused fervor in the Imperium's citizens at large, the Qizarate's religiosity does not seem authentic. Korba comments on the number of gods in existence, absurdly suggesting that gods can come in and out of being like human beings. As a political organization formed from a religion, the Qizarate are paradoxical: they power in mind even if their religious doctrines claim otherwise.*



*The novel portrays Korba as an ostentatious religious figure, mimicking the crucifixion of Christ and enjoying his religion insofar as it gives him the thrill of power. Though Alia can see the hypocrisy in Korba, Paul cannot—and this suggests that, while Paul has the power to see the future, he does not have equal insight into the true natures of people.*



Stilgar begins the meeting, drawing Paul's attention to a treaty which the Guild asks Paul to sign for a planet, Tupile; Paul doesn't know where Tupile is located. Addressing Paul as her husband, Irulan suggests that he withhold **melange** from the people on Tupile. Chani shakes her head, and Paul says that Tupile is a place of sanctuary for those he has defeated. Stilgar warns that the people on Tupile can hide things from the Emperor, but Alia says that allowance keeps the peace. Deeply irritated, Irulan asks what Paul has gained, and Alia responds that they have avoided confrontation. Paul senses that Alia understands the responsibility he feels for the universe.

Chani says that denying Tupile **melange** would cause its collapse, and it would be their fault. Paul says that he will sign the treaty, but Stilgar asks if Paul can't get around the Guild and locate Tupile with his powers. Paul looks at the table, wondering how he can explain his prescient powers. Meeting Paul's gaze, Alia nods at Irulan to remind Paul that Irulan will tell the Bene Gesserit everything. Wanting to give Stilgar an answer, Paul says that his prescience "wears the guise of nature" and cannot act out of aims; his own mind can only see what he predicts; if he looked for Tupile, this would hide Tupile.

Irulan says that Paul's prescience is inconsistent. Alia says that consistency is not an aspect of the universe and that Paul cannot explain a power with boundaries that escape the intellect. Paul signs the Tupile treaty, reflecting on all the different natures present at the meeting.

Stilgar opens another folder and says that Ix—another planet—is clamoring to write a constitution. Particularly, the Ixians resist the taxes they pay to the Imperium. Stilgar reads a memorandum from CHOAM that says that the Imperium should be prevented from becoming a total power monopoly. Paul thinks about how the Jihad has faltered and is finite alongside eternity. Chani suggests that the Imperium grant Ix the form of a constitution; Irulan rebukes her deceptiveness. Korba suggests that they grant Ix a religious constitution, but Paul sharply forbids any constitution, saying that a constitution—as a non-human body of government—is the basis for tyranny.

Next, Stilgar says that Irulan's father has been teaching his legion how to land flying crafts. Irulan asks what her father can do with one small legion and insists that he is only training his police force. Paul requests that Irulan write to her father reminding him of his position. Irulan threatens that her father would not make a good martyr because many people look back on his rule with nostalgia. Chani warns Irulan not to overstep, but Paul knows Irulan is right.

*The members of the council debate whether Paul should exercise or restrain the complete use of his power. Alia's argument suggests that Paul will actually gain more control over the universe (will render it peaceful) if he withholds overt power over the planet of Tupile. On the other hand, if Paul exercised more power over Tupile, the planet might revolt. In this way, power is again seen as paradoxical: the more power one gains, the more in danger they are of losing this power.*



*Paul describes his prescience as a power that is beyond his ability to control, even though he possesses it. He cannot seek the information that he needs, which means that he cannot use prescience to his own advantage. Instead of being a tool that he can wield, his prescience is natural, and it comes to him as would memory or inspiration—that is, it is beyond his control.*



*Instead of revealing the absolute truth, Paul's prescience "wears the guise of nature" and so is inconsistent like nature. This inconsistency hints that Paul's future could still surprise him, even though his prescience often makes the future seem fated.*



*Tupile and Ix's petition for a kind of independence suggests a growing dissatisfaction with Muad'Dib's rule since his rise to power. As it stands, every aspect of social and political life centers around Dune—religion, leadership, and finances. Paul rejects their pleas for independence on the grounds of the inhumanness of a constitution that would lead to rebellion. In this way, Paul suggests that it is the humanness of a centralized government that keeps power in check.*



*The tension between Paul and Irulan is a tension between the present and the past. Paul represents a new society that uses prescience to move toward the future. But the Empire's attachment to the past is just as powerful as prescience. The Empire's nostalgia—not prescience—creates a weakness in Paul's rule.*



Next, Stilgar broaches the Bene Gesserit's request to consult Paul about his bloodline. Paul tries to brush the topic aside, but Chani says they should discuss it. She describes praying and going to doctors, all in an effort to become pregnant. Irulan speaks persuasively about the civil strife that would result should no heir be born. Paul gets up and goes to the balcony. While gazing out at the planet, he daydreams about taking refuge on Tupile with Chani. Even if they did this, however, his name would remain behind.

Paul looks down at the square, which is packed with religious pilgrims. The pilgrims have come to Dune from all over, believing it to be the source of mysteries, a "place to die." Every time he subjugated a new legion, more pilgrims came. Paul has the impression that the security of his Jihad has shaken the safety of the cosmos; no matter how much he controls the universe, it still eludes him. He feels that Dune is alive, and that it resists him.

Chani takes Paul's hand and leads him to the table, whispering that they should escape to the desert soon. Standing at the table, Paul says that he cannot trust Irulan to mother his heir because of her connection to the Bene Gesserit and her desire for personal power. Paul apologizes to Irulan as he takes his seat.

Lastly, Stilgar says that the Guild requests an embassy on Dune. Korba insists that the Guild would soil Dune's sacred ground. Paul silences Korba and accepts the Guild's request. To Irulan's sudden fright, Paul predicts that the Guild will send a Steersman, Edric. Paul says that he cannot see the Steersman but can see where it comes from and where it is going. Irulan reassures herself that the conspiracy is hidden: Edric and Paul are mutually blind.

## CHAPTER 6

On Dune, Alia looks down from her spyhole at the Guild visitors filing into the reception hall. The Guild's orange and grey robes and Edric's orange gas container cover the beautiful aquatic tiles of the hall. Paul sits on his throne. He's wearing his crown, which depicts fish and fists. Alia senses that Paul is agitated. He is looking at an orange-robed Guild member with metal **eyes**. The Guild member looks familiar to Alia. Paul's memories, which Alia absorbed while in her mother's womb, tell her that this man is Duncan Idaho. Astonished, she realizes this man must be a ghola—revived flesh.

*Those who support Paul bearing an heir believe an heir will establish final peace between separate bloodlines. Producing an heir would give Paul ultimate power: he would unify his Empire, and he would ensure his eternal legacy. However, Paul's desire to be with Chani and to abandon his position of power altogether show that Paul's human nature is stronger than his thirst for power.*



*Paul conceives of his Jihad as something that both brought safety and also disrupted it. Although the pilgrims seek refuge on Dune, they only came to Dune in the first place because the Imperium had overtaken their homelands. With this, Paul understands that every solution to instability and uncertainty only produces more of the same.*



*In his position, Paul is torn in many directions. While he has a responsibility to his subjects, Chani plies him with escaping to the desert. Paul would love to escape but knows that he cannot—a predicament which makes him fraught with unhappiness.*



*Paul's decision to grant the Guild's request is counterintuitive. It seems that Paul would want to keep his enemies far away from his presence. His decision suggests that he is starting to give into his fate as something he cannot control—a decision that could either prove self-destructive, or freeing.*



*The ghola emerges as a force of nostalgia that operates in contrast with the forces of prescience present in Dune Messiah: Hayt is a strong reminder of the past before the oracle that instructed Paul to create the new world. However, Hayt's metal eyes also reveal that he is the robotic creation of the people who revived him. In this way, Hayt contains two potential beings, and it is unclear which one is his true nature.*



The Guild Ambassador and the gholas, who walk like a swordsman, come to a halt before Paul's throne. Paul, who is not looking at the *ghola*, greets Edric. Popping a **melange** pill, Edric offers Paul a gift: the man who looks like Duncan Idaho (the *ghola*). Paul asks Edric to explain his gift. Edric says that the body of Duncan Idaho was sold to the Tleilaxu after he died saving Paul's life, and the Bene Tleilaxu revived him into a man named Hayt. The Guild thought Hayt would please Muad'Dib. Edric says that Hayt is just a name, and as far as the Tleilaxu knows, Hayt is Duncan Idaho. Paul is suspicious of this "Tleilaxu thing" and what the Tleilaxu might have incorporated into its flesh.

Paul addresses Hayt. Hayt smiles and says that Paul's voice is familiar. In her spyhole, Alia trembles at recognizing Duncan Idaho's voice. Hayt explains that he has no memory of his past life, but that many things are familiar to him. Paul wonders what he owes to the flesh of Duncan Idaho. Although the *ghola* is not Duncan Idaho, he is the mind and body that taught Paul how to use a sword. Hayt says that he is here to serve Paul in whatever way he can. Alia feels that the new Duncan Idaho is purified—a blank page on which the Tleilaxu wrote. In this way, the gift is dangerous; the Tleilaxu have been known to create killers of all kinds from human flesh.

Edric says that Hayt's training attempted to improve his swordsmanship. Paul thinks the name Hayt is ominous, and he senses dangers without being able to identify them. He asks whether the *ghola* prefers the name Duncan Idaho or Hayt. The *ghola* says either is fine; he says that he enjoys recognizing signs from his past and knows that Paul admired and trusted the man he used to be. Frustrating Paul with his vagueness, the *ghola* says that his cleansed mind makes decisions without cause and effect. Paul decides to call the *ghola* Hayt. Hayt nods and steps back, and Alia wonders how he knew the conversation was over.

Paul informs Edric that he removed the Reverend Mother Gaius Helen Mohiam from the Guild's plane, and that he will discuss this with Edric later. He dismisses the Guild and tells Hayt to stay. Having accepted the Guild's gift, Paul is regretful; he knows Hayt is some kind of bait. Stilgar tells Paul that Hayt is not the real Duncan Idaho and urges him to send him back. Paul tells Stilgar to guard the Reverend Mother while he sees to Hayt.

*Despite Hayt's resemblance to Duncan Idaho and Edric's insistence that Hayt is fully revived, Paul worries that there is no such thing as a true revival of a dead person. In being a *ghola* whom the Tleilaxu revived, Hayt becomes a "thing" that naturally possesses some of their attributes. Paul cannot answer the question of whether or not Hayt is a machine or his former self—Duncan Idaho—and so the *ghola* is both temptation and a threat.*



*Hayt's potential to become Idaho is a temptation to Paul and makes him feel that he has a responsibility to his old master. In this way, Hayt is as potentially dangerous as he is potentially beneficial: he could either lose his old self entirely and become a pawn of Paul's enemies, or he could resume his role as Paul's trusted friend and ally.*



*The nostalgia that Hayt arouses in Paul complicates Paul's prescience, which senses danger in Hayt. In this way, Paul is caught between two forces outside of his control: the temptation of the past, and the palpable danger in his future. In deciding to call the *ghola* Hayt, Paul decides to obey his prescience and distrust the *ghola* for the time being, thinking of him as a weapon of destruction and not as his old friend.*



*Paul accepts the Guild's gift without really meaning to, against his better judgement. As soon as he accepts, he regrets his decision, knowing that he made it irrationally; he gave into his nostalgia for the past and his curiosity about Hayt's identities. In this way, Paul's human weaknesses make him vulnerable to the danger of his enemies' pawn.*



When Stilgar is gone, Paul asks Hayt why the Guild has sent them. Hayt says that the Guild intends for Hayt to destroy Paul. Hayt's honesty disturbs Paul, and he looks up at Alia's spyhole, wishing he could ask her for advice. Hayt says that if Paul wants to protect himself, he should send Hayt away. When Paul asks how Hayt will destroy him, Hayt asks Paul how he came to hold so much power. Paul answers that he gained his power through strong decisions, and Hayt recites a cryptic aphorism about how decisions temper life. Paul tries to figure out how the ghola will destroy him. Hayt insinuates that he will hamper Paul's will with ideas, and then he warns Paul to send him away. Unable to resist the voice of Duncan Idaho, Paul says Hayt will stay.

Paul looks up at Alia's spyhole, and silently urges her to spy on Hayt and discover his secrets. He feels that the ghost of Duncan Idaho is in Hayt's flesh, but he also feels that Hayt is someone else. He wonders why he didn't see Hayt coming and asks Hayt for an explanation. Hayt says that he does not have the power of prescience. Paul wonders if he will have to choose "the terrible way" and the word "disengage" tolls through his mind. From above, Alia feels a magnetic attraction to Hayt and senses that the ghola is a danger to both her and Paul.

## CHAPTER 7

On Dune, Princess Irulan visits the Reverend Mother in her primitive jail cell. The Reverend Mother has predicted that she will die on Dune, but she remains calm. Looking up from the tarot cards she is sorting, she asks Irulan if she sent word to Lady Jessica. Irulan says that she doubts Lady Jessica will defend the Reverend Mother against her son.

When the Guild's plane had arrived earlier that day, a Qizarate member was waiting for the Reverend Mother on the landing strip. Afraid, the Reverend Mother wondered how the Imperium knew she was on the plane. The Qizara reminds her that Muad'Dib threatened to kill her if she came to Dune. The Reverend Mother says that she is not deboarding on Dune and that she is in "free space" on the plane. The Qizara says that Muad'Dib rules everywhere and orders her off the plane. Briefly, the Reverend Mother suspects the Guild of trapping her; she does not want to set foot on Dune—the place where the Bene Gesserit's prized kwisatz haderach betrayed the Bene Gesserit. But the Qizara says it is ordained, so the Reverend Mother obeys.

*Hayt's blunt truth-telling does not persuade Paul to turn him away. This suggests that Hayt is succeeding in doing what the Guild hoped he would do—enlarge Paul's "moral nature." Instead of protecting his position of power, the appearance of Paul's old friend tempts Paul. Acting against his rational judgment, Paul acts emotionally and allows Hayt to stay. This emotional—or "moral"—nature in Paul is self-destructive: it makes him vulnerable, against his better judgement, to his enemies. In this way, Paul's human nature undermines his power.*



*Paul believes that his lack of foresight about Hayt's arrival is either a good or bad sign: either it means that his enemies found a way to work outside of his gaze, or that his future is not as certain and doomed as it often appears to be. Paul alludes to a reserve plan of action that he dreads—a "terrible way"—suggesting that Paul already knows his fate but is choosing to ignore it for the time being.*



*Paul's earlier actions have created a divide in the Bene Gesserit's Reverend Mother Sisterhood. Lady Jessica's loyalty to her son exceeds her loyalty to her political affiliation, showing that ties of family and love are stronger than political ties.*



*The Reverend Mother is told that there is no "free space" under Muad'Dib's rule by a member of the Qizarate. This suggests that the religiosity that the Qizarate have attached to the Muad'Dib makes logical arguments about rules impossible. The Qizarate believe that Muad'Dib's influence is omniscient and incorporeal as a god's would be, and so they believe there is no such thing as "free space" under his rule. In this way, the religion that arose around Muad'Dib entraps people who would otherwise have been free from it.*



In the jail cell, Irulan and the Reverend Mother engage in small talk. Meanwhile, they use hand signals to discuss other matters so the guards can't hear them. Irulan conveys her respect for the Reverend Mother as her former teacher. The Reverend Mother feels privately that Irulan is a "whining shrew." With sign language, the Reverend Mother tells Irulan that her chance to bear Paul's heir is over and that she must try to remove Chani and instigate crossbreeding between Alia and Paul. Irulan worries that she will be blamed for Chani's death; what is more, Chani has started a diet that resists the birth control Irulan administers.

The Reverend Mother despairs that Chani will bear Paul's heir and ruin the purity of the Bene Gesserit line. She instructs Irulan to administer an abortion if Chani becomes pregnant. Irulan asserts her value as a royal princess and agent and warns the Guild not to waste her on this dangerous task. The Reverend Mother restates the seriousness of the mission. Irulan worries that she is being used and asks if it is certain that the *ghola* can destroy Muad'Dib. The Reverend Mother says that the *ghola*'s destruction is as certain as **melange**'s destruction.

Knowing that **melange** is valuable—but also that it extracts the price of addiction and death—Irulan wonders what the deadly price of the *ghola* is. The Reverend Mother restates that it would be best for Irulan to kill Chani. Irulan decides to allow the Guild to "spend her" and show them how much a princess is worth. When Irulan departs, the Reverend Mother returns to her tarot cards, which tell her that the Guild's enemy has unexpected resources for defense. She worries that Irulan will ruin the conspiracy.

## CHAPTER 8

Alia stands in front of the temple built for her, observing the throng of religious pilgrims pitifully miming her and Muad'Dib. Some pilgrims sell tarot cards, and Alia wonders who is bringing this prophetic device to Dune. The pilgrims straggle home. The Fremen pilgrims despise the foreign pilgrims, and there have been occasional murders. The hot wind makes Alia miss the desert. Ever since the *ghola* arrived, she has longed for her past. Before Paul was the Muad'Dib, there was time to enjoy life; there was no need to strain to see the murky future with prescience.

*The Guild has neither a virtuous cause nor unity amongst its members. In private, each of the Guild members looks down on the others. Each member of the Guild has their own aim, and each of their aims is either selfish or extreme, such as the Reverend Mother's desire to kill Chani and crossbreed Alia and Paul to get what she wants. In their internal dissension and its unappetizing goals, the Guild does not seem built to succeed.*



*The Reverend Mother compares the *ghola* to melange—the addictive drug that helps Paul keep the universe dependent on him. This suggests that the *ghola* will have a sedative effect on Paul, tempting him and making him dependent on the *ghola* to the point that disposing of the *ghola* would kill him. It also suggests that the *ghola*'s effect on Paul will be primarily psychological.*



*Irulan thinks of the Guild's strategies in monetary terms. She considers that everything which is used—or "spent"—exact some kind of loss from the spender. If Paul exploits the *ghola* for its value, he will pay a price. On the other hand, Irulan hopes the Guild's exploitation of her will only prove that she is more valuable than anyone else. In these terms, no matter who wins in the Guild-Imperium battle, the winner will suffer some kind of loss.*



*Like Paul, Alia is miserable in her position of power and venerability. She feels guilty that her power has made others homeless and longing, turning them into pilgrims who seek gods—Alia and Paul—who are not actually gods. She also feels intense longing for the past, when everything was simple, and she had no responsibilities. In this way, power is destructive because causes the powerful person to revert to their past instead of instilling them with excitement for the present or the future.*



Alia enters the temple and goes upstairs, avoiding attendants and Qizarate. Once inside her private room, she dismisses the guards Stilgar hired to protect her. She takes off her robe and prepares for a bath. Alia senses that the figure she has seen in her future is nearby; prescience has shown her this figure, but not who it is. Alia descends into the bath. She feels lust—a feeling she knows from the orgies she attended on sietch—toward the mysterious figure.

Suddenly, Alia climbs out of the bath and walks naked into her training room. The room is filled with the Bene Gesserit's instruments for physical and mental training. The Bene Gesserit creed is inscribed on the wall, stating that learning had been tainted by instinct.

Alia walks over to her sword, deciding to clear her mind with activity. Unsheathing the sword, she taps the target, which comes alive and starts resisting and eluding her sword point. Blades lunge at her from the target, and Alia dodges the one real sword. The target moves faster each time Alia beats it, displaying more lights as its speed increases. Alia's naked skin breaks into a sweat. The target flashes eight lights. Alia has never challenged the target at the eighth speed, and she is aware that its real blade could kill her. She moves up through speed nine, ten, and eleven, her feeling of exaltation increasing.

A knife flashes past Alia, striking the target's off button. Alia whirls around in anger. Paul stands in the doorway, looking upset. Alia thinks of covering her nakedness but finds the scene amusing. Paul rebukes Alia's recklessness and privately notes how womanly she looks. Stilgar enters and also chastises Alia's behavior with the target. Alia asks why the target has so many lights if they aren't to use them. Paul says that his trainer once caught him on light ten and punished him. Noting Paul's humiliation at her nudity, Alia storms into her bedroom and puts on her robe. She brushes her hair, feeling a "post-sex" sadness.

Following Alia, Paul explains that Irulan sent him to Alia with knowledge about the enemy. Stilgar stops Paul before he can explain. When Paul asks Stilgar what is wrong, Stilgar asks if Paul is blind. Paul turns back to Alia, feeling suddenly uneasy. Stilgar bursts out that Alia must be married soon. Alia whirls away, her face hot with anger. She sneers at Stilgar, and Stilgar maintains that he speaks out of love for Paul and Alia. Paul reflects on the lasciviousness Alia displayed in fighting the target naked and agrees that they should find Alia a mate.

*Based on the Guild's tentative plans, the figure in Alia's prescience could be Hayt or Paul. In an attempt to "purify" Paul's bloodline, the Guild considers mating Paul and Alia. They also intend Hayt to attract Alia, presumably to make Paul trust Hayt. Alia likely cannot see the figure because the Guild conceals it from her prescience with Etric's prescience.*



*Although the inscription on the wall suggests that lust taints one's training, Alia's lust leads her to the Bene Gesserit training room as if it is part of the Bene Gesserit plan—something that will lead her to accomplish what they envision.*



*Alia's training regimen resembles sexual activity. She breaks into a sweat and moves through the levels of the training program as if toward a sexual climax. Having been created by the Bene Gesserit, the training program reveals either that lust is used toward the end of training one's agility with the sword, or that the Guild's wants to turn Alia into a sexual being prematurely to accomplish their plot against Paul.*



*This scene draws attention to the alternative plan the Guild has concocted for producing their desired heir to Paul's throne: crossbreeding Alia and Paul. Here, Paul finds himself confronted with his own sister's nakedness and with her budding sexuality. As a young girl coming of age, Alia is vulnerable to the Guild's plan to use her as a beguiling tool: either to beguile her brother to produce a "pure" heir to his throne, or to beguile Hayt to secure Paul's trust for him.*



*Paul and Stilgar are clearly worried that Alia—in her vulnerable state of budding sexuality—will make a choice of mate that will remove the Atrides' destiny from Paul's hands. Paul seems to sense that one of these scenarios involves Alia's state being exploited by the Guild to tempt him and likely wants to marry Alia to someone of his choosing to prevent this happening.*



When Alia asks, Paul says that Irulan believes the Guild is trying to capture a sandworm—**melange** carriers—in hopes of starting a melange culture on another planet. Paul says he is troubled that he can't see this other planet, and Alia says the Guild has obviously hidden it with a Steersman. Alia worries about what the Guild has seen that she and Paul have not and thinks of the tarot cards she saw earlier.

Stilgar suggests that the Imperium protect itself with increased patrols. Feeling that Stilgar is thinking with a new narrowness, Alia says that they can't prevent anything forever. Alia says that the Guild will need more than one sandworm. Stilgar remembers that sandworms can only live off Dune sand plankton. Stilgar asks why Paul can't see what the Guild is planning, starting to feel that Alia and Paul's prescience brings them power, but also weaknesses. Alia says that power is limited: the mountains she and Paul can see conceal the distances. Stilgar agrees that there are dangers that lie behind the mountains.

## CHAPTER 9

In Paul's reception room, Edric and Paul are conversing. Edric tries to conceal his heightened claustrophobia from the small room. Using a laser, he points to a map and questions Paul about his father's death. Paul wonders why Edric is opening old wounds. Scytale's laughing eyes make Paul uneasy. Edric states his pleasure that Chani enjoyed the Guild's performance the day before in which Face Dancers replicated her and Paul. Paul asks how Edric can appreciate these gifts from the Guild when the gholas claim he was made to destroy Paul. Edric asks how it is possible for a *ghola* to destroy a god.

Stilgar enters and motions the guards closer to Paul. On Paul's orders, Stilgar reluctantly moves Edric's tank closer to Paul. Edric says that Paul at least "conspires" to be a god and asks if this is something a mortal can do safely. Paul feels that Edric is perceptive, but his prescience tells him there are more dangerous things than becoming a godhead. Paul asks if Edric is questioning his prescience. Edric denies this but says that there are other forces in the universe; if prescience alone existed, it would "annihilate itself." Edric says that prescience can be confused with hallucinations, and Paul takes offense.

*Since prescience is not only a natural power but can be gained through melange, the war for power between the Guild and Paul centers around melange. Because the power of prescience is tied to an object and because no one prescience can override another, prescience results in a power war.*



*Alia's image of the mountains that conceal distances is metaphor for the paradox of Paul's power. Paul's prescience, which reveals the future that lies in the distance, conceals the actual distance to the future. It is not simply that Paul's power is incomplete; instead, Paul's power is flawed because it is too powerful. In this way, power itself is an inherently flawed thing, and this suggests that no person can possess absolute power.*



*The Guild's gifts test Paul's confidence in himself. First, it attempts to flatter Paul and Chani with the performance in which Face Dancers imitate them; then, it gives Paul Hayt and asserts that Paul has nothing to fear as long as he believes in his own invincibility—in himself as a god. Paul's suspicion of the Guild's gifts reveals that he does not think of himself as all-powerful. In fact, he dislikes that he is revered, and he fears his inevitable demise.*



*Edric claims that a mortal can neither become a god nor have complete powers of foresight. When such powers are complete, they "annihilate themselves," suggesting that any kind of complete power is impossible. This paints a picture of the universe in which the universe's multiple forces keep it in motion. Edric's hint that there are other forces besides prescience is on the one hand defeating but could also be a potential salvation for Paul: since his power brings him unhappiness, his powerlessness could save him.*





Sensing tension, Stilgar moves closer to Paul. Paul feels violence in the air. He points out that Edric seems to expect the worst from him. Edric says that people always expect the worst from the powerful. The odor of **melange** coming from Edric's tank makes Paul feel that he is suffocating. Paul accuses Edric of suggesting that the Qizarate are spreading falsehoods about Paul. Edric suggests the Qizarate might be insincere, and Paul points out that this is to say that Paul is insincere. Stilgar grasps his knife under his robe. Edric says that power isolates a person and makes them lose touch with reality.

Stilgar mutters that Paul should execute Edric for accusing him of "holy fraud." Paul tells Stilgar to remain alert. Then Paul asks Edric how he imagines that Paul maintains this fraud through time and space. Edric asks Paul what time means to him and says that governments can hide anything. Paul notes that Edric uses words as a political weapon. Edric replies that religion is also a weapon. Paul realizes that Edric is trying to sow religious doubt in those of the "lower order," like Stilgar. Paul says that religion was thrust upon him but that he won't denounce it because Alia is a goddess; Alia could kill Edric with a glance.

Paul's claim shocks Edric. He tells Paul that he no longer trusts him. Paul cautions Edric against thinking he knows Paul's intentions. Stilgar asks Paul if they are to assassinate Edric; Paul says no. As Scytale pushes Edric's tank toward the door, he tells Paul that he thinks people cling to the Imperium because they feel lonely in infinite space.

When Scytale and Edric are gone, Stilgar remarks that Scytale's comment was odd. Paul dims the lights and goes to the window, watching a gang of workers repairing Alia's temple. Addressing Paul in his sietch name, Stilgar asks why Paul invited Edric over. Paul says that he wanted more data. Stilgar says that some threats are best left on the outside, but Paul fears that thing that will destroy him is on the inside: himself.

Korba comes running into the room, carrying a load of film reels. He peers through the dark and sees Paul and Stilgar. Korba says that he is afraid Paul is honoring his enemy by welcoming Edric. Ignoring his comment, Paul takes the reels he asked Korba to bring and says they are historical documents he wants Stilgar to peruse. Offended, Stilgar says he knows everything about the Imperium. Paul asks if Stilgar knows about Earth's Golden Age. Korba says that, at Paul's request, he also brought a device for scanning for certain data in the histories.

*Edric upsets Paul because he is voicing the things that Paul himself fears. Paul's power doesn't make him feel connected to and in control of the world—instead, it makes him feel more isolated and afraid of the surrounding world. Although offended, Paul does not turn Edric away because he knows that he is right; in this way, Edric gets under Paul's skin and dismantles his power by attacking his self-esteem.*



*Edric and Paul debate as to whether religion is a contrived weapon or based on truth. In claiming that he did not choose religion, Paul claims that religion was forced upon him against his control. As a result, Paul undercuts his personal power, claiming that there are other forces more powerful than him in the universe. In this way, religion is opposed to personal power. For a person to maintain total political power, they must use religion as an artificial weapon.*



*Scytale's statement suggests that religion has no basis in the truth. In this view, Paul manipulates the universe with religion because everyone is afraid and alone. Therefore, Paul's religious power is flawed: it relies on exploitation rather than on Paul's eminence.*



*Paul does not fear external threats. Having vanquished most of the universe, he is no longer vulnerable to attacks. Instead, he fears his own internal stability. This reveals that attaining power does not finally protect a person from danger; rather, it subjects them to their innate human flaws.*



*Paul's concern for Stilgar's historical knowledge reveals that he does not think of himself as all-powerful. He recognizes that he makes mistakes just like the failed leaders who came before him. Although he is prescient, Paul feels the necessity of looking to the past for guidance. This suggests that, in some ways, looking to the past better prepares a person for their fate than does seeing their fate.*



Stilgar protests against this mental work. Paul says that Stilgar needs a sense of balance and suggests he study Genghis Kahn and Hitler. Hitler had, like Paul, marshaled his legions to dominate, but Hitler had only killed 6 million whereas Paul has killed 61 billion. Korba says that Paul's triumph brought thousands of believers into the light. Paul says the believers were brought into darkness; he thinks that no one will surpass the devastation his Jihad caused, and then he laughs, recalling that Hitler once said something similar. Paul says that his legions control more than him. Stilgar starts to feel how much his own hand guides Paul's power.

Korba puts the reels on a table, then he assures Paul that Alia is managing the Guild's reception while Chani watches from a spyhole. Stilgar says that Bannerjee—Chief of Imperium Security—is afraid the Guild will try to infiltrate the Keep. Korba adds to this suspicion by saying that strangers were gathering in the gardens, trampling plants and muttering about taxes. At Paul's request, Korba promises he will have the strangers removed from the garden.

Paul detains Korba, and Stilgar moves deftly so that he can see Paul's face. Paul senses that Stilgar is growing suspicious of his odd behavior. Paul asks Korba if he ever feels like an apostle, and Korba says he has a clean conscience. Paul says mysteriously that Korba will survive all this and notes the understanding in Stilgar's face. He then tells Stilgar and Korba to have Bannerjee banish the strangers in the garden, and to kill all those whom Chani identifies as Sardaukar (ancestors of Shaddam). Stilgar's studying can wait till tomorrow. Paul instructs Stilgar to end the Guild's reception party.

## CHAPTER 10

Alia kneels in the sand, examining the remains of a dead body. Hayt and a few mortuary assistants stand behind her. Paul sent Alia to examine this strange occurrence: a 20-year-old Fremen woman, addicted to semuta music and dead from a Tleilaxu poison. Alia only feels the mysteriousness of the situation and wants to get back in her 'thopter (plane) and fly away. She looks at Hayt, longing to replace a piece of hair falling loose from his stillsuit and wondering if he knows anything about the dead woman. Hayt meets Alia's gaze with his metal **eyes**, and she trembles.

*The fact that Paul has killed more people than Hitler and Genghis Khan—who are among history's most horrific leaders—throws his reign of power into a negative light. This comparison also likens Paul's Jihad to a movement that inflicts violence and oppression in the name of the good. Though the Jihad claimed to bring people into the light of religion, it killed billions of people to do so, and the religion itself is based on a lie. Like the Holocaust, Paul's Jihad is a reign of terror that uses perverse ideals to disguise its motive for power.*



*The strangers' rumors suggest that most people in Paul's universe are unhappy with his regime. Not only has religion displaced many people from their homes and killed others, but Paul's Imperium puts a financial strain on its subjects. In this way, Paul's rule imparts little that is both beneficial and genuine.*



*Korba seems to be answering a question that Paul has not asked him. Korba—as the head of the Qizarate—does indeed seem to be an apostle, spreading the word of the Jihad as far and wide as possible. Korba's response therefore seems to be the kind of defensive response that reveals a person's culpability. Korba is prepared for being accused of being disingenuous, suggesting that he has not been practicing religion wholeheartedly but instead has some kind of ulterior motive.*



*The dead woman in the desert bears all the signs of Otheym's daughter whom Scytale kidnapped a few chapters earlier—she is addicted to semuta music and imbibed with Tleilaxu poison. However, it is unclear why Scytale would have kidnapped Otheym's daughter, killing Otheym, only to end up murdering her and abandoning her in the desert. Scytale seems to have his own plan, separate from the Guild.*



Puzzling again over the dead woman, Alia resents that Paul perpetuates the false notion that she can figure out anything; because of religion, she and Paul aren't considered human. Alia asks Hayt what he thinks. Hayt says that the body is too decayed to be identified. Alia agrees that the body is too decayed for the Tleilaxu to revive it the way they revived Hayt. She asks Hayt to take her back to the city.

When Alia and Hayt are airborne in their 'thopter, Alia remarks that Hayt flies like Duncan Idaho. Alia then asks what Hayt is thinking. When he deflects her question, she says she wants to compare her uneasy reaction to the dead woman to his. Hayt says he wasn't thinking about the dead woman but was registering the emotions he feels when people mention Duncan Idaho; he feels eagerness, uneasiness, and has flashes of memories. However, he is worried that he is not who people believe he is. Alia says that Hayt is Duncan Idaho. Hayt says Duncan Idaho is only his "primary computation." Alia is infuriated that Hayt addresses her familiarly as Alia.

Alia and Hayt fly over the place where Alia's father died. Hayt voices his desire to see this place in hopes of recapturing some of Duncan Idaho's memories. Seeing how strong he desires to know himself, Alia tells Hayt to steer the 'thopter towards the place. As they approach, Alia questions Hayt's loyalty to Paul. She is shocked to see Hayt shed a tear, and she touches his wet cheek. She calls him Duncan twice, and then Hayt explains that he felt a ghost's arm on his shoulders—a friend. Alia radios her attendants, explains her and Hayt's detour, and tells Hayt to head for the city. As Hayt turns the plane, Alia suggests that the arm he felt was her father's.

Alia tells Hayt that she gained Reverend Mother awareness while in her mother's womb and that she knows and remembers her father as her mother did. Hayt says that he asked Paul all about this; as a mentat, he wanted data. Alia looks down at the hidden valleys in the dunes and says they remind her of the human mind with its "concealments." Hayt assumes that Alia is wondering what his mind conceals. Alia accuses him of having no respect for her prescience. Hayt says that he does respect her powers but thinks she's become careless with them. When Alia rebukes his daring, Hayt says that he dares more than the Tleilaxu anticipated.

*This passage reveals more information about how gholas are made. A gholo cannot be revived from any dead flesh, but only from flesh that has just died or has been preserved. In other words, there is an urgency to making a gholo, and the circumstances must be carefully controlled.*



*Hayt is having an identity crisis. Duncan Idaho is his "primary computation," but he does not feel that Duncan Idaho is yet his identity, suggesting a difference between one's computation and one's identity. Hayt teeters on the edge of being two people. One of them is connected to the past and to his "primary computation." The other is a potential new identity divorced from his past identity.*



*Hayt's chances of becoming Duncan Idaho are connected to the power of past events. Only monuments of the past—such as Paul's father's grave—have the power to jolt Hayt into identifying as Duncan Idaho. In this way, Hayt's trustworthiness is contingent on the past rather than the future. While Paul and Alia's powers lead them toward the future and their fate, Hayt's contingent character suggests that the past might be more powerful than the future—and more likely to save Paul than the future is.*



*As a character whose true identity is unknown, Hayt reveals the flawed nature of prescience. Neither Paul or Alia is able to foresee who Hayt really is or which of his two potential identities he will become. In this way, Hayt undermines the power of prescience, but he also occasions a feeling of hope that prescience cannot provide. When their prescience is absolute, Alia and Paul feel doomed; but when something remains hidden from them, they are able to hope that the unexpected will be a pleasant surprise.*



Alia wonders if Hayt is a product of the Tleilaxu's intentions, or if he is more than this. Grasping her knife, she asks Hayt why he was given to her brother. Hayt says that she knows the answer: he is to destroy Paul. Hayt then asserts that the gift of the ghola wasn't necessary because Paul is already destroying himself. Changing subjects rapidly, Alia asks how she is careless with her powers. Then she asks how Paul is destroying himself. Hayt laughs at her lack of reason, and Alia demands that he reason for her.

Hayt says that it is strange that the Fremens gave Paul an "official Panegyrist"—Korba—to surround Paul with flattery and servility and cause everyone to view him as a religious savior. Alia says that Hayt would be killed if others heard what he is saying. She also claims that Paul rules by "the natural law of heaven." Hayt asserts that Alia does not believe this. He says that Alia and Paul were taught to govern and instilled with a thirst for power, but that these things have nothing to do with a natural law. Hayt says that he is a servant of Atreides and speaks the truth. Alia says that Paul has disciples, not servants.

When Hayt addresses her as "child," Alia starts to unsheathe her knife. Hayt says that Alia's new womanhood has disturbed her child's flesh. Feeling frustrated, Alia lets go of her knife and says that Hayt is the most complex creature she's ever met. Hayt says he was made with the freedom to mold himself. When Hayt says he has already told all this to Paul, Alia asks how Hayt is still alive and free. Hayt says that Paul agreed he was destroying himself, and Hayt promised to understand and help him.

Alia demands the exact words of Hayt's exchange with Paul. Hayt lands the 'thopter and then says that he told Paul that enduring oneself is the hardest task of the universe. Alia stutters and then says that that is "bitter nonsense." Hayt says that the highest and lowest of people experience the same problem, and that no one can solve it for anyone else. Alia whirls away and then feels that she has betrayed her feelings. When she asks, Hayt says that he instructed Paul to protect his friends and destroy his enemies; since justice means nothing when there are two sides to every collision, all Paul can do is keep order.

*Hayt's arrival in Paul and Alia's lives creates uncertainty where none existed before. Hayt's assertion that Paul is already destroying himself on his own causes Paul and Alia to question the stability of their powers, therefore destabilizing themselves. On the other hand, the uncertainty that Hayt brings is also positive: it seems to excite Alia, who was becoming bored and hopeless in her static life of power.*



*Hayt makes a distinction between natural law and the thirst for personal power. As a human motivation, the thirst for personal power is not as complete and commanding as the natural laws. In this way, although Paul and Alia have gained an enormous amount of power, they themselves are still subject to the natural laws. As long as their rule is not ordained by "the natural laws of heaven," it will always be imperfect and incomplete.*



*Although Hayt continuously offends both Paul and Alia, neither of them can go through with killing him, even though they are often tempted. Hayt's mysteriousness protects him from their revenge; as well as undermining them, he makes them long for the familiar wisdom of an old friend. Hayt goes against Paul and Alia's better judgement in a simultaneously threatening yet comforting way.*



*Hayt points out that Paul's internal turmoil is both a consequence of power and a consequence of being human. In Hayt's opinion, Paul's power has not elevated him above human concerns. One might think that the greatest threat to a person, especially to a person in power, is external, but Hayt claims that it is rather a person's emotions that most threaten them.*



Alia says Hayt is dangerous because he has mastered his passions. Hayt concurs that he is dangerous, but that this is not why. He grips her chin and kisses her familiarly. Alia touches her lips and accuses Hayt of being presumptuous. Hayt steps out of the 'thopter and Alia follows, saying she will tell Paul everything he said and did. Hayt says that Alia wanted the kiss, and she realizes that he is right. Alia says that Hayt's truthfulness makes him dangerous. Pleased that Alia has returned to sense, Hayt asks about the dead woman in the desert. Alia grabs Hayt's arm and says she keeps thinking about Face Dancers. Hayt says that perhaps no young Fremen woman is missing.

*In his precarious state of identity, Hayt's actions can be seen as either positive or negative. Hayt's kiss could have been motivated by one of his two potential identities. On the one hand, Hayt could be beguiling Alia on the behalf of the Guild, drawing her in to make her vulnerable to an attack. On the other hand, Hayt could have kissed Alia as Duncan Idaho. Therefore, the success or failure of the Guild rests on who Hayt is—and who he will become.*



## CHAPTER 11

On Dune, Paul lies in a **melange**-drugged stupor. In his head, he sees a moon become an oval, then fall. He sits up, terrified. On the outside, his room's windows blaze with daylight, while in his mind the moon falls through night. Paul feels that the image of the falling moon represents lost personal security. Paul's huge dose of melange shows him the terrible way to end the Jihad. His mind tolls the word "disengage." The flowers by the window make him miss Chani. He wonders what she would say if she knew he wanted to die before reaching the end of his power.

*Traditionally a symbol of immortality and eternity, the image of the falling moon in Paul's mind suggests the demise of both these things in his future. In his heightened prescience, Paul's fate comes to him as a symbol: the exact details of his demise are not visible to Paul in the cosmic image of the moon. This illustrates that prescience speaks in a symbolic language—but also that much remains unknown to the seer.*



Paul walks out on the balcony. He ponders the moon and the strange death of the Fremen woman addicted to semuta. He paces the balcony, wondering if the moon offers the hope of escape. Below him, the city bustles. Walking to the other end of the balcony, Paul sees suburbs and Alia's temple, which depicts the moon symbol of the Muad'Dib. Paul hates his city. He once felt that he was the inventor of government, but now he feels that he is on an ancient path from which he can't stray.

*Although the moon signifies the demise of power, Paul also reads it as a sign of his potential for freedom. His city and his position feel like bondage—he feels that they rule him rather than the other way around. In this view, the demise of his power would actually allow Paul to live the life he wants. In other words, freedom is synonymous with defeat to Paul.*



Paul puts his hand over his **eyes**, and the moon in his mind falls. When he looks back at his city, the buildings appear as a "monstrous imperial barbarity." He feels that this is the architecture of a "demented history" and artistry abuts tastelessness. Paul feels the pressure of a "mass-unconscious" rushing at him like an unstoppable tidal wave. The Jihad is a mere "eye-blink" in the larger movement of the tide. Other legends that once seemed eternal died long ago. From inside his Keep, Paul hears the song of the Jihad: a sentimental ballad of a woman left behind on Dune.

*Compared to the enormity of the universe and history in which his reign lasts only briefly, Paul's city appears to him as obscenely enormous. His city, holding a false claim to power and eminence, is cheap and overdone. But Paul sees the universe—which is like a "mass unconsciousness" acting against Paul's conscious will, as authoritative emblems of nature, such as the tidal wave.*



A shadow moves on the balcony. Whirling around to see the ghola, Paul asks if he is Duncan Idaho or Hayt. Hayt says he is whatever Paul prefers. Looking out at the Shield Wall, Paul says that a vision troubles him. Hayt says that when he was created, visions troubled him too. Paul describes his vision of the falling moon. Hayt says Paul is drunk on time and that he is running from death. Fascinated by a familiar mole on Hayt's chin, Paul says that he doesn't want to live in the future he sees. Paul asks where there is substance when the world is made up of events. Hayt says that Paul's prescience gives him delusions of immortality; even Paul's empire must die eventually.

Angered, Paul says he doesn't need powers to know that he will die like others before him. Paul asks if Hayt is destroying him by preventing him from collecting his thoughts, and Hayt asks how one can collect chaos. When Paul asks what Hayt knows of prescience, Hayt says he knows that people fear what they seek. Hayt ventures that Paul fears things that move by themselves, like his own powers. When Paul says Hayt is bad at comforting, Hayt—his face spasming to look just like Duncan Idaho—says he tries. Wondering about Hayt's face spasm, Paul whispers that his moon has a name.

Paul lets the vision of the moon flow over him. His terrifying future involves Chani's absence. Visions of his lover fill his mind and disappear. Paul watches three limping pilgrims in dirty robes hurry into Alia's temple. Paul's persistent vision tells him that people only stir "the waters" briefly, before submitting to Time. He wonders what it means that he doesn't exist but that he occurred.

## CHAPTER 12

The Reverend Mother hobbles along, surrounded by guards. She is answering Paul's summons. She remembers when she tested Paul as the kwisatz haderach and silently curses Lady Jessica for ruining everything. The Reverend Mother feels powerless in her aged body. The guards lead her through vaulted passages. Passersby stare, but she keeps her gaze on the guard in front of her. She laments her personal loss that Paul refuses his Bene Gesserit posterity. She fears the "abominable" Alia—a wild Reverend Mother who wasn't trained by the Bene Gesserit.

Paul's immense citadel reeks "of terrifying physical power." The Reverend Mother senses that the long walk is meant to gradually oppress her by the time she gets to Paul. However, she also senses that Paul wants something from her and isn't planning to simply kill her. The Reverend Mother is glad that she will have the opportunity to bargain.

*Hayt gives another reason for why prescience is a flawed power; because prescience shows a person the future, it leads them to believe that they will live much longer than perhaps they will—that they will live as long as the future extends. In this way, prescience makes a person forget their humanness to a dangerous degree. It makes a person unable to accept their fate and mortality. Without this inability to accept his immortality, Paul would be less afraid of his demise.*



*Counterintuitively, Hayt illustrates Paul's power of prescience as chaos rather than as something which controls chaos. This suggests that Paul's powers—although they are his powers—are just as beyond his control as other forces in the universe. In this way, Paul's powers are not really his powers at all; he has access to the future through them, but they don't make him more powerful, because he still has no control over what he sees.*



*This passage reveals a critical detail: Paul dreads his future because Chani is absent from it. This knowledge makes Paul helpless, unable to enjoy the person whom he loves, knowing that soon she will be gone. When Paul says that he occurred but didn't exist, he is troubling over his immortality.*



*The Reverend Mother's decrepitude increases her feeling of betrayal at Paul's hands. Like an aged and neglected parent, she feels that Paul shows her no gratitude for having raised him and trained him to be the person he is today. She also resents Alia for becoming who she is with the Reverend Mother. The Reverend Mother feels that she is an old woman about whom the world has forgotten.*



*The immensity of Paul's citadel illustrates how Paul's reign of power is oppressive and pushes out all things of the past. The citadel makes the Reverend Mother feel small and weak during her walk through the huge halls, as though the new world has no room for the old.*



The passages become increasingly larger until they come to a huge set of double doors that swing inward, revealing Paul's reception hall. The Reverend Mother is made to hobble a great distance towards Paul's throne—an action which “dwarfs” her before the Muad'Dib. The hall's genius engineering makes Paul seem huge on his emerald throne, which is cut from an emerald to represent life and death. The Reverend Mother counts the minutes it takes her to reach the throne. Stilgar, Alia, Hayt, and several attendants flank Paul, who is also surrounded by a shimmering force field shield. Notably, Chani and Irulan are not present.

The Reverend Mother quips at Paul, and he can tell that she knows he wants something from her. The Reverend Mother asks if it was necessary to make her walk that long way. Paul says it was to make her appreciate his magnanimity. The Reverend Mother asks Paul to name the thing he wants. Alia looks at Paul, reluctant to participate in this bargaining. Calling the Reverend Mother “old woman” as he did in the past, Paul suggests that they go into a private chamber where they can sit and discuss. While Stilgar and Hayt help her to the chamber, the Reverend Mother wonders whether to trust or fear Paul.

In his chamber, Paul seats The Reverend Mother and offers her water. Paul says that he wants to bargain for the life of Chani. When the Reverend Mother asks, Paul says he merely suspects that she has designs against Chani. The Reverend Mother fears Hayt, even though he is with the conspiracy. Paul says that, in return for Chani's life, he will give the Guild his sperm so they can impregnate Irulan artificially on their planet. Hayt smiles and Alia studies him. The Reverend Mother asks who will bear Paul's heir, and he says that Chani is two days pregnant.

The Reverend Mother is appalled at Paul's suggestion that he breed his valuable genes in the manner of animals. If Irulan had Paul's child by artificial insemination, the Bene Gesserit could never claim its right to the throne because everyone would disapprove of its birth. The Reverend Mother looks around the room, wondering what to do. Alia asks what is hidden in the offer. The Reverend Mother doesn't look at Alia, but she respects her Reverend Mother wisdom. Hayt insinuates that artificial insemination could lead the Bene Gesserit to the abominable Tleilaxu method of genetic mutation, and the Reverend Mother shudders.

*Not only does Paul rule through laws and values, but he also rules through fear and oppression. The Reverend Mother feels increasingly powerless as she approaches Paul's enormous throne, revealing Paul's intention to slowly wear away at her self-confidence in order put more control of their meeting into his own hands. In this way, Paul's power is not wholly just and honest; it relies on his ability to make others afraid of and dependent upon him.*



*In the same way that Hayt's ambiguous identity keeps Paul in his thrall, Paul intentionally makes his behavior ambiguous make the Reverend Mother doubt his trustworthiness. First, he oppresses and embarrasses her by making her walk to his grand throne. Then, he promises that he will be forgiving. He also addresses her as he used to in the past, further confusing her as to whether he is the old Paul she knows and trusts or a new Paul who will deceive her.*



*Paul's willingness to give the Guild his sperm reveals that he does not care about the Reverend Mother's politics of breeding. Rather, he is concerned with preserving the genuine relationship he has with Chani by allowing only her to bear his heir. In this way, true love and family obligations motivate Paul—not the desire for a purebred lineage.*



*In essence, the Reverend Mother's wish for a union between Paul and Irulan is artificial; she asks them to bear a child together even though they are not in love. Therefore, her shock at Paul's willingness to artificially inseminate Irulan is somewhat hypocritical. On the one hand, the Reverend Mother is old-fashioned and natural, not approving of artificial breeding; on the other hand, her obsession with pure breeding leads her to seek out similarly inhuman solutions.*



Alia wonders aloud what will happen if the Atreides genes are “set adrift in the Bene Gesserit river.” The Reverend Mother feels a moment of communion with Alia and wonders, just as she wonders what lies behind the “Tleilaxu thing” (the ghola), what would lie behind the baby made by artificial insemination. Feeling tempted by the idea of controlled genetic mutation, the Reverend Mother recognizes that her pitfall (and the pitfall of anyone powerful) is vanity. The Reverend Mother knows that the ideal offspring for Paul is lost, but there is one more possibility.

The Reverend Mother says that there are two Atreides. Paul tells her to be careful what she suggests. He reminds her that Irulan was made to be used for the purpose of bearing Paul’s child. When the Reverend Mother asks, Paul confirms that he plans to put Chani’s baby on his throne. The Reverend Mother obtains permission to consult with her council before she makes a decision. Paul says that he and Chani will leave for sietch to have their baby. Alia, feeling that this is the wrong decision, asks Paul if the Tleilaxu have offered him their breeding services. Paul says no and sends Stilgar away with the Reverend Mother.

Alia asks Hayt what he thinks the Tleilaxu will do. Paul realizes that Alia did not understand what The Reverend Mother meant when she insinuated that there are two Atreides. Paul turns to Alia, letting her see the tears on his face. In this moment, Paul feels that Hayt is Duncan Idaho. He wonders if Hayt’s metallic **eyes** have another function besides sight. Alia touches Paul’s tears and tells him not to grieve before it’s time. Paul asks Alia what she means by before.

## CHAPTER 13

Scytale assures Edric that he came in disguise. Edric thinks it is reckless that Scytale believes his chameleon powers hide him from everything. Scytale tells Edric to push Hayt to act faster; Paul already made a bargain with the Bene Gesserit, and Scytale fears he is trying to split up the conspiracy. Edric says that the Tleilaxu made the ghola, so Scytale should know not to push him; Scytale once said to only “aim and release” the ghola. Scytale says that Hayt will act faster if he is asked about his original being. Edric worries that Hayt or Alia will suspect the Guild if he does this. Scytale reminds Edric of his supposed ability to conceal them, but Edric says he is worried about “real spies,” not oracles.

*The comparison between the ghola and a child of artificial insemination suggests that artificially created things may be dangerous. In the same way that Hayt poses a threat because he has two potential identities—his creators and Duncan Idaho—an artificially conceived baby would contain both its original genes and something from its inseminators. This comparison critiques technological advances in human breeding, and also considers its negative consequences.*



*The Reverend Mother’s hint suggests two possibilities. Either she intends Paul and Alia to breed, or to breed Alia with someone else of Bene Gesserit descent. Either way, The Reverend Mother’s obstinance for purity causes her to seek perverse unions that rival the artificiality of the proposed artificial union between Paul and Irulan. As with the paradox of power, the Reverend Mother proposes the inhuman under the guise of the human.*



*Paul’s prescience does not allow him to know what Alia means by “before.” Since he can see all of the future, time is not segmented into the present by an invisible future that lies beyond it. Therefore, Paul cannot experience the emotions of the present or the bliss of the unknown. He cries about the future because the future is already present to him.*



*This conversation reveals that the success of the Guild’s mission is contingent on the development of the ghola’s nature. Hayt’s identity is not static; rather, he teeters between two identities, and it is unclear which is more integral to him, or which he will ultimately become. While Edric feels that Hayt’s destiny is out of his hands, Scytale feels that Hayt can be manipulated like a weapon. These contrary views—that Hayt is an organic being or an applicable formula—contribute to the duality of Hayt’s nature.*





Edric recoils in agitation. Scytale is filled with revulsion for him and reflects on the incompatibility of the members of the conspiracy. Edric wonders how Scytale plans to save himself if everything goes wrong. Scytale says that people say Alia is powerful because she is beauty and pleasure united. Edric says this only enslaves people and causes revolts. Scytale reminds Edric that Alia could marry and bear a child; Edric is not “a creator” and cannot invent the future. Enigmatically, Scytale says that Dune, with its “sand blowing in the night,” is a creator.

Edric feels confined and anxious. Scytale says that the Jihad lays a track in the sand, but every morning, the sand is fresh and ready for new tracks. Edric asserts that the Jihad is finite. Scytale counters that the Jihad used the Muad'Dib: it spread like a contagion of chaos and the Muad'Dib has no antidote. Fearful, Edric asks if Scytale is infected. Scytale says they all are, but then stops himself, realizing that Edric is not smart enough to understand his point.

Edric kicks his webbed feet. Scytale says that the Jihad will explode and scatter bits into the universe. He asserts that the Jihad is not just a religion; there are men at its center who know how to hold personal power. Edric thinks that the Atreides are not unique, and that the Guild can destroy the Jihad's powerful men, but Scytale disagrees. He says that this body has two heads and reminds Edric that Alia will marry. He calls Edric a “toddler” and that to threaten a kwisatz haderach is to enclose oneself in the same threat; they must make the ghola act faster.

## CHAPTER 14

Paul, sweaty from practicing dueling with Hayt, looks out the window and tries to picture Chani at the clinic. She took ill that morning, and now he is waiting for the medics to call. He is also waiting to hear from the Bene Gesserit. Behind Paul, Hayt puts the swords back on a rack. Paul ruminates on how the secret he had kept from Chani saved her life. He wonders if he should feel guilty to preferring her to an heir, and for making her choice for her.

*This conversation suggests that confusing the power of prescience with the power to create is a common misconception. Scytale claims that, even if a person can see the future, this does not give them any power; the future still contains the unforeseen because new things can always be created. While this devalues the power of prescience, it also offers some hope to Paul and the Guild.*



*Scytale's image of desert sand illustrates how history and time function. Even though the Jihad seemed to take over the entire universe, in the grand scheme of things, it made no lasting impression. Like a track in the sand, the Jihad has no existence: it is simply something which occurred—and which other things will follow. Scytale suggests that each new day (the future) is always a blank slate.*



*Edric believes that the Imperium is based on religion; he suggests that, as soon as the proponents of the religion are destroyed, the Guild will triumph. Scytale, on the other hand, believes the Imperium is based on a bloodline, and he foresees that Alia's marriage is the Guild's biggest concern. With this view in mind, Scytale wants the Guild to spur Hayt to act faster, suggesting that Hayt's function has something to do with disrupting the Atreides' lineage.*



*Paul claims that the secret he kept from Chani—presumably that Irulan had been feeding her birth control—saved her life. However, considering that Paul has the power of prescience, it is hard to believe that anything Paul does will alter fate. Paul is in the horrible position of trying but inevitably failing to save a person's life.*



Chani enters, a murderous expression on her face. Paul embraces her. Chani says that Irulan was giving her a contraceptive that is now complicating her pregnancy and threatening to kill her. Paul consoles her, thinking privately that Irulan has in fact prolonged Chani's life. Furious, Chani asks if Paul understands that killing Irulan would be unwise. Paul feels that his prescience has chained him to a future that is slowly killing him. Chani demands to know what Paul has seen. Paul asks her to simply obey him. He reflects that Chani's feistiness hasn't changed since leaving the desert.

Chani says that she does not like that Paul duels with Hayt. Paul says that Hayt is not dangerous, and Chani asks if Paul has foreseen Hayt's innocence. Paul says that Hayt is more than the Tleilaxu had intended: he is Duncan Idaho. When Chani is skeptical, Paul asks Hayt how Paul will die. Hayt responds that Paul will die from money and power. Chani is furious to hear Hayt speak to Paul this way and says that it is sad that a gholia cannot be restored to its original being. Hayt says that nothing can be converted and that there is no going back; everyone carries their past with them.

Paul asks Hayt about his past. Chani notices that this question disturbs Hayt and wonders why Paul probes him. When Chani asks, Hayt says that no gholia has ever been restored to his former being but that he longs for it to happen to him. Hayt says that his flesh is not his original flesh because it has been reborn, and that his shape comes from the imprint of original cells. Chani suggests that the cells might not have been Duncan's, but Paul says no others would hold Duncan's shape so well. Hayt cautions Paul's certainty, saying there are things he does as a *gholia* that he would not do as a man.

Chani stares at Hayt, entranced. Paul goes to the balcony and opens the curtains. He probed Hayt so that Chani could see the "man" in the gholia's flesh. Now, she no longer fears Hayt and even admires him. Chani asks if Duncan Idaho would have forgiven Irulan. She asks why Paul isn't angry at Irulan and says that she does not understand him in this moment. Without intending to, Paul steps away. Chani says that she won't ask what Paul has seen and that she will give him his heir. She says that she is afraid of how fast the fetus is growing. Privately, Paul thinks that the fetus is growing too quickly.

*Before now, it seemed that the threat to Chani's life came from the Guild. At one point, the Reverend Mother even instructed Irulan to kill Chani. Now, however, it seems that the real threat to Chani's life is the pregnancy itself. Because of this, Paul had found himself allowing the schemes of the Guild to persist. In other words, Paul's determination to have his heir with Chani conflicts his desire to save her life.*



*The Tleilaxu built the gholia believing that it could never be fully restored to its original being—that it would be the product of their creation. In Hayt's explanation of being, he does not deny that this is true; he says that there is no going back. However, he also adds that he carries his past with him. In this middle ground view, Hayt contains the being of a real man inside an artificially alive body.*



*Hayt's most human-like quality is not his identification with Duncan Idaho but rather his self-awareness. Although he is both a gholia and a man—he can act both humanly and like a robot fashioned by enemies—he is aware of this fact, aware that he is capable of the inhuman. This awareness, acting beyond his division of identity, reveals that he is a human being—he can recognize wrong and right in his own behavior.*



*Paul has not told Chani that he has seen that she will die. Presumably, he kept this foresight from her because he wanted to protect her from the pain of seeing a fate that one is powerless to alter. Paul detests the clarity of his own vision because it makes him feel chained to a life that he cannot control. Because he himself wishes for blindness, he gives Chani the gift of blindness, allowing her to enjoy the present, unaware of her fate.*



## CHAPTER 15

An epigraph states that Muad'Dib knew where he was bound to go and never stepped off this path; for this reason, all worship him and cannot imagine the other paths his legacy has concealed. Chapter 15 begins with Bannerjee searching a young female messenger, whom Chani identifies as one of her people from the desert. After Bannerjee searches the woman, he escorts her into Paul's room, keeping his hand on his knife. Paul looks up from his desk as they come in. Chani and Stilgar trust Bannerjee unconditionally; Bannerjee would strangle the messenger if he had to.

The messenger, who is wearing a long robe, does not look at Paul. Paul motions for Bannerjee to step aside, and the girl steps forward. When Paul clears his throat, the girl looks up at him with serious eyes, faintly clouded with semuta. Paul greets the girl. This is the "ultimate test" for the girl (who is Scytale in the disguise of a girl Paul knew in childhood). Scytale, who has never played such an "exacting" part, introduces herself as Otheym's daughter Lichna. Scytale's disguise fooled Chani, but it doesn't fool Paul; this girl is older than Otheym's daughter should be, and her voice and her robe are too exact.

Paul greets Lichna warmly. Scytale-as-Lichna relaxes and says that she has a message of bad tidings. Paul feels exposed and lost; he can only glimpse the future the Face Dancer brings. If he kills Scytale, the dreaded future will come. Bannerjee moves to look at the girl. Scytale-as-Lichna says that she was told to deliver the message in private. Paul says that Bannerjee is his friend and that all messages will be heard in his presence.

After debating what he should do, Scytale-as-Lichna says that Otheym wants Paul to visit sietch and bring Chani with him; Chani must come so that she can attest that Otheym speaks in the Fremen way. Scytale-as-Lichna says that Otheym will tell Paul about a plot against him. At Bannerjee's questioning, Scytale-as-Lichna explains that the plotters would kill Otheym if he came to Paul. Paul says he will go to Otheym alone because Chani is having problems with her pregnancy. When Scytale-as-Lichna protests that Chani must come, Paul corners Scytale by reminding Scytale-as-Lichna that she is supposedly Chani's friend. Frustration crosses Scytale's face before he can stop it; Paul—like all victims—must have the possibility of escape. However, as a kwisatz haderach, Paul would destroy himself before changing his patterns.

*The epigraph to Chapter 15 points out how Paul's subjects revere him as a god based on the false belief that Paul's path appeared to his subjects as the only path—as Paul's fate and destiny. However, the epigraph clarifies that only Paul's destination was fated—and that the path he chose was his own doing. From this perspective, Paul's reign of power was chosen, not fated.*



*Scytale's emergence as Lichna clarifies several unresolved pieces of the story. Scytale is disguised as the daughter of Otheym—the man he visited and killed in sietch several chapters before. Presumably, after kidnapping Lichna, Scytale killed and abandoned her in the desert (where Hayt and Alia found her) in order to assume her shape. However, it is unclear what Scytale hopes to achieve with this ruse.*



*It seems that Paul has certain signposts committed to memory that mark when a certain fated event is due to occur. In this way, Paul is able to delay his fate by avoiding certain actions, such as giving in and killing Scytale. Thus, though Paul can glimpse the future, he cannot see all the circumstances that surround its events.*



*Presumably, Scytale is trying to convince Paul to bring Chani to sietch so that the Guild can kill her. The Guild is likely eager to dispose of Chani now that she is due to give birth to Paul's heir. Scytale's failure to convince Paul is a reminder that no character in the Dune universe is truly trapped; every person has a possibility for escape. In terms of fate, this suggests that, although each person has an inevitable fate, they may also face unexpected circumstances. Scytale falters when he remembers this, revealing that he made the mistake of thinking that anything in the universe could be inevitable.*



Scytale-as-Lichna says that she was told to stay in Arrakis. Paul says that he will visit Otheym with Stilgar's wife. When Scytale protests, Paul says Lichna's mother can oversee the visit. Paul tells Bannerjee to take Lichna away. When he tells Lichna to tell Bannerjee how to guide Paul to Otheym, she protests that only Paul can know the way. Despite Bannerjee's warning that it is dangerous, Paul decides to go alone. He wonders if he should tell Bannerjee who Lichna is but knows that any deviation from the future he sees will cause violence. He wishes he could will himself out of his vision, but this is impossible.

*In this scene, Paul very carefully follows the future that he has seen. He even mentions that resisting one's fate is dangerous because it results in violence. In this way, foresight is a dangerous power. Not only does it expose the seer to a future that they may dread, but it also uses the threat of violence to lock a person into this future. Prescience is not so much a power that a person has, but rather a power that controls them.*



## CHAPTER 16

One evening around sunset, Paul heads toward the Qizarate offices, wearing a stillsuit and limping to disguise himself. A protective shield surrounds him, and helicopters monitor his movements from above. Looking back, Paul glimpses a movement on his hidden balcony and guesses that Chani is watching the desert. Painfully, Paul remembers their parting: Chani could tell he was upset but incorrectly assumed he was afraid of danger; she didn't know the horrible choice he had to make.

*When Paul goes out into his city, he has to conceal himself in a stillsuit and even alter his movements so that nobody will recognize him. This shows how much his power has alienated Paul from a normal life. Since his city worships him as though he were a god, Paul doesn't dare appear as the mere human that he is.*



Paul enters the Qizarate offices. Bureaucratic signs hang from the walls. Recently, a new kind of "religious civil servant" has been developing, one who is business-oriented and prefers machines and statistics to human beings. Bells ring, signaling the start of an evening rite at Alia's temple. Alia's temple is weatherworn, giving it an ancient, traditional feel. Although Stilgar and Chani disapproved, Paul and his appointed guide had agreed to meet in Alia's temple.

*Religion's manifestation on Dune shows how the spiritual ideals of sacrifice and progress are wrapped up with the hunger for power. Instead of attending to the health of human beings, the Qizarate seeks to advance the productivity and power of the world through technology, suggesting that religion is often a disguise for another motivation.*



As Paul nears the temple, the crowd increases. People bump into him and repeatedly apologize. Ignoring them, Paul thinks about how much has changed since his childhood. He feels that no one action set him on the path he is now on, and he still believes that he could change the fate the path leads him to. The crowd enters the temple and grows silent. A black altar wood stands at the front of the temple, lit by glowing tubes. Black-robed religious servants sing a chant about how Alia protects the people from all dangers. Paul despises the pilgrims' fanaticism but also envies their religious intent.

*Paul feels upsettingly alienated from the people he rules. As their superior, he can see through their religious fanaticism and knows that it is a farce—he knows that he and Alia are not really gods. On the other hand, as a human being like everyone else, he envies the religious passion of the pilgrims and the purpose it gives them. Paul feels that blindness and powerlessness bring a person more happiness than power.*



Feeling a hand on his arm, Paul turns to see a man grasping his knife as if to attack. Paul braces himself, but the man says the word that indicates he is Paul's guide, Rasir. The crowd surges forward, chanting Alia's name and thanking her for light, sustenance, and protection. Paul feels sick, forced to accept that Alia "the child witch" is growing older. Paul feels one with the crowd, but also isolated by a "personal sin." He thinks of the immensity of the universe and wonders how one man can make this immensity "fit" everyone.

Alia enters dressed in a yellow robe and the crowd hushes. Standing with the pilgrims and seeing Alia from their perspective, Paul doesn't recognize his sister. Alia lifts a chalice (that Paul knows it is filled with **melange**) and says that in the beginning they were ignorant of the "Power" that exists in all places. The crowd chants that Power brings them joy and life. Although he knows firsthand the experience that Alia is undergoing, its mysteriousness fascinates him like everyone else. Alia sinks to her knees, and Paul suddenly feels he can see a present that his prescience usually conceals from him; he feels a beautiful rhythm that "no poet or artist" could reproduce.

Alia's amplified voice fills the temple, and Paul feels he is waiting for her to say something to him. Alia says that all things are beginnings, and that within all differences is unity. Paul is disappointed and feels that he didn't hear what he wanted to hear. Everyone else seems restless, too. Alia asks who summons her, and pilgrims start going forward, asking for her help in their personal trials. Alia answers in riddles, saying that nothing is lost, that all things return in different forms, and that ends and beginnings are the same thing.

The pilgrims mutter that Alia is in a "fierce mood." Paul thinks to himself that Alia must know he is here. A pilgrim asks Alia how long Paul will rule. Alia says that the pilgrims are only alive because Paul rides "the worm of chaos" then disappears angrily into the curtains. As the religious servants pick back up their chant, Paul wonders what "track through the future" Alia had seen. Something different happened tonight. Paul moves toward the exit with the crowd, feeling that he has become a "non-being" that moves with a power beyond his control. He thinks he knows what Alia saw.

*Deep down, Paul feels just as isolated as the pilgrims who seek religion to make them feel better. Like them, Paul feels the immensity of the universe. However, his "personal sin," or his presumption that he could control the universe, alienates him from them. Instead of rising him above the crowds, Paul's foolish pursuit of power only isolates him from a crowd with whom he is actually on the same level.*



*Alia's entire performance rests on the melange that fills the chalice. Melange heightens Alia's ability to see the future, and therefore shrouds her in a prophetic state worthy of the pilgrims' worship. Furthermore, the pilgrims are all vitally addicted to melange, and their dependence therefore strengthens their reverence for Alia, since she's the person who can provide them with it. In this light, the sway that Alia holds over everyone is disingenuous, since it's dependent on a manipulative, weaponized drug.*



*The language that Alia uses to bewitch the pilgrims and to assist with their trials is intentionally cryptic and full of riddles. This language tricks the pilgrims into believing that Alia is truly wise; they think she is speaking of matters too lofty and sublime for them to understand. In this way, language also helps promote the fallacy of religion on Dune.*



*This scene reveals that Alia has not yet seen all of the future; tonight, she sees more than she has never seen before. When Paul is leaving her temple, he also seems to experience increased foresight, feeling that he is not moving out of freewill but rather fulfilling fate like a "non-being." Paul and Alia's heightened foresight suggests that Paul's dreaded fate is coming closer and becoming less possible to evade.*



## CHAPTER 17

In the suburbs of sietch, Paul's guide points out Otheim's door, and reminds him to use his sietch name, Usul. The guide walks away, and Paul knows that guards will capture and question him. Paul hesitates before Otheim's door, not wanting to play out his vision. He can smell the odors of the atmosphere; the moisturizing dome over sietch must be poorly sealed, letting precious water evaporate. The residents of sietch must no longer remember what it is like to have no water.

Paul overhears a woman in one of the houses berating her husband for not fixing a leaky roof and reassures himself that some people remember. Suddenly, a childhood memory of rain and a lush world comes back to him. He laments that it is his fault that the world has become an arid place where people solve all problems with power. Paul refocuses on Otheim's door.

Paul knocks on Otheim's door. A dwarf answers and welcomes Paul inside. Paul hesitates; there was no dwarf in his vision. This small difference from his vision gives Paul hope. The dwarf directs Paul to a door, saying that Otheim awaits inside. The dwarf walks away as Paul enters the room. The walls of the room are bare and hung with threadbare tapestries. A shelf holds a row of polished portraits of old Fremen and seascapes. Otheim sits on a cushion inside, a woman standing behind him. Paul wonders where the dwarf—the "difference"—went.

Otheim clears his throat. Paul takes in Otheim's frail appearance and his single working eye. Otheim greets Paul as Usul. The woman behind Otheim mutters that Stilgar would boast of Paul's willingness to answer to his old Fremen name. When she steps into the light, Paul recognizes her as Dhuri—a woman he knew in childhood. She is now very elderly.

Otheim tells Paul about his sickness. He starts to cough, and Dhuri props pillows behind him. Paul says that he will send for doctors, but Dhuri says that Otheim already has the best doctors. Paul wonders how he can exploit the differences he sees between this scene and his vision. However, he knows if he tries to break the pattern, violence will erupt. Paul asks what they want from him, and Dhuri asks if it is wrong for Otheim to want a friend in his final days. Paul is sad that Otheim is ill. Dhuri looks at Otheim with longing, and Paul hopes that Chani never looks at him that way.

*The mention of the moisture-sealing dome above the desert reveals that the relatively fertile climate of sietch is artificial. Furthermore, the fact that the dome is leaking reveals that this solution to the water problem is temporary. Presumably, the threat of aridity increases the more the desert's fertility relies on technology.*



*Paul has solved sietch's water problem with technology, but it exacerbates the water problem in the world at large. This suggests that power harms the people who use it. Paul's nostalgia is for a world in which power has not created more problems than it has solved.*



*At this point, Paul is living out his future vision step by step. Therefore, the unexpected sight of the dwarf is a hopeful sign: perhaps what Paul saw was not his whole fate. The scene of a spare Fremen home suggests that the Jihad has left sietch impoverished—worse off than it was before the war. This shows that the Jihad turned Paul's city into a wealthy kingdom at the expense of smaller communities.*



*Dhuri's comment reveals the native Fremen people's resentment toward Paul. To them, Stilgar is a traitor who wrongly believes that Paul is a loyal friend to the Fremen. In their view, Paul is the person who changed their lives for the worse.*



*Paul's only hope now lies in the human inability to see beyond the present. Whenever Paul experiences something for the first time (when he has not already foreseen it), he is able to live like a normal human being. This future blindness makes him feel hope, not only that he will be able to escape his dreaded fate, but also that he can still live and enjoy the human pleasure of surprise.*



Through coughs, Otheym says that the Fremen who live next door are plotting against Paul. He explains that the dwarf is a Tleilaxu “toy” who knows the names of the conspirators. Dhuri asks Paul to shelter the dwarf as he sheltered Lichna. Paul thinks how the real Lichna is dead in the desert. Dhuri explains that Otheym could not come to Paul himself because then Paul’s foes would know his allegiance. In his vision, Paul knew that he would leave Otheym with the names of his traitors, but he didn’t see the dwarf. He reflects that all people are imprisoned in their destinies, and that Free Will is the vain action of a prisoner rattling his cage. Paul’s curse is that he can see his cage.

Paul feels that he was wrong to hope, but this thought gives him hope. Dhuri calls Bijaz, and the dwarf enters. Dhuri introduces Bijaz to his new master, Usul. Bijaz rattles off riddles and says that he operates the “machine called language.” When Paul asks what his other talents are, Bijaz says he knows the right time for endings—a rare talent. Bijaz points at Paul and says that he is the Muad’Dib but also that he is no more than Bijaz’s pointing finger. Dhuri explains that the Tleilaxu discarded Bijaz because he always prattled like this. Bijaz makes more riddles. Dhuri scolds him, saying it’s time for Paul and Bijaz to go.

Paul asks if Bijaz has prescience. Bijaz replies that he has “now-sense.” Otheym confirms with Dhuri that Lichna is safe, and Paul lowers his face to hide the truth. Otheym tells Paul that he doesn’t like the world that’s developing. Bijaz says there is a fine line between friends and enemies. Trying to delay, Paul asks Bijaz what “now-sense” is. In response, Bijaz tugs Paul’s robe and shouts “now!” Paul asks Bijaz what he fears, and Bijaz says he fears the “spirit seeking him now.” Bijaz twitches nervously.

Paul realizes that Bijaz does have prescience and wonders how much he has seen. Bijaz urges Paul to go, saying delay prolongs the present. Paul thinks how delay defers his guilt. Paul tells Otheym that these are troubled times, but Dhuri says that Fremen know how to endure. Paul feels he can’t bear Otheym and Dhuri’s resentment. Otheym tells Paul to do what he must, ending the vision. Paul and Bijaz leave, Bijaz muttering the word bygones.

*Otheym describes the dwarf the way the novel describes Hayt—as a Tleilaxu pawn whose identity is potentially tied to his creators. Like Hayt, this makes the dwarf a threatening yet tempting character. On the one hand, the dwarf has the name of Paul’s enemies, but on the other, he could be a weapon of destruction. Paul’s description of prescience reaffirms that it is not a power. Instead of empowering the seer, prescience makes the seer distraught and helpless by revealing the cage (fate) to which the seer is already doomed.*



*Like Hayt, Bijaz talks in riddles. Also like Hayt, Bijaz’s statements attempt to disturb Paul’s self-esteem. At this point in the story, Bijaz and Hayt are two mixed identities whose true identity will either displace or save Paul. In both the case of Hayt and Bijaz, Paul had not foreseen their arrival, a fact which makes him suspicious that he is being tricked—but also gives him hope that his prescience has not fully revealed his fate.*



*“Now-sense” is a parody of prescience. Technically, now-sense would be the normal person’s ability to see only the present moment and nothing beyond it. Paul reads Bijaz’s now-sense as fear—perhaps the fear of the unknown of living in the present. This fear of each coming moment is a counterpoint to the way Paul carries out every moment he’s seen in the future like he’s walking a premade track.*



*Otheym and Dhuri represent the majority of Paul’s subjects who are unhappy with his rule. Their resentment adds to Paul’s general feeling of guilt and resentment of his own power. Paul feels not only that he is doing something that most people do not appreciate, but he’s also doing something he himself detests.*



## CHAPTER 18

Paul and Bijaz leave Otheym's, Paul protected by his force-field. Trembling with fear, Bijaz urges Paul to hurry. Suddenly, Stilgar appears from behind a door. Paul, simply enacting his vision of these moments, tells Stilgar about the dwarf, and Stilgar rushes away with Bijaz. Paul gives security guards orders to go to the house next to Otheym's. Helicopters drone overhead.

Suddenly, someone screams "stone burner!" Fulfilling his vision, Paul shields his face with his arm. Otheym's house bursts into flames. People flee, throwing themselves on the ground. Paul knows that none of them can escape the radiation issuing from the fire. People complain that they will go blind, and someone assures them that the Tleilaxu will sell them eyes. Paul—who knows that stone burners can sometimes burn to the cores of planets—tells everyone to stay down and that Stilgar will be back with help. Someone screams that they can't see.

Paul watches buildings crumble into the fire. He feels the reverberations from the stone burner die beneath him and rises to his feet. As he looks around, his **eye** sight fades to black. He recalls his prescient vision of these moments to see what's around him. He tells everyone that help is coming and says that he is the Muad'Dib. Amid everyone's blind confusion, Paul watches Stilgar approach with his prescience.

Stilgar runs up to Paul and looks into his ruined **eyes** with despair. Paul gives orders for the guards to help the people who were closest to the fire. He then touches Stilgar's tears, and assures him that though his body is blind, he still has his prescience; he lives in the "world beyond" and it is now the same as this one. Stilgar says they must hide Paul's blindness, but Paul says not to hide it from anyone. In keeping with Fremen custom, Paul orders none of the people blinded by the fire to be abandoned in the desert; he orders them to be fitted with new eyes.

Paul leaves Stilgar in charge and goes to one of the helicopters, able to see every moment. People exclaim that Paul recognizes them even though his eyes are ruined. In the helicopter, Paul discusses the stone burner with a weapons specialist. The stone burner—which used atomic fuel—would arouse ancient fears. Paul instructs the weapon specialist to discover where the stone burner was made. He then orders another guard to call Chani and tell her he will be with her soon. He can feel fear in the air around him.

*It seems that Paul has foreseen this entire moment, because it does not happen to him; rather he acts it out, stepwise, already knowing how it goes. Therefore, it seems likely that this moment is one of the defining moments of his fate that Paul has dreaded and tried to delay for a long while.*



*The main danger of the stone burner is that it can make a person blind. For most people, this is frightening because they have one kind of sight available to them. For Paul, he had seen and dreaded this moment because of its threat to his human vision, comparably blind to his prescience. Paul fears being confined to his prescience alone—he fears when his life will become only anticipation for the future.*



*Paul no longer has the power to distinguish the present from the future; he now exists entirely within the fate his prescience has shown him, so he has no other option but to live out his dreaded future, unable to see anything except what will happen. In this way, the loss of his human sight is the loss of a kind of freedom.*



*Paul attempts to compromise between Fremen customs and his own mercy. To get around the Fremen order of what to do with the blind, Paul asserts that other kinds of sight—prescience and technological eyes—count. In this modern universe, the various kinds of vision challenge the meaning of "sight." Is sight the usual ability to see only the present, or is it the ability to see what is beyond the present?*



*The destructiveness of the stone burner on an atomic level disrupts the relative peace that has reigned since Paul assumed power. It arouses an "ancient" fear of danger. Having foreseen this moment, Paul goes through the motions of handling the collapse of his safe and trusted Imperium.*





## CHAPTER 19

Seven days later, the uproar at the Keep finally subsides. Up until now, people were muttering about the stone burner, and some of the blinded were refusing Tleilaxu **eyes**. Everyone wonders how the Muad'Dib can see without his eyes. Some people are planning to leave, and Paul had recently taken Korba prisoner.

Chani wakes to find Paul sitting beside her, his empty **eye** sockets staring into the distance. Ravenous, Chani starts eating some food left by the bed. Paul says there was no way he could have spared her. Chani trembles, wondering how Paul can see. Ever since he lost his eyes, he has been speaking in disturbing riddles. Chani gets up from bed, but Paul reaches over and pulls her back in. He kisses her and tells her they will return to sietch soon. He tells her not to fear the mystery of love, because it comes from life. Chani feels Paul's heartbeat with her hand.

Paul says that Chani's child's rule will be even greater than his. Chani says that she wants to live in the moment; she feels they have such little time. Paul says the moment is eternity. Chani's womb stirs, and Paul speaks to "the little ruler of the universe." Chani wonders why Paul addresses her womb in the singular. Didn't he know that she is carrying twins? Chani closes her eyes so as not to see Paul's empty eye sockets and agrees that this moment is forever.

Paul and Chani rise. Chani says she wishes the people knew Paul's ability to love. Paul says that love is too disordered to be a foundation for politics; people prefer despotism. Chani protests that Paul's laws are just. Paul says that laws only filter chaos. Chani finds Paul's moodiness disturbing; lately, she got the sense that internal wars were going on inside him. Chani moves to Paul's side, and he feels her warmth. Paul tries to close off his vision and use only on his present sense of hearing. He is filled with memories of the past as projections of the future. To an oracle, the past and the future become one. His prescience comes flooding back and moves his body for him.

Chani says they should be getting to the council meeting. The perspective shifts to Alia, who stares down from her on a line of guards escorting the imprisoned Korba. Alia stares at Korba and tries to remember him as his past Fremen self—rugged and simple—before he had become a "fop" in opulent silk robes. Korba's Fremen friends from the old days came to watch his trail, all of them now "hedonists" too. These Fremen are uneasy about the fact that the Muad'Dib still seems to be able to see.

*The refusal to accept mechanical eyes suggests a distrust of modern technology. As technological creators, the Tleilaxu often create things (like Hayt) that seem like restorations of the past—but could also be more than this. New Tleilaxu technology hides an ominous potential underneath its advantages.*



*Paul's confinement to his prescience has turned him into something that unsettles Chani. Her unease illustrates how prescience, while seeming like a handy power, really only alienates the seer from the rest of the human world. Possessing an ability that most humans do not possess doesn't make Paul venerable—it makes him strange and untrustworthy.*



*Surprisingly, Paul's prescience left out vital information about Chani's pregnancy. At this point, this fallibility of his prescience seems hopeful. Until now, Paul has felt that he is chained to his wholly bad fate. But the fact that there are elements to the future that he does not know suggests that his fate could be more positive than he has foreseen.*



*Paul has developed a completely cynical view of politics and power. His description suggests that government is not something that improves lives, but rather something that makes people less afraid of the unknown and the chaotic. In other words, government is a temporary medicine for the discomfort of being alive in the universe. Like his subjects, Paul longs for security. He long for blindness—longs to live in the present so he can enjoy life without the knowledge of everything's eventual demise weighing him down.*



*Alia thinks that Korba and the Qizarate are "fops"—vain people who fixate on clothing and appearances to an exaggerated degree—and "hedonists,"—people who love physical pleasure. This suggests that the Qizarate are hypocrites. While pretending to live spiritual lives of selfless worship, they really lead lives of vanity and pleasure. In this way, the religion that emerged with the Jihad is disingenuous.*



Alia picks up a letter that her mother recently sent, refusing to come to Dune for Korba's trial—Lady Jessica acknowledges Paul's eminence but doesn't want to submit herself to a "rabble invasion." Alia touches the letter and feels one with her mother's experience. Alia rereads a part of the letter in which Lady Jessica says that Paul and Alia are producing a "deadly paradox." She writes that government cannot be religious and enforce laws at the same time; laws must eventually replace morality.

Alia leaves her chamber, escorted by guards. Alia enters the grand council chamber and notes that the gallery is filled with Fremen citizens. Stilgar—standing at the front—gives no sign that he notices Alia enter. Korba enters, flanked by guards. Stilgar asks Alia where the Muad'Dib is. Alia says that Paul directed her to attend as a Reverend Mother. The audience rises in protest. Alia silences them, reminding them of the law that Reverend Mother's preside over trials. Alia notes the names of the particularly angry-looking Fremen in the audience. Korba looks at Alia and declares his innocence.

Stilgar reads Korba's charges: conspiring with traitors to destroy the Muad'Dib. Alia thinks this is nonsense. Korba declares his innocence. Alia takes in the gallery full of Fremen who see themselves in Korba and thinks about how much sway they hold. Korba demands to speak to his accuser. Alia suggests that Korba accuses himself. Terror flashes across Korba's face as he realizes that Alia might have the prescient powers to accuse him herself.

Paul enters, Chani beside him, and says that his enemies stole a **melange** worm and took it to another planet. Paul looks at Korba with his empty eye sockets. The crowd mutters about the Fremen law that condemns the blind to exile in the desert. To prove his sight, Paul addresses Fremen by name and makes observations about their clothes. He tells Korba there is guilt on his face. Alia stares hard at Korba. Korba grows uneasy and protests that Paul can't see. Paul says he doesn't need **eyes** to see. As Korba squirms, Alia notices some of the Fremen in the audience starting to doubt Korba's innocence.

*Lady Jessica suggests that government and religion are mutually exclusive. She seems to suggest that religion is something inherently ungovernable, since it's subjective, emotional, and moral. Also, laws are inherently irreligious, since they're universal, rational, and practical. In other words, for Paul's government to be real, the religion that accompanies it must be false.*



*The incrimination of Korba unsettles Fremen loyalty to Paul. As a spiritual people, the Fremen rallied together to support the Jihad to subjugate the rest of the universe because they believed it was spiritually ordained. In other words, the Qizarate represents the compromise between Fremen belief and Paul's rule. Now that Paul is arresting Korba, the Fremen feel that Paul's interest in their religion was a lie—that he exploited their faith for political gain.*



*Korba used his position as a religious leader to conceal his motivation for personal power. Even though his religion feigned being a selfless worship of another, it was flawed, insincere, and just another means for him to achieve power and influence. This view suggests that the desire for personal power motivates all religious movements.*



*As well as incriminating Korba, Paul's apparent blindness further shakes Fremen trust in him. If Paul wanted to secure their loyalty, he would banish himself to the desert. In this way, losing his eyes was more damaging than the losing his prescience would have been. The absence of this human organ makes Paul untrustworthy and alien. In this way, human eyes—although seemingly inferior to prescience—are a far more valuable possession.*



Paul says that Otheym accuses Korba. When Korba protests that Otheym is dead, Paul charges him with bringing in the stone burner. Korba says that the stone burner was to defend the Qizarate and asks again how a dead man can accuse him. Paul says that Otheym told him all the names of the traitors. Paul says that even if he were to release Korba, the blinded Fremen whose **melange** worm was stolen would seek their revenge on him. Korba insists that the blinded will receive Tleilaxu **eyes**. Paul says that Tleilaxu eyes come with bondage and asks how a vicious weapon like a stone burner was merely for defense. Korba demands to face his accuser.

Stilgar says that Korba's request is fair; the law is the law. Alia looks suspiciously at Stilgar, wondering why he defends the law in this case. Korba looks triumphant, like one unjustly accused. Alia feels that they almost cornered the conspiracy, only to let the critical moment slip by. Paul thanks Stilgar for reminding him of the law, then he signals the guards to take Korba to his cell. Paul appoints Stilgar as Korba's questioner, and Stilgar silently assures Paul that he will "wring Korba dry."

The trial ends, and the crowd starts to leave the gallery. Paul thanks Stilgar for playing his part perfectly. At Alia's questioning, Paul explains that adhering to Fremen law and protecting Fremen rights exposed which of the Fremen in the audience are the true traitors. Paul asks Alia for the names of the traitors she noticed in the audience, and she lists them. Stilgar says the Fremen citizens are afraid. Paul asks Stilgar if he is afraid, and Stilgar says yes. Paul assures Stilgar that he will protect him as a friend.

Paul and Chani leave. Alia tells the crowd that she will stand in for Paul to answer their questions. Stilgar asks Alia why she didn't know Paul's purpose. Alia says that Stilgar's dramatic change distracted her. Shocked, Stilgar reflects how drama is a characteristic of the groups that conspire against the Muad'Dib. Alia says she trusts Stilgar, but she senses he will disobey Paul. Before Stilgar can answer, Alia turns to address the crowd.

*Paul likens Tleilaxu eyes to bondage, drawing a similarity between mechanical eyes and prescience. As supernatural forms of sight, both prescience and mechanical eyes have the potential to show the seer things beyond the reach of natural human vision. Paul asserts that this super-humanness is limiting rather than empowering—that it ties the seer to forces beyond their control, like fate or the will of the Tleilaxu; power and advanced technology are surprisingly destructive.*



*Although Paul's superhuman powers show him Korba's betrayal, he flouts human law by not bringing forward Korba's accuser for Korba's human eyes. Therefore, Paul's prescient power does him no good where the law is concerned. Since the laws are for the people, they are built on the terms of human blindness. In this way, Paul's power is always flawed.*



*Paul was careful to maintain Fremen trust during Korba's trial. This suggests that the goal of a leader is to ensure the trust of the majority of their citizens above all else. Without the support and approval of the Fremen, Paul would lose his ability to command them. In this way, Paul resorts to playacting in order to rule his Imperium—something which, although necessary, alienates him from everyone.*



*Alia distrusts Paul and Stilgar's use of drama to control the citizens because it's the kind of disingenuous tactic that enemy plotters employ. The fact that Paul's ruling strategy is similar to that of enemy plotters suggests that even just rulers must sometimes resort to unjust tactics. In this way, power is always flawed: it cannot always be wielded justly.*



## CHAPTER 20

Hayt enters Bijaz's room and introduces himself. Bijaz says that Hayt's name is not Hayt but Duncan Idaho, and that he had seen the Tleilaxu revive the ghola's flesh. Hayt's mouth goes dry. He says that Muad'Dib sent him to question Bijaz about the Tleilaxu's intentions. Bijaz sings that he is Tleilaxu and so is Hayt, and Hayt threatens him. Bijaz says that he and Hayt are both thieves and are here to read each other's "spots." Bijaz says that Duncan Idaho's flesh struggled against being revived and observes Hayt's disturbed excitement.

Hayt demands to know if Bijaz is a weapon aimed at the Muad'Dib. When Bijaz evades his question, Hayt asks if he is a weapon aimed at Alia. Bijaz calls Alia a "virgin-harlot" and says that he came to witness her physical beauty. Hayt says that to attack Alia is to attack Paul. Agreeing, Bijaz says that Paul and Alia are "one person back to back." Hayt says that Bijaz speaks Fremen nonsense. Bijaz calls Hayt a hypocrite. Bijaz says they are in the presence of the most "dangerous creation" the universe has ever seen—a planet Paul's own mother refuses to live on.

Hayt asks why Bijaz won't answer his questions. In riddles, Bijaz says that he has answered. Hayt threatens that he can see through Bijaz's riddles. Bijaz giggles. When Hayt realizes that he is Bijaz's target, Bijaz starts singing. Hayt feels odd pains shoot down his spine. Ancient traditions and memories float toward him. Afraid, he asks Bijaz what he is doing. Bijaz says he is playing Hayt like an instrument. Bijaz lists the names of other Fremen traitors. He says that he and Hayt are like brothers, born in the same tank.

Hayt's metal eyes burn, and a red haze envelops his awareness. In desperation, he forces his focus back on Bijaz. He can see to Bijaz's core: a being manipulated by symbols. Hayt says that Bijaz cannot force him to kill the Muad'Dib. Bijaz says that the universe changes constantly. He says that the "silly Emperor" is not the prize the Tleilaxu seeks; instead, they produce tools, and war is a tool to be exercised.

Hayt accuses Bijaz of stirring violence in him. Bijaz says he is stirring awareness in Duncan Idaho. Hayt says his name is Hayt, but Bijaz says it's not. Hayt says that the past cannot be awakened. Bijaz says anything is possible; eventually, Hayt will submit to Duncan Idaho's mind. Hayt says he is not a Tleilaxu slave, but when Bijaz addresses him as a slave, Hayt goes silent. Bijaz says that one day, Paul will come to Hayt in grief and say "she is gone;" then Hayt will give the Emperor a message from Bijaz.

*Hayt and Bijaz seem to act as each other's foils. As creations of the Tleilaxu, they are both potential pawns the Tleilaxu may use to carry out their scheme. On the other hand, Hayt is also the revived flesh of Duncan Idaho—and therefore potentially his own independent agent. The friction between Bijaz and Hayt calls Hayt's true identity—and what his role in the story will ultimately be—into question.*



*Bijaz's riddles bring out Hayt's loyalty to Paul. After every quip, Hayt rises to Paul's defense, suggesting that, if Hayt does ultimately betray Paul, it will be against his own will. Bijaz reminds Hayt that Alia and Paul are the same person—both capable of carrying on the Atreides lineage—and that Arrakis is a dangerous creation. In this way, Bijaz speaks exclusively of the present nature of things rather than of their future.*



*Bijaz has a mysterious effect on Hayt, as if he has bewitched him. This is reminiscent of the conversation between Edric and Scytale in which Scytale urged Edric to make Hayt "act" faster. In this scene, Bijaz gets under Hayt's skin and stirs ancient memories, arousing Duncan Idaho's nature. In this way, it seems that the Guild's plan for Hayt is to make him become Duncan Idaho.*



*Bijaz makes a distinction between war for the purpose of obtaining something one desires, and war for the sake of itself. While Paul fought the Jihad for the purpose of attaining control over the Imperium, the Tleilaxu (and the Scytale, by extension), desire merely to disrupt. In this way, Paul is battling against chaos, not a specific pursuit.*



*In asserting that he is Hayt, Hayt is attempting to assert his independence. Hayt fears becoming Duncan Idaho because he knows that this is what the Tleilaxu wants, even though he longs to become his past self. However, his conscientiousness about being a mere slave and about trapping the Muad'Dib suggest that he will always be more than a Tleilaxu pawn.*



Bijaz says that Hayt will tell Paul that the Tleilaxu offer to revive Chani as a ghola and give them a planet of their own; in exchange, Paul must renounce his godhead, but Hayt will flatter him by saying that the Tleilaxu are grateful for all he has taught them about religion. When Paul is tempted, Hayt will kill him. Bijaz tells Hayt that Paul, through his mother, is a Harkonnen—a line of people who tortured Duncan Idaho's family. Hayt will not find it difficult to kill a Harkonnen. Hayt says he will not do it, but Bijaz says that Duncan Idaho will.

Bijaz tells Hayt to tell Paul to hurry, or else Chani's flesh will be beyond reviving. Bijaz says that when Paul says, "she is gone," Duncan Idaho will awaken. Hayt tries to find a loophole in the logic. Bijaz claps his hands, and Hayt loses his train of thought.

## CHAPTER 21

Uneasy from his talk with Bijaz, Hayt watches Alia leave her temple, flanked by guards. Alia enters the Keep, walking like someone haunted. Once, Hayt saw her in a white chastity garment and thought she looked at home in the city. Now, she looks fit for the desert. Hiding in the shadows, Hayt steps onto the balcony where Alia now stands. Not knowing Hayt is there, Alia watches a boy with a ball. She just took a huge dose of **melange** in hopes of penetrating the fog that lay over the future. She wants to know what Paul is seeing in his sightlessness.

A shadow moves, and Hayt appears. Alia feels that Hayt is both light and dark, "innocence under siege." She addresses him as Duncan, and Hayt says that Duncan is dead. Alia notices black facets in Hayt's metal eyes. Hayt asks if Alia is ill, and she wonders who is speaking: Duncan, or a Tleilaxu pawn; she feels there is something new and latent in him.

Alia says that she is a Bene Gesserit, and she understands the importance of their breeding program. Her knuckles white from gripping the balcony railing, Alia says that the Bene Gesserit stumbled, and now wish to regain balance by taking a baby from either her or Chani. Hayt asks if Alia is pregnant. Alia whispers that she sees her child and then asks what Hayt sees with his eyes. Hayt says he sees what everyone sees. Feeling intertwined with the vision of time, Alia asks desperately why she can't see the father of her child.

*Hayt's purpose in the Guild's plot is twofold: first, it seems that he was meant to show Paul that gholas really could become their past selves and thereby cause Paul to long for Chani to be revived as a ghola after she has died. Secondly, the Guild relies on Duncan Idaho's ancestral vengeance against Paul to propel him to kill Paul. In both these ways, the Guild's plot is contingent on Hayt's truly becoming Duncan Idaho.*



*The fact that Bijaz controls Hayt's ability to think suggests that the Tleilaxu programmed him to obey the dwarf. Just like Paul in his new state of blindness, Hayt experiences a lack of free will.*



*To Hayt, Alia represents both the modern city and the ancient desert. When she wears a white garment, she is neat and pure and put together. In this scene, she looks wild and emotional, just like the natural state of the planet—the desert. In this picture, the city is the semblance of order that attempts to tame the wild chaotic nature of the state of nature.*



*Just as Hayt perceived Alia as having two natures—pure and wild—Alia now perceives that Hayt has two natures, too. Both characters seem to teeter between two states of being, and realizing which of these states is their true identity seems to hold the story's destiny.*



*Just as Paul didn't see that Chani is carrying twins, Alia cannot see who the father of her future child is. The absence of information about the birth of their children could suggest that the Guild's prescience of the event is blocking Paul's and Alia's visions of their children. On the other hand, it could suggest that love and family create outcomes that prescience cannot show—that a certain hopeful blindness is at play when it comes to the fate of very human affairs.*



Hayt says that the Bene Gesserit wish to mate Alia with Paul for the perfect genetic outcome. Alia wails, suddenly realizing the identity of the dark figure who has been in her dreams. Fearing suddenly for Alia's life, Hayt demands to know how much **melange** she took. Alia looks out at the Shield Wall, watches it crumble in her vision, and then looks at Hayt's face which ages and then becomes young again. Hayt says he will summon a doctor, but Alia insists on having the rest of her vision. Hayt asks what value the future is if she dies, and he pushes her gently inside.

As Hayt lays Alia on her bed, she mutters that there is no cause or effect. She feels that the bed is populated with multiples of her body and that the universe is slipping forward, backward, and sideways. She tells Hayt not to be afraid. Hayt wills that Alia won't die, and Alia thinks to herself that Hayt loves her. A doctor slips a tube down Alia's throat and says they got to her just in time. Hayt insists on staying with Alia, but the doctor says it would be "unseemly." Alia commands Duncan to stay. She snaps at the doctor when he chastens her for consuming too much **melange**, saying she has a right to her visions.

The doctor leaves. Alia turns to Hayt, thinking that he is both danger and salvation. Alia's eyes fill with tears, and she sees Paul standing in the center of time, holding its threads. She wonders if Paul strikes at Time out of hate. Alia cries, saying that she wanted to be able to love and be loved; she didn't want to be part of history. Hayt assures Alia that she is loved. When Alia addresses Duncan, Hayt says not to call him that. Alia asks Duncan if he loves her. He says yes, and that he will do what is required of love and loyalty to her. Alia says that this makes him dangerous.

Alia realizes what she missed in her vision: emotion, grief, and fear lurked behind her vision. She tells Hayt not to let her go, and Hayt urges her to sleep. Alia mutters that Paul is the bait in his own trap, and that he will lose everything; Paul is destroying himself, creating a universe in which he won't permit himself to live, and it is too late. Her vision fades, and she hears the heartbeat of a baby not yet conceived.

*This scene shows how dangerous melange can be. Melange puts Alia in a state of heightened prescience, but it does so at the expense of her life and her happiness. Not only does her vision reveal information that torments her, but the high dose of melange itself is enough to kill her. In this way, the power of prescience is dependent on a dangerous tool that diminishes rather than improves a person's life.*



*Melange is like any addicting, life-threatening drug, and Alia's stomach had to be pumped as with a drug overdose. This scene depicts prescience—the kind that accompanies a melange dose—akin to the hallucinatory effects of a drug rather than a credible source of information.*



*Alia bemoans that her position in life has cost her many human joys and experiences. Namely, she feels that her belonging to history excludes her from the experience of love. The image of Paul standing with the threads of Time in his hands is an image of attempted control that precludes love—an experience of self-sacrifice. In this way, the control of time and power is antagonistic to human experience and happiness.*



*Alia describes Paul's empire as a creation that antagonizes its creator. In this illustration, the person in power is themselves a paradox. In trying to subjugate the universe, they end up trapping themselves. Therefore, an all-powerful person can't exist: they will destroy themselves before they gain total power.*



## CHAPTER 22

Chani stares out at the sietch desert, having recently returned to her old home. She is not wearing a stillsuit, and this makes her feel unprotected in the strong wind. Her stomach constricts painfully, and she knows the birth will be soon. The morning sunlight somehow enhances the feeling of cynicism she has had ever since Paul became blind. Chani wonders why she and Paul came here and why Paul brought so many people with them. When she asked Paul the value of so many companions, he said they had become “money-rich” and “life-poor.” He touched her stomach and lamented that he tried to invent life when it had already been invented.

Remembering this exchange, Chani touches her stomach. The desert wind stirs up “evil odors,” and she regrets asking Paul to bring her here. She wonders what storms Paul sees with his vision; he’s become a madman since going blind. Chani observes the hawks flying overhead and knows that a storm is coming. Hayt calls, warning her of the storm. Chani turns into the sharp wind and feels paralyzed by the desert’s transience. She pictures the desert with its private sounds, and a **melange** worm slithering into dry depths. Although it was only one moment, she feels that the whole planet is being swept away.

Hayt approaches Chani and tells her to hurry or else the wind will tear the flesh from her bones. Trusting him, Chani allows Hayt to escort her into the moisture-sealed building. Inside is a thick smell of **melange**. Chani looks around, trying to believe this place is still her home. A birth pang ripples through her stomach. Chani asks Hayt why Paul is afraid of her giving birth. Hayt says that it is natural for Paul to worry, and that Paul still remembers when Sardaukar killed Chani’s first baby. Chani looks at Hayt, wondering if he is really Duncan Idaho.

Chani realizes that what troubles her about sietch is the odors of the foreign substances the Fremens bring in. Chani says she is scared and asks Hayt where Paul is. Hayt says that Paul is busy with political affairs. Chani thinks about how Paul had steered the ‘thopter with his sightless eyes when they flew to sietch. Another birth pang spasms through Chani. Realizing that she is going into labor, Hayt grasps her and leads her to her room. He lays her down and calls for Harah. Soon, people bustle around Chani.

*In bringing along so many companions to sietch, Paul seems to be trying to undo the consequences of being a powerful ruler. Being a powerful ruler isolated Paul; it provided him with material wealth rather than friendship and family. When Paul says that life has already been invented, it seems that he means that companionship and happiness are already a part of the human experience. By contrast, the wealth and status that power brings are not life.*



*The storm on sietch represents the chaos and impermanence of nature. The desert storm brews no matter how many advancements civilization makes, and it threatens to sweep civilization away in an instant. The oncoming storm suggests that Paul’s seemingly permanent rule will soon come to an end; it is only a human-made semblance of stability in the midst of a universe that is governed instead by nature and chaos.*



*Chani doesn’t recognize her old home because melange has transformed it. The thick smell of melange reveals that the sietch citizens are heavily addicted to the drug—and therefore not living in a natural state. Being dependent on melange holds the citizens back; they become so used to a false existence that the possibility that they could lose it is a threat to their lives.*



*Paul’s absence from this scene is striking. Surely, Paul’s prescience has shown him that Chani is about to go into labor. Therefore, it seems that his absence is intentional; he knows that there is nothing he can do to alter the outcome of Chani’s labor, and so keeps himself away so as not to have to stand by helplessly. Far from preparing him for his fate, Paul’s prescience instead made him dread it more.*



Hayt goes into the hall and ponders over his own actions. He realizes that his panic is centered on the future moment when Paul will come to him to grieve Chani's death. Hayt shudders and tells himself that panic cannot come from nothing. He searches his mind; people have been replaced by shadows, "creatures of possibility." Starting to sweat, Hayt tries to grasp the infinity that courses through his mind. Suddenly, Hayt sees Bijaz in his mind, and realizes that the dwarf rigged him with a "compulsion." A passing guard asks Hayt if he said something, and Hayt says that he has said "everything."

*At this point, Hayt is barely acting of his own free will. He knows that he has been rigged with a "compulsion"—an action that he cannot help but perform. In other words, Hayt has essentially been programmed to act in a certain way to fulfill a certain outcome. When Hayt says that he has said "everything," this suggests that Hayt, in this moment right before his defining action, contains all of the future.*



## CHAPTER 23

Paul stands outside on sietch, his prescience telling him that it is night. To avoid thinking about Chani, he focuses on the remarkable sound of water flowing in the distance, gathered by the storm that morning. An aid comes up to Paul and hands him a clipboard with a paper on it, starting to explain that the paper is a treaty. Paul snaps that he can read it and signs the treaty. The aid runs away. Looking back at the desert, Paul thinks how it is ugly and barren, but rich. The desert requires water and love, he thought.

*To everyone else, Paul appears blind. The fact that Paul claims to still be able to see frightens everyone, particularly the native Fremen whose customs ban the blind from living in civilization. Therefore, Paul's persistence as a member of society upsets the Fremen and shakes their trust and worship of him. To secure their trust, Paul would have to sacrifice himself to the desert.*



Paul wants to shout at the aids behind them that if they want to worship something, they should worship life itself. He knows they won't understand, living in a place where nothing grows. Paul looks up at the stars and thinks how a man must be mad to think he could rule even a part of the infinite universe. He feels that everyone—including himself—lives trapped in rigid beliefs. What has his "creation" come to? When his rule is over, time will spread over the world.

*Paul realizes that nature—not a human being—governs the universe. Gazing out at the desert and the stars—both of which are far vaster than himself—Paul feels the futility of attempting to control it. He imagines that he will be replaced not by another human leader but by Time—an inhuman natural law. Despite his power, Paul feels nothing but his immortality.*



Paul hears scuffling and knows that Hayt has joined him. Hayt warns that it is dangerous for Paul to call him Duncan. Paul says he knows. Hayt explains that the nature of the Tleilaxu "compulsion" is violence. Paul says there will be no violence from Duncan, and then he says that he is dying of prescience. Hayt says that what Paul has seen might not happen. Hayt calls Paul "young master" as Duncan Idaho used to, and Paul asks if this is part of his Tleilaxu training. Hayt says it came from him, and then Paul commands him to free himself from the gholas and become Duncan. Hayt protests that he is not a human.

*Knowing now why the Guild wants him to become Duncan Idaho, Hayt attempts to remain inhuman out of care for Paul. Ironically, however, the care for Paul that makes him resist becoming human is evidence of his humanness. Hayt's conscientiousness reveals that he is in fact Duncan Idaho and not a mere gholas. In this way, his response to the Guild's compulsion will merely match his identity to his already human nature.*



Paul hushes Hayt, hearing someone wailing his tribal name (Usul) across the desert. When Hayt asks what Paul heard, Paul says he's heard the future. Paul tries to remember the sound of Chani's breathing. All he can remember is Chani's irritation that Paul was wearing an old leather jacket the day before they left for the desert. When Paul said that even Emperors have favorite clothing, Chani started to cry.

*Ironically, Paul's recent confinement to his prescience makes him nostalgic. Able to see only the future, he misses the past, when his future was full of possibility. He wears the clothes he used to wear when he was a normal person, revealing how prescience only drives a person to longing for normalcy and the past.*





Paul rubs his cheeks, feeling his own tears. His heart swells. Someone wails again, and Hayt whirls around to see a man fling open the door of the keep. Chani, the man says. Paul finishes the man's sentence: "she is dead." Paul's words burn Hayt's chest and eyes. He feels like a puppet held in someone's hands. His hand raises his knife, but his voice tells Paul to run. Paul says they will do what must be done. Hayt's muscles lock, recognizing the words of Paul's grandfather.

Hayt has the sensation of being both Hayt and Duncan Idaho. Old memories flooded into his brain, and the knowledge that the "young master" needs him drives him to act. Suddenly, the Tleilaxu compulsions fade away and Hayt feels alive. Paul addresses Hayt as Duncan, and Hayt confirms that this is who he is. Paul says that this is the moment Hayt was to become himself, and then he leads Idaho inside.

When Paul and Idaho enter the Keep, an aid says that Lichna is waiting to speak to Paul. Then the aid says that Paul has two children, a boy and a girl. Paul clutches Idaho's arm in disbelief that Chani gave birth to twins. As the aid leads them toward Chani's room, he asks Paul why Hayt is carrying a knife. Paul tells Duncan to put away his knife. In his mind, Paul begs Chani to forgive him, telling her that this was the quickest death for her, and that it was the only way to save their children. They enter a room filled with people. He knows he should be overcome with grief, but his vision didn't go that way.

Paul confirms with someone that Alia has been summoned. The mob moves aside to let him pass, and Paul wishes he could remove all these faces from his vision. Paul desperately wants relief, but he presses forward, fulfilling his vision. Idaho guides him forward until he feels drapes brushing his face. Paul asks for Chani, and Harah's voice guides him.

Harah's voice directs Paul to a cradle holding the babies. Paul reaches inside the cradle, feeling warm breathing ribs. He can't believe there are two when his vision only contained one girl. Harah asks Paul if he is blind now, and Paul knows she is thinking of the Fremen rule that the blind must be abandoned in the desert. Paul asks Harah where Chani is, feeling that he must take a place in the universe that he does not want. Suddenly, Alia's voice calls to Paul, saying urgently that she must speak to him. Paul insists that she wait. Alia says that Chani doesn't have much time, but Paul says that Chani is dead.

*Notably, Hayt feels a burning in his chest and eyes, suggesting that his heart, like his eyes, is mechanical, and that the Tleilaxu compulsion therefore effects these mechanized organs that were created. The burning suggests that Hayt's heart and eyes are transforming from mechanical to real, blood-filled organs as he becomes Duncan Idaho.*



*Up until now, Hayt has corrected whoever called him Duncan Idaho, insisting that his name is Hayt. Here, Hayt asserts that he is Duncan Idaho, indicating that he has fully transformed and is no longer caught between two identities. His transformation has occurred, but it did not result in violence against Paul, as he feared it would.*



*The nature of Paul's regret suggests that he had, in a way, chosen this form of death for Chani. His prescience told him that she was going to die—and there was nothing he could do about it. However, he protected her from death for a time by allowing her instead to get pregnant and live long enough to bear their children. In this way, Paul's prescience allowed him the freedom to choose how his fate would unfold, but this kind of choice makes Paul feel the regret a murderer would feel.*



*Paul has rehearsed every moment of this scene in his prescience so that he moves through it now feeling nothing. His foresight of Chani's death robbed him of the immediate shock and grief of the event, and he moves through his present like a ghost.*



*Paul's surprise that Chani was pregnant with twins leads Harah to ask if Paul is now truly blind. The absence of this vital information about the future suggests that Paul's prescience may be slowly leaving him now. Paul's prescience was an aspect of his position as Emperor, and now that Paul has a son, it is possible that his prescient powers are leaving him as his heir usurps his position of power.*



Paul collects himself and opens his vision on Chani. She lies on a pallet, her white robes arranged to conceal the blood from the birth. Paul turns away, but the vision of Chani moves with him. He wants to cry, but no tears come. The babies' crying pulls Paul out of his vision. He whispers goodbye to Chani.

Alia says that she has brought Lichna. Turning, Paul says that it is not Lichna but Scytale, the Face Dancer. His voice sounding nothing like Lichna's, the disguised Scytale asks if the ghola is Hayt or Duncan Idaho. Paul says he is Duncan Idaho. Paul says he will not bargain with Scytale; Idaho will kill Scytale if Paul commands it. Alia says that Paul doesn't know what he is refusing. Scytale asks Duncan what he knows of his past, and Duncan says he knows everything. Paul is lost in darkness, hoping for a vision. Scytale asks about the babies, and Paul shouts for Harah to remove them. Scytale tells everyone to freeze, threatening to kill both the babies.

Alia groans that this is all her fault. Paul wills that Idaho will not succumb to violence, or else the babies will be killed. Scytale starts bargaining with Paul, offering to revive Chani as a ghola with full memory. Paul realizes why the conspiracy sent him Hayt: to prove to Paul that *gholas* could fully restore to their former selves. Paul asks if Chani would be conditioned to kill her own children. Then he asks Alia to bargain with Scytale on his behalf. Scytale asks Alia what she can offer him in exchange for reviving Chani. He urges her to hurry since Chani's flesh is steadily decaying. He suggests she start by offering Paul's CHOAM holdings.

Suddenly, Paul is filled with vision from the vantage point of his son. He sees himself standing across the room, and Scytale's knife pointing into the cradle inches from Paul's son's face. Paul takes out his knife. Looking through his son's **eyes**, Paul calculates the angle and jabs his knife into Scytale's eye. Scytale hits the wall and falls to the floor, dead. Shocked, Idaho asks if this is part of Paul's vision. Paul shakes his head. Alia asks for Paul to forgive her for being tempted. Paul reminds her that there are some prices that cannot be paid.

*Paul finally focuses on an image that has been in his prescience for a long time now—but that he has not dared to confront directly. In this way, Paul's prescience has tortured him more than it has helped him.*



*Though Hayt's transformation into Duncan Idaho seemed to be the crux of the Guild's plot, the transformation plays out smoothly, bringing no violence to Paul. Therefore, Scytale's entrance comes as a shock, and becomes the new defining moment of conflict between Paul and the Guild. Now that Paul does in fact have an heir, the Guild's target shifts to disposing of this heir instead of disposing Paul or Chani.*



*Scytale appeals to Paul's human longing to get him to give up his power. In sending Hayt, the Guild tried to revive Paul's sentimental memories of the past to surpass his love of power. In this way, the Guild tried to destroy Paul by making him human. Although Paul witnessed Hayt become Duncan Idaho, he knows he became Duncan Idaho because of the Tleilaxu compulsions. Therefore, he is suspicious of the revived Chani and what her compulsions might be.*



*Because Paul didn't foresee that he would have a son, he also failed to foresee the thing that would end up preventing a terrible fate from happening. In this way, the earlier gaps in his prescience were hopeful signs, just as Paul had suspected. In this way, Paul is saved through blindness and the lack of prescience rather than prescience itself, suggesting that power is more of a vulnerability than a strength.*



Paul leans against the wall, amazed that he saw through his son's eyes. He hears his son's voice and feels one with his father and his grandfather. Paul thinks of Alia's precocious awareness in her mother's womb but cannot understand how this happened to his son. Paul feels he is in the cradle, Alia cooing over him. Slowly, Paul disengages from his son's awareness. Paul decides to name his son Leto, after his father, and his daughter Ghanima, meaning "spoil of war." Paul hears the creak of Chani's pallet being moved; the process of taking water from the dead to give to the people is beginning. Paul grips Idaho's arm and asks him to take him to his room.

Bijaz meets Paul and Idaho at Paul's door. Paul tells Idaho to kill Bijaz if he comes any closer. Bijaz says that Scytale's plan is not dead; if Bijaz can find the right trigger, he will access the "compulsion" to kill Paul. Bijaz explains that if Hayt had forgotten that Duncan Idaho considered Paul the son he never had and killed Paul, then Scytale would have bargained with Alia for Paul's revival. Bijaz asks Paul again if he'd like his beloved to be restored.

This time, Paul has a hard time resisting the offer, but he orders Idaho to kill Bijaz before he can succumb to temptation. Idaho obeys. After a silence, Paul tells Idaho that he had no choice; he had tried to change the future before, but only once he'd decided to give in did it surprise him. After saying this, Paul feels the last vestige of prescience fade away. His detached vision floats over the desert like wind.

## CHAPTER 24

Duncan Idaho stands in the desert by a water dike, looking at the four moons reflected in its surface. He listens to the sounds of animals. Recently, an attendant walked Paul into the desert and then returned alone, saying that Paul walked off into the distance, saying "now I am free." Looking out into the desert, Idaho rebukes himself for leaving Paul alone. The Fremen attendants refused to send a search party after Paul, citing the tradition that the blind meet their death in the desert.

Idaho sits down on a rock and repeats Paul's last words out loud. His mind fills with memories of Paul as a little boy. Idaho reflects on what Paul said about the problems in the universe with no solution, and he wonders whether Paul will be killed by a worm or by the heat. Idaho laments that there is nothing he can do to save Paul and wonders if there is a "fastidious courtesy" in dying with no burial.

*Paul feels like both his son and his grandfather, suggesting that his awareness has become a unity of the future and the past. Throughout the story, Paul's prescience has pulled him toward the future—meanwhile, Hayt, Chani, and Paul's longing for the old ways have drawn him to the past. Now that his son and heir has been born, Paul feels like the synthesis of both forces of time. Instead of feeling removed from the present by some hyper-awareness of time, Paul now feels all of time wash over him.*



*Bijaz's explanation reveals that the Guild overlooked how strong Duncan Idaho's care for Paul was. They relied on the thirst for revenge over past strife between Paul and Duncan's families to surpass Duncan's feelings for Paul. In this way, the Guild underestimated the human capacity for love to overcome the thirst for war and power.*



*Paul fully loses his prescience once he fully embraces it. The more he learned to accept prescience and not fight it, the more obscured his future became, until entire invisibility at last prevails. This construes prescience not as a power a person can wield but rather a natural power a person must submit to.*



*Paul feels free only when he decides to die. Up until this point, Paul felt imprisoned both by his position of power and by his prescience; he had to follow a certain path, was isolated from normal life, and knew he had no freedom to alter his fate. Therefore, walking into the desert and abandoning it all is the only way Paul is able to reclaim his freedom.*



*A worm or the heat—natural phenomena—will kill Paul. In this way, Paul returns seamlessly to the ungovernable universe when he dies. He doesn't subject himself to the impermanent laws of humans by letting a human kill him. Instead, he joins the eternal by dying at nature's hands.*



Idaho goes over the Fremen rules in his head. He is angry that a great man is dying while the “self-important” language of government plods on. At this thought, Idaho rebukes himself for retreating into his mind instead of facing his failure to save Paul. Out in the desert, a storm brews—a storm strong enough to cut flesh from bones. Idaho reflects that Paul will become one with the desert. Idaho imagines that Paul will be spoken of in the future in terms of the sea: water subsumed him, but he swam on.

A man clears his throat, and Idaho turns to see Stilgar. Idaho protests to Stilgar that Paul was a Fremen “interloper”: he brought the alien element of water to Sietch. Stilgar says that the Fremen nonetheless welcomed Paul as one of them. Idaho says that Paul will die with honor and won’t give in to the desert. Stilgar says that Paul will nonetheless give his water to the desert in Fremen fashion. Stilgar says that Alia is asking for Idaho. Although Paul had ordered the Reverend Mother not to be killed, Stilgar and Alia had disobeyed him and executed her.

Stilgar says that Alia is in a fit of anger and grief over Paul’s disappearance and needs Idaho’s comfort. Idaho says that he will go to Alia in a moment, and Stilgar leaves. Turning back to the desert, Idaho feels that Paul set a “whirling vortex” in motion that no one could control. The Guild failed, the Qizarate were exposed for Treason, and Paul’s final act solidified the Fremen’s loyalty to him forever.

Alia comes up behind Idaho, wailing that Paul is gone. Idaho rebukes Alia for calling Paul a fool, saying she displays a strange love. Alia says that she loved her brother, and that he should have just “stepped off the track,” taking Chani with him. Alia laments that Paul didn’t escape out of his “love of heaven.” Idaho agrees that Paul’s actions were part of the oracle. Alia repeats that Paul was a fool, and then admits that she is grieving. Alia explains that Irulan is wailing, claiming to have loved Paul and wanting to raise his children. Idaho realizes that Princess Irulan’s behavior is the Guild’s last frail effort.

Alia sobs and leans against Idaho. Idaho kisses Alia’s hair. Alia says that she needs Idaho. Idaho admits that he loves Alia, and Alia says that “love knows love.” Idaho shudders, feeling that he has stepped into an unexpected future. Alia asks Idaho to follow her. They go back toward “the Place of Safety.”

*Idaho laments nobody holds a ceremony or pays much attention to Paul’s passing. This kind of seamless death is exactly what Paul knew would happen to him—the kind of death that happens to every person, no matter how powerful they are. All people are mortal and powerless when compared to the eternal forces that govern the universe, such as nature and time.*



*Idaho is angry that Paul is dying in the Fremen fashion when Paul wasn’t really a Fremen and only pretended to be for political reasons. To Stilgar, however, this death revealed Paul’s genuine loyalty to the Fremen and disproved people who questioned his loyalty. Instead of being the appearance of a godhead to keep all the Fremen under his command, Paul truly honored Fremen customs until the end.*



*Even though the Qizarate was exposed as disingenuous, Paul’s final act was of a religious nature: his death solidified his eternal influence over the Fremen. In this way, while a powerful person’s actions in life may elevate them to the status of a false godhead, only death can truly turn them into an everlasting figure.*



*As a proponent of leading a normal life herself, Alia hates that Paul never gave up his position of power even though he wanted to. Even Paul’s death, although it was a self-sacrifice, was a sacrifice that ensured his legacy’s influence over the universe for the future to come. However, Irulan’s behavior is still a threat to the safety of Paul’s legacy. Parentless, Paul’s children are vulnerable to the Guild’s attempt to raise them and influence them to carry out the Guild’s schemes.*



*Throughout Dune Messiah, Alia bemoaned that her eminent position excluded her from love. Now that Paul has ensured eternal Fremen loyalty and Alia no longer has to posture as the Qizarate’s goddess, she is free to fall in love with Idaho—a person who represents a past which both Paul and Alia were nostalgic for. In this way, although Dune Messiah dealt with political matters, it ends on a human note, suggesting that no other experience—not even that of personal power—exceeds love.*





## HOW TO CITE

To cite this LitChart:

### MLA

Clark, Cora. "Dune Messiah." *LitCharts*. LitCharts LLC, 4 Jan 2023. Web. 5 Jan 2023.

### CHICAGO MANUAL

Clark, Cora. "Dune Messiah." LitCharts LLC, January 4, 2023. Retrieved January 5, 2023. <https://www.litcharts.com/lit/dune-messiah>.

To cite any of the quotes from *Dune Messiah* covered in the Quotes section of this LitChart:

### MLA

Herbert, Frank. *Dune Messiah*. Ace. 2019.

### CHICAGO MANUAL

Herbert, Frank. *Dune Messiah*. New York: Ace. 2019.